

From: [Montoya, Michelle](#)
To: [Buckheit, Lani](#); [Carter, Charles](#); [Cisco, Patti](#); [Crocker, Ashle](#); [Duggan, Vicki](#); [Gallagher, Sue](#); [Hartman, Clare](#); [Holton, Jeffrey](#); [Jones, Jessica](#); [Lyle, Amy](#); [Okrepkie, Jeff](#); [Peterson, Julian](#); [Weeks, Karen](#)
Cc: [Meads, Shari](#); [Cleary, Eileen](#)
Subject: Late Correspondence - Item 8.2 - Public Hearing
Date: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 5:13:00 PM
Attachments: [Late Correspondence as of 7.13.2022.pdf](#)

- PLEASE DO NOT REPLY TO ALL -

Chair Weeks and members of the Planning Commission,

The reason for this email is to provide you with late correspondence for item 8.2, Public Hearing – Zoning Code Text Amendments To Prohibit New Gas Stations and Prohibit Expansion of Fossil Fuel Infrastructure for Existing Stations, scheduled for tomorrow’s meeting. These will also be added to the agenda as an attachments.

Thank you,

Michelle Montoya | PACE | Administrative Secretary

Planning & Economic Development | 100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3 | Santa Rosa, CA 95404

Tel. (707) 543-4645 | mmontoya@srcity.org



From: Eric Fraser
To: [PLANCOM - Planning Commission; Hartman, Clare](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item 8.2 Gas Station Ban Planning Commission 7/14
Date: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 1:49:32 PM

Dear Planning Commission,

Thank you for the opportunity to add to your deliberations regarding service stations.

The RCPA and Resolution 2020-002 calls for a “just transition at scale” from GHG contributing fuels to what are being called “zero emissions vehicles”.

Now, the Planning Commission is being asked to stamp their approval on a plan to ban new service stations. A "just transition" requires a deeper look at this proposal.

Environmental Concerns – Science has proven the damaging impacts of petroleum products, and the government has regulated GHG contributing transportation for decades including requiring pollution control systems in vehicles, smog verification, speed limits, and other aspects of vehicle use and engineering. In addition, Federal and State regulations govern the conveyance of GHG causing fuels from service stations, including the composition of fuels. Laws and regulations also control the exploration, delivery, and refining of petroleum. Even as vehicles get more efficient at eliminating GHG emissions, and zero-emission vehicles replace gasoline fueled vehicles, the demand for gasoline will continue for several more decades.

Of the 44 service stations staff claims are active in Santa Rosa, what are their ages, dispensing volumes, and do they conform with the most current regulations?

While the proposed ordinance does not prohibit “upgrades for safety/environmental reasons”, a ban on new facilities may preempt construction of replacement facilities that may be able to introduce leading edge technologies for dispensing and storage (poor dispensing and storage are major contributors to the environmental problems the ordinance attempts to solve). Therefore, a “ban” combined with anti-upgrade or “expansion” language may (will) have the unintended effect of making current facilities more and more reliant on older technologies, to the detriment of the environment, and decrease the number of service stations.

EID Concerns – Staff reports that service stations historically are located next to Equity Priority Areas (EPA), or more accurately Equity Priority Areas are located next to many service stations. The inference and the research conclusions are that petroleum products are a major health concern for adjacent populations. Should service stations be encouraged to install the latest technologies to mitigate impacts from fuel dispensing and storage? Of course.

EPAs are a subject of concern because of the percentage of low, very low, extremely low, and acutely low-income families in them. Yet, Santa Rosa's population is expected to grow disproportionately in the EPAs, by as much as 30,000 people by 2030. For instance, overcrowded and severely overcrowded housing has already increased over 300% between 2010-2019, according to the 2023-2031 Housing Element Draft.

To truly be of service to low, very low, extremely low, and acutely low-income people, it is important to recognize the economic impacts when deliberating a ban on new service stations (and the leading-edge technology that may come with them).

