



City of Santa Rosa

City Hall, Council Chamber
100 Santa Rosa Ave
Santa Rosa, CA 95404

Cultural Heritage Board Regular Meeting Minutes - Final

Wednesday, September 4, 2019

2:30 PM

1. 2:30 PM CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL (COUNCIL CHAMBER)

Chair Edmondson called the meeting to order at 2:45 p.m.

Present 4 - Chair Casey Edmondson, Board Member Mark DeBacker, Board Member Laura Fennell, and Board Member Brian Meuser

Absent 1 - Board Member John McHugh

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The August 21, 2019 Minutes were approved as submitted.

3. BOARD BUSINESS

Chair Edmondson read aloud the Statement of Purpose.

Chair Edmondson announced new Board Member, Brian Meuser.

Board Member Meuser introduced himself to the Board and public.

4. PUBLIC COMMENT

Chair Edmondson opened public comments at 2:48 p.m.

Sher Ennis welcomed Board Member Meuser, and explained that the permit process is extremely difficult for applicants in Historic districts.

Chair Edmondson closed public comments at 2:50 p.m.

5. STATEMENTS OF ABSTENTIONS

There were no statements of abstention.

6. SCHEDULED ITEMS

- 6.1 CONTINUED PUBLIC HEARING - LANDMARK ALTERATION - CARPENTER URBAN COTTAGES, EXEMPT PROJECT - LANDMARK ALTERATION - 25 RAE ST - LMA15-013

BACKGROUND: Proposal to demolish a detached 325-square-foot rear accessory structure, and construct two pairs of duplex units, connected by covered carports, behind an existing 821-square-foot dwelling, located within the Burbank Gardens Preservation District.

Project Planner: Toomians

ex parte disclosures:

**Board Member Debacker visited the site, but not since the last meeting.
Board Member Fennell visited the site, but not since the last meeting.
Chair Edmondson visited the site.**

Senior Planner Toomians gave the staff report and answered Board Members' questions.

Meeting went into Recess at 2:58 p.m. for City Attorney to confer with a Board Member.

Board Member Fennell announced that she was on Burbank Gardens Neighborhood Association but would have no conflict in reviewing the project, as she never saw the project previously, while on the Neighborhood Association.

Meeting Reconvened

Architect Alima Silverson gave a presentation.

Applicant David Carpenter gave a presentation.

Chair Edmondson opened the public hearing at 3:17 p.m.

Marlene Russell - Expressed concerns regarding parking and traffic flow.

Steve Stourel - 713 Tupper St - Did not get notified of hearing; expressed concerns regarding project height, visual impact, shade, parking impacts, orientation of Rae Street unit to park, and lack of transparency by project owner regarding parking and actual number of stories. The Kennedy report misrepresents the project. The proposed height is not historic.

Katheryne Stoural - 713 Tupper St - Did not receive mail notification, nor did many neighbors. Concerned regarding project height, visual impact, rooflines, orientation of structures on the lot, 5-foot setbacks, visibility, parking. The unit on Rae Street does not have a front door facing the street.

Proposed parking is deficient, and there is no immediate street parking in front of the project. The Kennedy report misrepresents the project. The proposed project has gotten taller over time. Asked if dormers can be removed, as they are not true second stories.

Lucas Gilbert - 715 Tupper St - Expressed concern regarding the size of the project. The public hearing sign was installed a week ago.

A neighbor (715 Tupper St) spoke regarding concerns about space and the size of the project.

John Sabatino - 726 Tupper St - Opposed the project, lives across street. Kennedy report is misleading. The project orientation will open up a direct thoroughfare for problems from Rae Park. He expressed concerns regarding traffic, parking, project height, historic preservation. The project is about making money and not preserving the neighborhood.

Ann Caro - 710 Tupper St - The attics will be used as second units. Concerned re parking, which is already scarce; weekends are not covered by parking permit, so there is no parking on weekends. Expressed concerns re: project height; Upper windows will look into neighbors' back yards.

