

CITY OF SANTA ROSA
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
STAFF REPORT FOR THE JOINT HEARING OF
THE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD AND CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD

June 20, 2019

PROJECT TITLE

DeTurk Winery Village

APPLICANT

Richard Deringer

ADDRESS/LOCATION

806 Donahue Street and 8 W. 9th Street
Santa Rosa, Ca. 95401

PROPERTY OWNER

Railroad Square Village, LLC

ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBER

010-091-001 & 010-091-007

FILE NUMBER

PRJ18-087

APPLICATION DATE

December 6, 2019

APPLICATION COMPLETION DATE

June 5, 2019

REQUESTED ENTITLEMENTS

Preliminary Design Review and
Landmark Alteration

FURTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED

Final Design Review – To be considered
by the Design Review Board

PROJECT SITE ZONING

TV-R-H-SA (Transit Village Residential
within both the Historic and Station Area
combining districts)

GENERAL PLAN DESIGNATION

Transit Village Medium

PROJECT PLANNER

Adam Ross

RECOMMENDATION

Approve the Landmark Alteration and
Grant Preliminary Design Review

Joint meeting of the Design Review and Cultural Heritage Boards on June 20, 2019

CITY OF SANTA ROSA
DESIGN REVIEW BOARD AND CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD

TO: CHAIRS KINCAID AND EDMONDSON AND RESPECTIVE
BOARD MEMBERS
FROM: ADAM ROSS, CITY PLANNER
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
SUBJECT: DETURK WINERY VILLAGE
AGENDA ACTION: TWO RESOLUTIONS

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended by the Planning and Economic Development Department that the Cultural Heritage Board approve a Landmark Alteration and that both the Design Review Board and Cultural Heritage Board jointly grant Preliminary Design Review for DeTurk Winery Village.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

DeTurk Winery Village (Project) is a proposal to develop a 3.45-acre area with a mixed-use development that includes 185 residential apartment (rental) units, 15 of which will be designated for very-low income occupants (50% AMI) for a period of 55 years. The proposed Project will make changes to the previously approved Design Review Permit and Major Landmark Alteration Permit that includes:

- Removing all residential units out of the Commercial Building (Building C)
- Expand Building A to incorporate residential units removed from Building C
- Convert approximately 2,400 square feet of commercial space to a parking garage
- Retain approximately 18,600 square feet of existing commercial space.
- Addition of a fourth-story on Building B with a height of 46 feet.
- Minor elevation changes to Buildings A and B located at the stairwells

The site is located within the West End Preservation District and is currently developed with the historic DeTurk Winery complex made up the Winery and U.S. Bonded Warehouse. The Deturk Winery Village campus proposes to preserve and incorporate the historic structures in the 4-building campus. The structures will range in height from 42 feet to 46 feet tall.

In addition to the Landmark Alteration (LMA) and Design Review (DR) applications being reviewed by the Cultural Heritage Board (CHB) and Design Review Board (DRB), the project incorporates the previously approved Vacation of Public Right-of-way, which was reviewed and approved by the Planning Commission and the City Council, respectively. The project also includes a new State Density Bonus of 35% with 2 Concessions, one for height and one Exemption for Dispersion which allows the affordable units to be located in one building. The LMA and DR resolutions have been conditioned appropriately to incorporate the new Project and Concessions.

BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The project involves the development of a mixed-use campus on 3.45 acres located within the boundaries of the Downtown Station Area Specific Plan (DSASP). The site is bordered by the Sonoma-Marín Area Rail Transit (SMART) tracks to the east, W. 8th Street to the south, Donahue Street to the west, and W. 9th Street to the north. The project site consists of two privately owned parcels totaling 3.01 acres plus 18,725 square feet of public right-of-way which the City has agreed to vacate (RES-2017-070). The site is currently developed with the historic DeTurk Winery complex comprised of several buildings including the historic winery and warehouse buildings, and a cement block building.