Are low, very low, extremely low, and acutely low-income families going to be the last folks dependent on fossil fuels for essential transportation? Probably, yes.

A ban may have the unintended impact of making low, very low, extremely low, and acutely low-income families drive further and pay even more in transportation and employment related costs. Even for families in the median income level, their transportation and employment related costs may go up because of fuel costs and the costs of zero emission vehicles.

Instead of a ban, a more effective approach may be to cap the number of service stations to 46 (the 44 existing plus 2 in process) so that new stations would be required to purchase/remove existing and obsolete facilities and be responsible for their mitigation. The market is going to determine if new/replacement service stations are feasible anyway; whereas regulations usually distort this important economic fact.

Governance Issues – Policy created in a political vacuum usually fails to solve the problems targeted and may make them worse due to the unintended consequences of half-baked regulations.

This issue shows at least a 13-year policy discussion timeline and is described as a very high level of importance due to climate change, emergencies locally ascribed to climate change, and policy decisions at the State and regional levels, among other issues. If the ban on service stations is essential in the battle against this emergency, why was there no Urgency Ordinance proposed to ban new service station permit applications during this period?

Clearly, there is enough time to get more information to make a more reasoned ordinance.

Our fear is that the need for responsible planning is mixed up with a political imperative and the need for virtue signaling.

When we see this type of behavior in government, it usually signals that “rent-seeking”

activities are occurring. “Rent-seeking” is when government employees, politicians, nonprofit and for-profit organizations use government resources for personal enrichment (including votes) but return no value to the government (or the governed).

Thank you for considering our comments.

Eric Fraser

TRUTH IN TOURISM

truthintourism@gmail.com

From: elaine.wellin@sonoma.edu
To: [Weeks, Karen](#); [Peterson, Julian](#); [Cisco, Patti](#); [Holton, Jeffrey](#); [Duggan, Vicki](#); [Carter, Charles](#); [_PLANCOM - Planning Commission](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] File # 22-130PC - No New Gas Stations
Date: Tuesday, July 12, 2022 5:58:39 PM

Like other forward thinking cities, you are considering the prohibition of all new gas stations. We need this ban.

Our climate crises are caused predominantly by burning fossil fuels. More gas stations are obviously not the answer.

And especially large corporate-owned gas stations are driving existing small stations out of business. You can stop the growth of fossil fuels industries and protect small business by saying NO to new gas stations.

Thank you,
Elaine Wellin
Santa Rosa, CA 9505

From: [Meads, Shari](#)
To: [Montoya, Michelle](#)
Subject: 7.14.2022 PC Public Comment - Gas Station Ban
Date: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 11:51:50 AM

Shari Meads (she/her) | Senior Planner
Planning & Economic Development | 100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3 | Santa Rosa, CA 95404
Tel. (707) 543-4665 | Fax (707) 543-3269 |
smeads@srcity.org

Due to increased demand, limited resources, and time constraints, delays are expected in the City's permit processing. The Planning Division anticipates returning to standard processing and response times by Fall 2022. Thank you for your patience and understanding as City operations are reestablished following the coronavirus pandemic.

-----Original Message-----

From: Kevin Conway <kevy2kev@icloud.com>
Sent: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 8:45 AM
To: Meads, Shari <SMeads@srcity.org>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Ordinance prohibiting the construction of new gas stations

Dear Shari,

Please notify the planning commission that I strongly support an ordinance to prohibit the construction of new gas stations and the expansion of infrastructure at existing gas stations.

I am saddened by the fact that it has taken so long to move on this ordinance. It is as though our city has its head in the sand about how serious and pervasive the climate crisis is.

It is essential that this and any other future policies, programs, ordinances, etc. related to addressing the climate crisis be fast tracked through the cumbersome governmental process. Business as usual is not adequate.

