From: Bolla, Rhonda

To: <u>City Council Public Comments</u>

Subject: 11/12/24 City Council Agenda Item 17.1

Date: Wednesday, November 20, 2024 10:59:44 AM

Attachments: CC 17.1 111224, Boards.docx

CAB Data 2019 Current Term Employer AppointedByANNOTATED110624.pdf

Gmail - Discrepancies in the CAB member rosters, mismanagement.pdf

From: Greater Cherry Neighborhood Association <greatercherry@gmail.com>

Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2024 3:13 PM

**To:** City Clerk < <a href="mailto:cityclerk@srcity.org">cityCouncilListPublic < <a href="mailto:citycouncil@srcity.org">cityCouncil@srcity.org</a>; CA Office < <a href="mailto:council@srcity.org">council@srcity.org</a>; CMOffice < <a href="mailto:council@srcity.org">council@srcity.org</a>; Fleming, Victoria < <a href="mailto:VFleming@srcity.org">VFleming@srcity.org</a>; Fleming <a href="mailto:vFleming@srcity.org">vFleming@srcity.org</a>; Fleming.

Rogers, Natalie < NRogers@srcity.org>; Rogers, Chris < CRogers@srcity.org>; Stapp, Mark

<<u>MStapp@srcity.org</u>>; Alvarez, Eddie <<u>EAlvarez@srcity.org</u>>; Okrepkie, Jeff <<u>JOkrepkie@srcity.org</u>>;

MacDonald, Dianna < dmacdonald@srcity.org>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] 11/12/24 City Council Agenda Item 17.1

Dear City Council and Staff;

Please find attached our questions about Agenda Item #17.1.

We have also attached an email from 11/6/24 that addresses issues regarding CAB's voting procedures. We need a response on this so we can cease requesting public documents that we believe will reinforce our position as stated in our email, or otherwise fashion a remedy.

We look forward to hearing a robust conversation about CAB, and other boards and commissions at tonight's Council meeting.

Eric Fraser

Date: November 12, 2024

TO: City Council Members, City Manager, City Clerk

FROM: Eric Fraser, truthintourism@gmail.com

RE: 11/12/24 City Council, Agenda Item 17.1, 2Q24 and 2Q23 attendance summaries for Boards and Commissions.

In reviewing the reports attached to Agenda Item 17.1, we discovered some discrepancies and have some questions. We think everybody would agree that these boards and commissions are an important aspect of civic life and demand more transparency.

As you know, we are very interested in the accounting of two boards: CAB and SRTBIA. Attached is an email send 11/6, with a follow-up to the City Clerk 11/7. We are still waiting for a reply. At issue are the voting requirements in CAB, and the quorum needed, given the extensive vacancies.

For the reports attached to Agenda Item 17.1:

Turning to the Attendance Chart, page 7 for the Community Advisory Board:

- 1) The extent of vacancies is not clear, as the date for each resignation is not recorded (as it was for other committees). The information accompanying the 11/6 email has a chart that is more factual.
- 2) "A" for Absent is red in some cases, but black in others. Does a black "A" represent an excused absence (see April and May 2024)?

## For all charts:

- 1) When there is a Vacant seat for any meeting, the line should have a "V" instead of "N/A". Does "N/A" mean that seat is not considered for voting or making quorum?
- 2) Add a description with each board or commission describing the total number of members, how they are selected, length of term, specific quorum, or special voting requirements.

Furthermore, harmonize with SRcity.org and Legistar pages with these reports, or whatever vessel represents factual reporting.