Sher Ennis - West End Historic District - Concern re zoning issue and project height; The buildings are clearly 2-story units; the minimum 10-foot setback will not be met if they are used as 2-units, since the buildings would already be there. Owner needs to understand long-term consequences.

Chair Edmondson closed the public hearing at 3:38 p.m.

The Board and staff held a discussion to clarify

Chair Edmondson opened public comments at 4:05 p.m.

Katheryne Stoural expressed concern regarding parking, second-story windows looking into neighboring yards and homes, project height, lot lines, shade, and the modern style.

Steve Stoural expressed concern regarding windows in the dormers; attics are designed to be future living spaces. He expressed concerns re: setbacks, project height.

Timothy Welch - There is too much sprawl; we can either build up or out; in the future there may not be parking issues; there are homeless issues.

Sher Ennis - Disputed statement that roof pitch was designed for solar; if the roof pitch could be adjusted lower it would still leave space for storage & solar.

Chair Edmondson closed public comments.

Chair Edmondson called the Meeting to recess at 4:13 p.m.

Chair Edmondson called the meeting to order at 4:19 p.m.

The Board discussed the following: Reduction of height by 3 feet or more, to resemble a single-story structure and be in scale with existing home. Secured, translucent glazing on attic windows that face neighbors. Reduction of density to 15 units per acre. Possible rotation of the northern-most unit to face Rae Street to engage public space. Submittal of a professional historic structures report to staff.

A motion was made by Board Member DeBacker, seconded by Chair Edmondson, to approve: RESOLUTION OF THE CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD OF THE CITY OF SANTA ROSA APPROVING A LANDMARK ALTERATION PERMIT FOR CARPENTER URBAN COTTAGES, LOCATED AT 725 TUPPER AND 25 RAE STREETS IN THE BURBANK GARDENS HISTORIC PRESERVATION DISTRICT, ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBERS 009-201-004, -009, FILE NUMBER LMA15-013. The motion failed by the following vote:

Yes: 2 - Chair Edmondson and Board Member DeBacker

No: 2 - Board Member Fennell and Board Member Meuser

Absent: 1 - Board Member McHugh

7. BOARDMEMBER REPORTS

Chair Edmondson reminded Board Members of mandatory State SB 1343 training (Preventing Workplace Sexual Harassment)

8. DEPARTMENT REPORTS

There were no Department reports.

9. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Edmondson adjourned the meeting at 4:59 p.m.

PREPARED BY:

Patti Pacheco Gregg, Recording Secretary

CITY OF SANTA ROSA
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
STAFF REPORT FOR CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD
September 4, 2019

PROJECT TITLE

Carpenter Urban Cottages

APPLICANT

David Carpenter; Alima Silverman

ADDRESS/LOCATION

715 Tupper Street; 25 Rae Street

PROPERTY OWNER

David Carpenter

ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBER

009-201-004; 009-201-009

FILE NUMBER

LMA15-013

APPLICATION DATE

August 18, 2015

APPLICATION COMPLETION DATE

July 23, 2019

REQUESTED ENTITLEMENTS

Major Landmark Alteration

FURTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED

None

PROJECT SITE ZONING

PD 0225-H (Planned Development,
Historic Combining District)

GENERAL PLAN DESIGNATION

Medium Density Residential

PROJECT PLANNER

Kristinae Toomians

RECOMMENDATION

Approval

For Cultural Heritage Board Meeting of: September 4, 2019

CITY OF SANTA ROSA
CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD

TO: CHAIR EDMONDSON AND MEMBERS OF THE BOARD
FROM: KRISTINAE TOOMIANS, SENIOR PLANNER
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
SUBJECT: URBAN COTTAGES LANDMARK ALTERATION PERMIT

AGENDA ACTION: RESOLUTION

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning and Economic Development Department that the Cultural Heritage Board, by Resolution, approve a Landmark Alteration Permit for the construction of four multi-family dwellings in the Burbank Gardens Historic Preservation District, located at 715 Tupper Street and 25 Rae Street.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The project proposes construction of four residential cottages over two lots at 715 Tupper Street and 25 Rae Street. The Tupper Street parcel is currently developed with an 821-square-foot single-family home, built in vernacular style in 1906. The Rae Street parcel is vacant. A component of the project will be to improve Rae Street with pavement and curb, gutter, and sidewalk. Because the project proposes new residential units that meet General Plan densities while remaining sympathetic to the detached bungalow aesthetic of the neighborhood and without altering the existing residential structure, Planning and Economic Development is recommending approval of the Landmark Alteration Permit.

BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The project proposes to construct four residential cottages on two adjacent parcels at 25 Rae Street and 715 Tupper Street. Each cottage will have approximately 576-square-feet of floor area. The cottages are designed to be universally accessible, with no steps at the entry way and appropriately sized door clearances. The project parcels will include separate covered parking and outdoor space for each of the cottages as well as for the existing house, which will not be altered as part of this project.

Access to the units will be provided via the existing driveway on Tupper Street as well as through the paving and improvement of Rae Street. An existing shed will be demolished and several trees will be removed, including three of five coast live oaks and one eucalyptus, which will be mitigated for in accordance with the City's tree ordinance.

The project is located within the Burbank Gardens Preservation District. The district is characterized by modest, single-family homes, which are predominately bungalows. The period of significance for the district is identified in the Zoning Code as 1875 to 1940s.

2. Surrounding Land Uses

North: Unimproved Rae Street; Rae Street Park

South: Single-family homes

East: Single-family home with accessory dwelling unit; parking facility

West: Single-family homes

The project site is located in a predominately residential area and surrounded on three sides by single-family development. An unimproved section of Rae Street abuts the northern boundary of the project site and Rae Street Park, a public park with pedestrian connections to Sonoma Avenue is located to the north. Tupper Street is primarily occupied by single-story bungalow houses, with a few two-story or raised structures. To the east is a surface parking facility associated with the Bethlehem Towers affordable development beyond.

3. Existing Land Use – Project Site

The project site is divided into two parcels which were originally part of a larger parcel that extended from Tupper Street to Matanzas Creek. The Tupper Street parcel is developed with a single-story, 821 square-foot single-family cottage. A single-room accessory structure is located behind the existing residence. The Rae Street parcel is vacant and contains several ornamental and fruit trees in addition to a large eucalyptus.

4. Project History

On September 5, 2007, the Cultural Heritage Board reviewed a proposed triplex for the project site as a concept item. The same proposal returned to the Board on February 20, 2008, for additional concept review.

On January 2, 2013, the Department of Planning and Economic Development received applications proposing construction of four new units that would occupy the project parcels in addition to the existing house on Tupper Street (Urban Cottages).

On January 13, 2014, the original Urban Cottages applications were withdrawn.

On August 18, 2015, a new Landmark Alteration Permit application for the Urban Cottages project was received by Planning and Economic Development.

On October 28, 2015, a Notice of Application was mailed to property owners in the vicinity of the project site.

On February 8, 2019, the applicant submitted revised plans, which include covered parking areas, which serve as attachments between each pair of single-family attached residences.

ANALYSIS

1. General Plan

The General Plan land use designation for the site is Medium Density Residential, which allows a density of 8-18 units per acre. This designation permits a range of housing types, including single-family attached and multi-family developments. The project site is 12,500-square-feet, or 0.29-acres. The proposed development will result in a density of approximately 17 dwelling units per acre, which is within the allowable density limit.

2. Zoning

According to Zoning Code Section 20-28.040, the Burbank Gardens Preservation District was designated by the City Council on March 25, 2003, and established the period of significance for the District ranging from 1875-1940s. It identifies the following character defining elements:

The Burbank Gardens Preservation District is a fairly homogenous district of small single-family homes, predominately Bungalows representing the bulk of development that occurred in the 1920s and 1930s, with some examples of Italianate, Queen Anne, Colonial, Period Revival, and some post war styles.