Thank you,

Kevin Conway
130 Walnut Ct
Santa Rosa, CA 95404

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Meads, Shari](#)
To: [Montoya, Michelle](#)
Subject: FW: [EXTERNAL] Letter of Support - 7/14 Planning Commission Agenda Item 8.2 - Coalition Opposing New Gas Stations
Date: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 11:54:40 AM
Attachments: [LoS to SR Planning Commission for 7-14-22.pdf](#)

Here is another one. Please let me know if the attachment does not come through with the forward!
Thank you!

Shari Meads (she/her) | Senior Planner

Planning & Economic Development | 100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3 | Santa Rosa, CA 95404
Tel. (707) 543-4665 | Fax (707) 543-3269 |
smeads@srcity.org



Due to increased demand, limited resources, and time constraints, delays are expected in the City's permit processing. The Planning Division anticipates returning to standard processing and response times by Fall 2022. Thank you for your patience and understanding as City operations are reestablished following the coronavirus pandemic.

From: CONGAS <congas.contact@gmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 8:03 AM
To: Meads, Shari <SMeads@srcity.org>
Cc: Rogers, Chris <CRogers@srcity.org>; Rogers, Natalie <NRogers@srcity.org>; MacDonald, Dianna <dmacdonald@srcity.org>; Jenny Blaker <jennyb01@wllw.net>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Letter of Support - 7/14 Planning Commission Agenda Item 8.2 - Coalition Opposing New Gas Stations

Good Morning Ms. Meads,
Please share the attached letter from CONGAS with the Planning Commission members and include it in the public record for tomorrow's Planning Commission meeting. Let me know if you have any questions.
Thank you,
-Woody Hastings
707-829-3460



To: Santa Rosa Planning Commission
From: The Coalition Opposing New Gas Stations
Date: July 13, 2022

Subject: Planning Commission Agenda item 8.2: Zoning Code Text Amendments – Fossil Fuels

Dear Chair Weeks and Commissioners:

The Coalition Opposing New Gas Stations (CONGAS) is writing to express our whole-hearted support for the Commission to adopt the Resolution before you and to recommend that the City Council approve the Zoning Code Text Amendments outlined in the staff report to prohibit new gas station land uses and expansion of fossil fuel infrastructure for existing gas station land uses in the City of Santa Rosa.

CONGAS, founded in 2019, is a Sonoma County community-based not-for-profit organization with a mission to halt the permitting and construction of new gas stations.

In January 2020 the City of Santa Rosa adopted a [Climate Emergency Declaration](#) that included a “*call for a just transition away from fossil fuels.*” This action before you is in direct alignment with the 2020 Declaration.

The Coalition has met with Council members and staff, and has participated in all of the Climate Action Subcommittee meetings where this issue has been discussed. CONGAS appreciates the work of City staff in bringing forward this Resolution and we urge your unanimous approval.

There are multiple reasons to support a prohibition on new gas stations:

- This is not a symbolic act. There are two active gas station proposals in Santa Rosa. Although this Resolution and proposed zone changes will not affect those pending applications, the fact that there are two in the city shows that the prohibition is needed. In both pending cases there are over ten operating gas stations within a five-mile radius;
- There are already over 40 operating gas stations within Santa Rosa’s city limits, as well as others nearby, with no demonstrable need for more;
- As pointed out in the staff report and Resolution, this action would be consistent with Santa Rosa’s own climate policies as well as those of the Regional Climate Protection Authority and the State of California in response to the climate crisis;
- This is an environmental justice issue, as every drop of gasoline from a gas pump leaves behind it a wake of destruction – from the drilling to the pumping to the transportation by

rail, trucks, and pipelines to processing facilities and refineries – almost always disproportionately impacting indigenous, low income, and communities of color;

- Inevitable leaks and spills pollute surface and groundwater, and soils, impacting human health and wildlife habitats. Sonoma County is riddled with [leaking underground storage tanks](#).

CONGAS enthusiastically supports efforts to improve walking, biking, public transit and infrastructure to support electric vehicle charging at places where people live, work, and spend time such as at shopping centers, cinemas, public buildings, and so on. However, we encourage the Commission to approve the Resolution as is and resist the urge to include any of these kinds of good proactive measures that can more appropriately be addressed in other arenas.