<u>Name</u>	Status	Term	Start date	End date	<u>Employer</u>	Appointing Authority
					University of San Francisco -	
Xavier Nazario	Resigned	2	1-Jan-17	27-Mar-19	Santa Rosa	Ernesto Olivares
Michael P Varela	Resigned	1	10-Jul-18	28-Aug-19		Chris Rogers
Laney Rooks	Resigned	1	12-Mar-19	23-Oct-19	UC Hastings	Victoria Fleming
Lacinda Moore	Other	2	10-Jan-17	4-Feb-20	9	Julie Combs
Miles D Burgin	Resigned	1	1-Mar-19	21-Jul-20	Kivelstadt Cellars	Julie Combs
Jennielynn Holmes	Resigned	2	13-Dec-16	28-Jul-20	Catholic Charities	Jack Tibbetts
Michelle L Escobar-McGarry	Resigned	1	22-Apr-19	6-Nov-20	Center for Well-Being	Ernesto Olivares
Albert D Chaparro	Resigned	2	15-Jan-19	9-Dec-20	Social Advocates For Youth	Victoria Fleming
Cherie Barnett	Term Completed	2	10-Jan-17	31-Dec-20		Chris Rogers
Danielle Divine	Term Completed	1	22-Feb-19	31-Dec-20	Divinecorp	Ernesto Olivares
Leslie A Graves	Term Completed	1	3-Dec-19	31-Dec-20	self	Chris Rogers
Kevin H. Foster	Term Completed	1	19-May-20	31-Dec-20	Meridian Realty	Richard Dowd
	·		,		Retired Superior Court of	
Ms Veronica R Cruz	Term Completed	1	24-Feb-17	27-Jan-21	California, County of Sonoma	Jack Tibbetts
					Specialized Services For Law	
Mary Jacquelynne Ocana	Resigned	1	20-Jan-20	27-Jan-21	- F	Victoria Fleming
					Providence St. Joseph Health and	
Cecile Querubin	Term Completed	2	27-Dec-18	24-Mar-21	Qi Consulting	Tom Schwedhelm
Carley Moore	Resigned	1	19-Feb-19		County of Sonoma	John Sawyer
Chanthavy Sem	Resigned	1	27-Feb-21		Love&Light Soco	Eddie Alvarez
Keith Roberts	Resigned	1	11-Jun-19		Santa Rosa Community Health	John Sawyer
Neith Nobel to	nesigned.		11 00 15	20 .101 22	Community Action Partnership of	John Gan ye.
Mr. Vincent Harper	Other	2	27-Dec-18	29-Nov-21	Sonoma County	Tom Schwedhelm
Mr. Manny C Baldenegro Jr	Resigned	1	1-Feb-21		Self Employed	Jack Tibbetts
Robin M. Bartholow	Resigned	1	13-Oct-21		Sonoma County Farm Bureau	Eddie Alvarez
Damion Square	Term Completed	1	3-Mar-21	22-Sep-22	'	Natalie Rogers
Ms Candice S Richardson	Term Completed	1	8-Mar-21		Federal Government	Natalie Rogers
Jorge Inocencio	Term Completed	1	6-Jan-21	•	keysight technologies	Victoria Fleming
Ms Beth Steffy	Term Completed	1	10-Feb-21	31-Dec-22		Victoria Fleming
Steve Rahmn	Term Completed	1	13-Jul-21		Firebrand Electric	Tom Schwedhelm
Kirstyne Lange	Term Completed	1	12-Jan-22		KAL Consulting, LLC	John Sawyer
Calum Weeks	Term Completed	1	15-Jan-22	31-Dec-22	<u>.</u>	Tom Schwedhelm
Leslie A Graves	Resigned	2	27-Jan-21	10-Jan-23		Chris Rogers
Ms Iris F Harrell	Resigned	1	7-Jun-22	19-Jan-23		Dianna MacDonald - D3
Heidi Klyn Ms	Resigned	1	24-Jan-22	24-Jan-23		Dianna MacDonald - D3
Sarah-Jane Wiseman	Resigned	1	3-Feb-22		Mendocino Forest Products	Eddie Alvarez
Yvonne Sierra	Resigned	1	10-Jan-23	22-Jan-24		Eddie Alvarez
Angelina M Vasquez	Resigned	1	25-Jul-23		Kaiser Permanente	Natalie Rogers
Duane De Witt	Resigned	1	28-Feb-24	19-Jun-24		Eddie Alvarez
Henry Huang	Resigned	1	10-Jan-23		Law Offices of Henry J. Huang	Natalie Rogers
Angelina M Vasquez	Resigned	1	25-Jul-23		Kaiser Permanente	Natalie Rogers
Steve Rahmn	Resigned	1	27-Dec-22		Firebrand Electric	Jeff Okrepkie
Kirstyne Lange	Resigned	2	10-Jan-23		KAL Consulting, LLC	Mark Stapp