Typical lots are narrow, generally measuring 40 to 50 feet. Houses generally follow a similar front setback on any given block face and front stoops or small porches create clearly defined entries with orientation to the street. Front yard fencing is generally three-foot tall picket fencing if any at all. Small front yards include informal landscaping. Single car garages are located at the rear of property, often on a side property line with narrow driveway access.

Houses are single story with some exceptions found in the northern portion of the district, closer to Santa Rosa Creek. The predominant exterior materials are wood (shingle, shiplap, and clapboard) and stucco. Architectural detailing is minimal and simple. Double hung wood windows are common.

Although some houses are found on Santa Rosa Avenue, in general the character along this outer edge of the district is different. Most district properties along Santa Rosa Avenue are considered noncontributing properties, although two National Register properties (Luther Burbank Home and Gardens and Park Apartments) are found along this strip.

The project parcel is located within the PD-0225 (Planned Development) Zoning District with a historic preservation overlay. The PD-0225 Burbank Gardens Neighborhood Planned Development District is divided into various zoning subdistricts. The subject site is identified as R-3-PD, multiple-family zone. The PD Policy Statement recommends that development in the R-3 sections be permitted to maximum densities, so long as the proposed project is designed to be compatible with the neighborhood or utilize an appropriate historical architectural design. It also requires that parking facilities, including guest parking, be easily accessible in order to encourage off-street parking.

A Landmark Alteration Permit is required because the project involves new construction of residential units within a preservation district.

Pursuant to Zoning Code Section 20-58.060 (F), the Board should consider the following criteria to the extent applicable in their discussion:

1. The consistency, or lack thereof, of the proposed change with the original architectural style and details of the building;
2. The compatibility of the proposed change with any adjacent or nearby landmark structures or preservation district structures;
3. The consistency and/or compatibility of the proposed colors, textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features and details with the time period of the building's construction, and/or adjacent structures;
4. Whether the proposed change will destroy or adversely affect an important architectural feature or features;
5. The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (1983 Revision); and
6. Other matters, criteria and standards as may be adopted by resolution of the CHB.

A Major Landmark Alteration Permit is required because: the site is located within the Burbank Gardens Preservation District and the existing residence at 715 Tupper Street is a contributor to the district; and, it also involves new construction of four multi-family units.

The California Department of Parks and Recreation Primary Record, prepared in 2002 describes the structure built in 1906 as "Vernacular Cottage," and describes it as a contributor to the historic district.

The *Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties* states that the applicant can provide information regarding the property and its historic significance. It states, "Many property owners have detailed knowledge of their properties, including names of former owners and dates of major alterations." It goes on to state that, "the applicant should work closely with the Cultural Heritage Board to see how much information is needed and whether the information adequate enough for the Board to render a determination."

The applicant self-prepared a Historic Structures Report, dated January 15, 2018, which identifies that the original residence was 376-square-foot and built in 1906. Front and rear additions are evidenced through examination of the floor joists. The existing 325-square-foot detached accessory building has no permit on record and was not indicated on the 1957 Sanborn Map.

The applicant does not propose any exterior alterations to the existing residence but proposes to demolish the existing detached accessory structure.

The new multi-family units are proposed in a cottage style, attached by a covered carport.

3. Design Guidelines

The following goals and policies, from the Santa Rosa Design Guidelines, Section 4.7- Historic Properties and Districts, are applicable to the proposed project:

Goals

- To preserve Santa Rosa's historic heritage.
- To encourage maintenance and retention of historic structures and districts.
- To ensure that alterations to historic buildings are compatible with the character of the structure and the neighborhood.

Policies

G – New Construction

1. Design new construction so that the architectural character of the neighborhood is maintained. Specific architectural styles are not mandated. Designs for new construction can also be contemporary.
2. Design new construction to be compatible in height and proportion with adjacent structures.
3. Use materials and designs similar to that found throughout the neighborhood.