Again, we appreciate the time and effort staff has invested in this matter and we look forward to working collaboratively to achieve our shared objectives – a safe, clean-emission, climate smart future for the City of Santa Rosa.

Sincerely,

Jenny Blaker, Co-coordinator, CONGAS
Woody Hastings, Co-coordinator, CONGAS

cc: Climate Action Subcommittee members

From: [Meads, Shari](#)
To: [Montoya, Michelle](#)
Subject: FW: [EXTERNAL] No new gas stations
Date: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 1:42:03 PM

Shari Meads (she/her) | Senior Planner

Planning & Economic Development | 100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3 | Santa Rosa, CA 95404
Tel. (707) 543-4665 | Fax (707) 543-3269 |
smeads@srcity.org



Due to increased demand, limited resources, and time constraints, delays are expected in the City's permit processing. The Planning Division anticipates returning to standard processing and response times by Fall 2022. Thank you for your patience and understanding as City operations are reestablished following the coronavirus pandemic.

From: Barbara Moulton <bcm19@sonic.net>
Sent: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 1:19 PM
To: Meads, Shari <SMeads@srcity.org>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] No new gas stations

Dear Ms Mead,

Please inform the Planning Commission of my support for a ban on the construction of new gas stations in Santa Rosa.

I support agenda item 8.2, the Resolution to prohibit the construction of new gas stations in Santa Rosa. The need to transition rapidly away from fossil energy has never been greater. And we have plenty of existing gas stations to get us through the transition to clean vehicles. We should not invest in any more toxic fossil infrastructure. It's not necessary, healthy or wise.

Many thanks to you and to the commission for your public service.

Barbara Moulton

Barbara Moulton
684 Benicia Dr #52
Santa Rosa, CA 95409

bcm19@sonic.net
707-321-0064

From: [Meads, Shari](#)
To: [Montoya, Michelle](#)
Subject: FW: [EXTERNAL] Please ban all new gas stations
Date: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 2:05:53 PM

Shari Meads (she/her) | Senior Planner
Planning & Economic Development | 100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3 | Santa Rosa, CA 95404
Tel. (707) 543-4665 | Fax (707) 543-3269 |
smeads@srcity.org

Due to increased demand, limited resources, and time constraints, delays are expected in the City's permit processing. The Planning Division anticipates returning to standard processing and response times by Fall 2022. Thank you for your patience and understanding as City operations are reestablished following the coronavirus pandemic.

-----Original Message-----

From: Veronica "Roni" Jacobi <vjacobi@sonic.net>
Sent: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 1:51 PM
To: Meads, Shari <SMeads@srcity.org>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Please ban all new gas stations

Please ban all new gas stations.

--

Thanks, Roni

From: [Meads, Shari](#)
To: [Montoya, Michelle](#)
Subject: FW: [EXTERNAL] Resolution to prohibit the construction of new gas stations in Santa Rosa
Date: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 1:41:51 PM

Shari Meads (she/her) | Senior Planner

Planning & Economic Development | 100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3 | Santa Rosa, CA 95404
Tel. (707) 543-4665 | Fax (707) 543-3269 |
smeads@srcity.org



Due to increased demand, limited resources, and time constraints, delays are expected in the City's permit processing. The Planning Division anticipates returning to standard processing and response times by Fall 2022. Thank you for your patience and understanding as City operations are reestablished following the coronavirus pandemic.