					Catholic Charities of the Diocese	
Amy Holter	Resigned	1	10-Jan-23	12-Aug-24	of Santa Rosa	Chris Rogers
Cherie Barnett	Active	3	27-Jan-21	31-Dec-24		Chris Rogers
David Chen	Active	1	24-Jan-23	31-Dec-24	Caitelion LLC	Dianna MacDonald - D3
Ms. Andrea Rodrigeuz	Active	1	14-Feb-23	31-Dec-24	Sonoma Water	Dianna MacDonald - D3
Ana M Diaz	Active	1	1-Jul-24	31-Dec-24		Eddie Alvarez
Miles D Horton	Active	1	23-Jul-24	31-Dec-24	Sonoma Clean Power	Natalie Rogers
Nancy Trejo Vazquez	Active	1	27-Sep-24	31-Dec-24	Burbank Housing	Eddie Alvarez
Vacancy	Active	1	N/A	31-Dec-24		Natalie Rogers
Vacancy	Active	1	N/A	31-Dec-24		Chris Rogers
Calum Weeks	Active	2	27-Dec-22	31-Dec-26	Generation Housing	Jeff Okrepkie
Ariana DV≠az De LeV≥n	Active	1	10-Jan-23	31-Dec-26	Santa Rosa Community Health	Mark Stapp
Jorge Inocencio	Active	2	14-Feb-23	31-Dec-26	keysight technologies	Victoria Fleming
Derek Knowles	Active	1	16-Apr-24	31-Dec-26	Self-Employed/Freelance	Victoria Fleming
Jude Frates	Active	1	20-Aug-24	31-Dec-26	Coldwell Banker Realty	Jeff Okrepkie
Vacancy	Active	1	N/A	31-Dec-26		Mark Stapp

10/30/24 CAB 1:48:27 Chr Weeks "He Stepped Down"

Date: 11/5/2024

Source: https://cityofsantarosaca.nextrequest.com/requests/24-1249
Shading added for emphasis:

More than term

Current Vacancies Current Seats



Eric Fraser <truthintourism@gmail.com>

## Discrepancies in the CAB member rosters, mismanagement

Eric Fraser <truthintourism@gmail.com>

Thu, Nov 7, 2024 at 8:36 AM

To: City Clerk < CityClerk@srcity.org>

Cc: CMOffice <CMOffice@srcity.org>, citycouncil@srcity.org, CA Office <caoffice@srcity.org>, AHorta@srcity.org

Hello;

Thanks for your quick responses to our PRA requests.

We can not figure out why the discrepancies exist between your responsive information to our https://cityofsantarosaca.nextrequest.com/requests/24-1249 and the directory listed at https://santa-rosa.legistar.com/DepartmentDetail.aspx?ID=28212&GUID=586371DB-722B-459B-A784-935131CE3E8D

I've attached the workbook we created from the responsive information, in an attempt to understand the status and backgrounds of current CAB members, as well as past appointees.

We've learned that since 1/1/21 CAB has seen 9 completed terms of various lengths, and 19 resignations. The current cohort has 10 current members and 4 empty seats. Furthermore, the responsive information shows 60% of seated CAB members have terms expiring at the end of 2024.

Yesterday, we sent an email related to questions about quorum and voting procedures at CAB. An essential question is whether CAB has ever seated all members (21 pre-Res 28174, or 14 members required after the resolution passed in 2012), and if so, when?

What is a CAB term anyway? Terms' start and end dates appear more as a response to resignations instead of a celebratory change from one cohort to another.

Why is it so difficult to seat a full CAB? The need for political control with a strong hint of incessant corruption probably has something to do with it. Once people are seated they find the working environment lacking?

Frankly this is a shocking mess. I'm not certain that even somebody with the incredible skill set that Ms. Horta displays will be able to overcome CAB's deficiencies, duplicity, and management problems.