Staff response: The applicant proposes to preserve the existing single-family cottage-style residence, located at 715 Tupper Street, and construct four new multi-family units behind the existing residence. One of the units will front onto Rae Street. The applicant proposes cottage-style, two-story units. Each pair of new units will be attached by a shared carport. The new residential units will be clad in cement lap siding, with shed dormers, 12/12 pitch asphalt cool roofs, vinyl thermal windows, solar collectors, and solar hot water. The applicant proposes a corrugated metal roof carport that will connect each pair of new units. The total height of the units is 25-feet to the top of the roof. The proposed cottage-style units, with siding, gabled roof and porch are in keeping with the existing cottage-style residence.

4. Historic Preservation Review Standards

The following guidelines from the City's Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Buildings are applicable to the proposed project:

Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties

Section G Design Guidelines – New Construction

1. The height of new construction in a Preservation District should be compatible with adjacent structures.
2. New construction should match adjacent structures in proportions of width to height.

3. New construction within Preservation Districts should maintain this rhythm of window and door openings on the main façade. Entrances should be oriented to the street rather than to an alley. Blank walls or garage doors should not dominate the facade.
4. Setbacks should be consistent with adjacent structures and should not vary more than ten percent with the adjacent structures.
5. New construction should be compatible with adjacent buildings on the block.
6. Roofs for new construction should be compatible with adjacent structures.

Staff response: The applicant proposes to preserve the existing single-family cottage-style residence, located at 715 Tupper Street. The proposed cottage-style units are in keeping with the nearby contributing structures, in that they will be clad in siding, and have a gabled roof and porch that are reminiscent of the cottage-style residence. One of the units will front onto Rae Street, which will be upgraded with new pavement, curb, gutter, and sidewalk. The applicant proposes to demolish the existing 325-square-foot detached accessory building, which has no permit on record and was not indicated on the 1957 Sanborn Map.

5. Neighborhood Comments
No neighborhood comments have been received to date.

6. Public Improvements/On-Site Improvements

The applicant will be required to improve Rae Street project frontage to Rural Street Standards, which will include curb, gutter. The applicant will also be required to repair any damaged sidewalk along Tupper Street (See Exhibit A).

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 – Disclosure Form
Attachment 2 – Location Map
Attachment 3 – Neighborhood Context Map
Attachment 4 – Project Plans
Attachment 6 – DPR Form
Attachment 7 – Historic Structures Report
Attachment 8 – PD-0225 Policy Statement
Attachment 9 – Applicant Correspondence (Background)
Attachment 10 – Late Correspondence
Resolution
Exhibit A

CONTACT

Kristinae Toomians, Senior Planner
Planning and Economic Development
100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3
(707) 543-4692
KToomians@SRCity.org

DRAFT

RESOLUTION NUMBER [To be entered by Secretary after Adoption]

RESOLUTION OF THE CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD OF THE CITY OF SANTA ROSA DENYING A LANDMARK ALTERATION PERMIT FOR CARPENTER URBAN COTTAGES, LOCATED AT 725 TUPPER & 25 RAE STREETS IN THE BURBANK GARDENS HISTORIC PRESERVATION DISTRICT, ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBERS 009-201-004, -009, FILE NUMBER LMA15-013

WHEREAS, on September 4, 2019, the Cultural Heritage Board of the City of Santa Rosa considered the Landmark Alteration Permit, at which time it received written and oral reports of staff, testimony, and other evidence presented by all those who wished to be heard on the matter; and

WHEREAS, at that meeting on September 4, 2019, the Cultural Heritage Board of the City of Santa Rosa, after due consideration, investigation, and study made by itself and on its behalf and due consideration of all evidence and reports denied the Landmark Alteration Permit; and

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, the Cultural Heritage Board of the City of Santa Rosa does deny the appeal and upholds the decision of the Cultural Heritage Board to deny Landmark Alteration for the Carpenter Urban Cottage project.

REGULARLY PASSED AND ADOPTED by the Cultural Heritage Board of the City of Santa Rosa on this 4th day of September, 2019, by the following vote:

AYES: ()
NOES: ()
ABSTAIN: ()
ABSENT: ()

APPROVED: _____
 Casey Edmondson, Chair

ATTEST: _____
 Kristinae Toomians, Secretary