From: Mark Feldman <happeevegan@gmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 1:24 PM
To: Meads, Shari <SMeads@srcity.org>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Resolution to prohibit the construction of new gas stations in Santa Rosa

I STRONGLY SUPPORT item 8.2, the Resolution to prohibit the construction of new gas stations in Santa Rosa
Mark Feldman 137 Winchester Dr Santa Rosa 95401

From: [Meads, Shari](#)
To: [Hartman, Clare](#); [Montoya, Michelle](#)
Cc: [Nicholson, Amy](#); [Lyle, Amy](#); [Crocker, Ashle](#)
Subject: FW: [EXTERNAL] Santa Rosa, CA - Gas Ordinance Comment Letter (BCE#10838)
Date: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 3:17:20 PM
Attachments: [Santa Rosa, CA - Gas Ordinance Comment Letter \(BCE#10838\).pdf](#)

FYI.

Shari Meads (she/her) | Senior Planner

Planning & Economic Development | 100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3 | Santa Rosa, CA 95404
Tel. (707) 543-4665 | Fax (707) 543-3269 |
smeads@srcity.org



Due to increased demand, limited resources, and time constraints, delays are expected in the City's permit processing. The Planning Division anticipates returning to standard processing and response times by Fall 2022. Thank you for your patience and understanding as City operations are reestablished following the coronavirus pandemic.

From: Sean Anderson <sanderson@barghausen.com>
Sent: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 2:53 PM
To: Meads, Shari <SMeads@srcity.org>
Cc: Murray, Susie <SMurray@srcity.org>; Julianne Anderson <janderson@barghausen.com>; jellingsen@costco.com
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Santa Rosa, CA - Gas Ordinance Comment Letter (BCE#10838)

Shari,

On behalf of Costco Wholesale, attached is a comment letter regarding the new Gas Ordinance for City staff and the Planning Commission's review.

As described in the letter, Costco Wholesale generally supports the City's goals to implement measures to address climate change, including reducing greenhouse gas emissions. However, we respectfully request consideration of modifications to the Ordinance described in the letter, which would allow a business like Costco to maintain the viability of its current operations in the City of Santa Rosa.

Please let us know if you have any questions, or if there are any further instructions for submitting this letter directly to the Planning Commission.

Regards,

Sean Anderson, AICP | Senior Planner
Shareholder

Office: 425-251-6222 | Direct: 425-656-7460 | Mobile: 206-512-5443

Barghausen Consulting Engineers, Inc.

18215 72nd Avenue South, Kent, WA 98032

www.barghausen.com



July 13, 2022

Santa Rosa Planning Commission
City of Santa Rosa
City Hall
100 Santa Rosa Avenue
Santa Rosa, CA 95404

RE: **Public Comment to Public Hearing Item 8.2 - Zoning Code Text Amendments to Prohibit New Gas Stations and Prohibit Expansion of Fossil Fuel Infrastructure for Existing Gas Stations**
Costco Wholesale
1900 Santa Rosa Avenue, Santa Rosa, California 95407

Members of the Planning Commission:

I am writing to express Costco Wholesale's general support of the Zoning Code Text Amendments; however, Costco has significant concerns with the strict language of the Ordinance and its impact on the continued or improved operations of its Santa Rosa Fuel Facility. More importantly, the Ordinance, as currently written, could preclude Costco's ability to maintain the viability of its operations within the Santa Rosa community. Therefore, Costco urges the City to consider modifications to the Ordinance's language as described further herein.

Costco has been actively interested in expanding, relocating, and reconfiguring its Santa Rosa Fueling Facility for the last 15 years in order to improve site circulation and reduce vehicle queues. There has been ongoing coordination with City staff and the surrounding shopping center throughout this time to identify options to modify the existing facility so that it meets the site-specific operational demands. Some of the existing challenges with the site are due to the unique layout and orientation of the facility, which was built in 1997 during the early stages of Costco's fuel program. Since then, Costco's Fueling Facility design has changed significantly due to the ongoing success of the service. The provisions of the Ordinance would significantly restrict Costco's ability to pursue improvements to the existing facility that would reduce queues, vehicle idling, and improve site circulation. This in turn would impact Costco's ability to continue to provide fuel as an essential service to Costco members within the community.