Eric Fraser TRUTH IN TOURISM 707.479-8247

\*\*:

## Questions about 10/30/24 CAB meeting



Greater Cherry Neighborhood Association <greatercherry@gmail.com>

to CMOffice, caoffice, City, Community, Ana, Cherie, Steve

Wed, Nov 6, 4:25 PM (15 hours

Dear City Attorney Strickler, Manager Smith, and the Community Advisory Board,

Please clarify the rules for establishing quorum and determining votes for a motion to pass so we can resolve questions about voting during the 10/30/24 CAB meeting.

10/30/24: The CAB meeting included 9 of the 11 seated CAB members on a 14-person board. See https://santa-rosa.granicus.com/player/clip/3321? view id=2&redirect=true Two members were reclused/abstained on separate items, and one member left the meeting at approximately 2:00:00. Chair Weeks

at 1:48:27 declared that Member Inocencio had "stepped down". Therefore, for the 10/30/24 meeting there were only 10 seated members (not 11), 9 in attendance, and 4 (not 3) vacancies. Why was that not revealed at the beginning of the meeting?

Quorum: Resolution No. 28174 (2012) specifies 8 members of CAB make a quorum from a body of 14 seats, a simple majority. But it assumes all 14 seats are filled, which has hardly been the case since 2019 if ever. See <a href="https://cityofsantarosaca.nextrequest.com/requests/24-1249">https://cityofsantarosaca.nextrequest.com/requests/24-1249</a>
Why isn't a quorum calculated from the number of filled seats, when the Board has historically been unable to fill all seats allotted?

10/30/24: Using a simple majority AND assuming all 14 seats are filled, 9 members were "present" while 8 were needed for a quorum, this assumes "vacancies" are also "members". (Let's refer to this as the "8/14" rule enforced by City Attorney Strickler). At several points during the meeting, CAB barely had a quorum as members abstained or became absent. With only 10 seated members, why wouldn't 6 members make an official quorum since this is a simple majority? (6/10 simple majority calculation) Anyway, 8 members were present for the 10/30 meeting, and we'll pretend that there are 14 seated members.

Voting on a Motion: All information in the Council Procedures and Protocols, Policy 000-06, and Rosenberg's Rules of Order indicates that a simple majority of members "present & voting" is needed to pass a motion. Nothing stated in Resolutions nos. 22928 (1996), 25805 (2003), 28174 (2012), 28442 (2014) indicate that there any rules that allows or requires a deviation from a "present & voting" simple majority to carry a motion. "Present" refers to the quorum being achieved and acknowledged before a vote, and "voting" means you are qualified to vote (not disqualified, abstaining, or absent). Unfilled seats, absent, abstained or otherwise disqualified members cannot vote, and their votes are not considered when determining a simple majority, assuming a quorum is maintained.

Therefore, we assert that the applications for the **Greater Cherry Neighbors** and the **Latino Service Providers** were in fact passed, individually, 7 yes – 1 no (0 recusals – 2 absences – 4 vacant seats). **Only 5 "yes" votes**, out of all votes of the 8 members "present and voting", even with an 8-member quorum meeting Attorney Strickler's strict standards, would have been required to pass on a simple majority.

If our analysis is correct, we'd think that the cure is to record in the minutes that the rules were somehow misinterpreted by the City Attorney, and that both motions in fact passed. Don't you agree, Attorney Strickler?

In the future, it may be good practice for the City Attorney, staff, or Board Chair to clearly give a CAB update so that the people and members know the correct calculation for a quorum (with cites) and whether achieved, the voting status of members (present, absent, disqualified) and whether some members need to abstain for specific items (and the impact on quorum).

As a separate item, let's correspond about the remedy for the application for the Sharing Institute's Appreciation Day that we submitted, but went missing, or was overlooked. Given the prejudicial and calumnious environment created by you against me and those associated with me, it would be fair to award that application out of some other account – like Out There!, without further ado. What are you doing with the application for the Sharing Institute's Appreciation Day?

Looking forward to learning more about these questions and issues by 11/15/24. Let us know if it is not reasonable to have your response and information by then, so we can plan accordingly.

Sincerely,

Eric Fraser 707.479-8247

Additional Sources:



cc: Attorney's file

## 2 attachments



**Screen Shot 2024-11-06 at 4.53.58 PM.png** 238K

CAB\_Data\_2019\_Current\_Term\_Employer\_AppointedByANNOTATED110624.pdf 59K