As an established business, Costco has been in operation on the Santa Rosa site since 1986 when the warehouse opened and is an engaged and active member of the Santa Rosa community. This includes supporting a range of charitable causes and disaster relief, in addition to individual local programs related to education, children, and health and human services. More recently, Costco played a critical role in the early months of the COVID 19 response, remaining open as an essential retail business, providing access to critical supplies for individual members and businesses in the community.

Alongside the City, Costco Wholesale is also committed to sustainable practices. Costco's corporate objectives state "operate efficiently and in an environmentally responsible manner." Costco has been a leader in implementing state of the art technology and best safety protocols, and actively works with state environmental agencies to ensure the facilities comply with, and in some instances, exceed industry environmental standards and regulatory requirements. Costco makes every effort to ensure its facilities operate at the highest levels of safety in order to serve a member demand that is expected to remain into the foreseeable future.

While Costco recognizes the importance of the City's initiative to reduce fossil fuel infrastructure and increase the use of electric vehicles to help address the impacts of climate change, the current market for electric vehicles does not create sufficient demand to change the services currently provided to its

members. At this time, there are approximately 270 million registered vehicles in the US, of which only 0.33 percent are electric and last year, of the 17 million vehicles sold, only 1.4 percent were electric. In addition, the average car owner keeps their vehicle for 10 to 12 years. Based on the current market growth for electric vehicles and the forecasted demand, Costco anticipates that gasoline will continue to be a necessary fuel source for personal vehicles for years to come. Accordingly, Costco is prepared to adapt and modify its range of services when market changes shift member needs and demands. Costco has successfully adapted to other market changes in products and if demand for motor vehicle fuel changes, Costco can and will adapt, as necessary.

In an effort to support the City's Climate Action Goals and allow improved operations of existing gas stations, we respectfully request the City consider the following modifications to the ordinance language:

- Provide a footnote to the Zoning Use table that allows membership-based gas stations that sell gasoline only to its members as a conditional use. This provision would support the previous discussion that modifications or additional dispensers at membership-based fueling facilities would reduce vehicle queues and idling and improve site circulation.
- Modify Section 20-61.020.E(1) to allow for the reconstruction of existing gas stations in cases of damage, destruction, or natural disaster.
- Modify Section 20-61.020.E(1)(b) to allow for an existing gas station to be relocated with the same number of dispensers within the same commercial development or area to improve site circulation and/or traffic safety.
- Include a provision that allows for additional dispensers to be installed at an existing gas station with the installation of new electric vehicle chargers at a 1:1 ratio for each new dispenser and with the evaluation of solar infrastructure.

We appreciate the City's interest and goal to reduce GHGs and encourage the City to strongly consider the above modifications to the Ordinance to clarify its intent and further progress the City's and Costco's goals of a more sustainable future. Thank you.

Respectfully,



John Ellingsen
Director | Real Estate Development

cc: Mr. Drew Sakuma
Mr. Ben Culver
Mr. Dwight Larsen
Mr. Jackie Frank
Ms. Kim Katz

From: [Meads, Shari](#)
To: [Montoya, Michelle](#)
Subject: FW: [EXTERNAL] smeads@srcity.org
Date: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 3:15:24 PM

Shari Meads (she/her) | Senior Planner

Planning & Economic Development | 100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3 | Santa Rosa, CA 95404
Tel. (707) 543-4665 | Fax (707) 543-3269 |
smeads@srcity.org



Due to increased demand, limited resources, and time constraints, delays are expected in the City's permit processing. The Planning Division anticipates returning to standard processing and response times by Fall 2022. Thank you for your patience and understanding as City operations are reestablished following the coronavirus pandemic.

From: donna bley <dbley@sonic.net>
Sent: Wednesday, July 13, 2022 3:05 PM
To: Meads, Shari <SMeads@srcity.org>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] smeads@srcity.org

Dear Sharie,

I support agenda item 8.2, the Resolution to Prohibit the Construction of new gas stations in Santa Rosa.

Thank you,

Donna Bley

1651 Norte Way

Santa Rosa, CA 95404