The campus will be comprised of four buildings:

Building A: 84 Residential units (four floors)

- 79 one-bedroom units
- 5 one-bedroom units

Building B: 32 Units (four floors)

- 32 one-bedroom units

Building C: Approximately 18,600 Square feet of commercial space, currently a gym (one floor, 31 feet tall)

Building D: 69 Units (four floors)

- 25 one-bedroom units
- 44 two-bedroom units

2. Surrounding Land Uses

North: Transit Village Medium (25-40 units per acre)

South: Transit Village Medium

East: Transit Village Medium and directly adjacent to the SMART rail tracks

West: Low Density Residential (2-8 units per acre) and Parks & Recreation

DeTurk Winery Village is located in the West End Preservation District. The project site is bordered to the east by the SMART tracks and, just beyond the tracks, the approved Pullman Lofts site.

The site is bordered to the west by Donahue Street, with the DeTurk Round Barn, a DeTurk Park and three residential lots directly across the street.

The site is bordered to the north by W. 9th Street and to the south by W. 8th Street, both of which provide a mix of commercial uses in the project vicinity.

3. Existing Land Use – Project Site

The project site is located along the east side of Donahue Street, and spans the distance between W. 8th Street and W. 9th Street. It is currently developed with several buildings including the historic DeTurk Winery and the affiliated U.S. Bonded Warehouse, all of which are discussed in detail in the historic evaluation prepared by Susan Clark, M.A., Architectural Historian, dated September 2016, and the historical evaluation by Diana Painter, PhD, dated April 17, 2019, for the new project.

4. Project History

January 31, 2017 – The City Council granted appeal and approved the Preliminary Design Review and Landmark Alteration Permit (RES-2017-013 & RES-2017-014)

May 9, 2017 – The City Council adopted Resolutions to grant the Vacation of Right-of-Way (RES-2017-070) and Density Bonus (RES-2017-071).

December 6, 2018 – DeTurk Winery submitted an application for a new Design Review and Landmark Alteration Permit.

January 17, 2019 – The Joint Concept Design Review meeting was held before the DRB and CHB.

April 17, 2019 – In response to the Issues Letter dated February 1, 2019, the applicant submitted a revised set of plans.

PRIOR CITY COUNCIL REVIEW

On April 19, 2016, the City Council adopted Resolution No. 28768, an Intent to Consider Vacation of Public Right-of-way for 18,725 square feet along the east side of Donahue Street for the DeTurk Winery Village project.

The City Council granted appeal and approved the Preliminary Design Review and Landmark Alteration Permit (RES-2017-013 & RES-2017-014).

The City Council adopted Resolution Nos. RES-2017-070 and RES-2017-071 granting the Vacation of Right-of-Way and Density Bonus.

ANALYSIS

1. General Plan

The General Plan Land Use Designation for the site is Transit Village Medium, which allows a density of 25-40 units per acre. This designation is intended to accommodate mixed-use development within one-half mile of the SMART Station. Residential uses are required, and ground floor commercial uses are encouraged.

The following General Plan goals and policies are applicable to the project:

- LUL-A Foster a compact rather than a scattered development pattern in order to reduce travel, energy, land, and material consumption while promoting greenhouse gas emission reductions citywide.
- LUL-F Maintain a diversity of neighborhoods and varied housing stock to satisfy a wide range of needs.
- LUL-G Promote mixed use sites.
- LUL-L Ensure land uses that promote use of transit.
- UD-A Preserve and enhance Santa Rosa’s scenic character including its distinctive districts.
- UD-G-2 Locate higher density residential uses adjacent to transit facilities, shopping, and employment centers, and link these areas with bicycle and pedestrian paths.
- H-A Meet the housing needs of all Santa Rosa residents.
- H-A-2 Pursue the goal of meeting Santa Rosa’s housing needs through increased densities, when compatible with existing neighborhoods. Development of existing and new higher-density sites must be designed in context with existing, surrounding neighborhoods.
- H-C Expand the supply of housing available to lower income households.
- H-D-11 Continue to provide funding and offer incentives such as density bonuses, reduced parking requirements, design flexibility, and deferred development fees.
- H-F-4 Continue to implement the City’s Density Bonus Ordinance, consistent with State Law.
- T-B Provide a safe, efficient, free-flowing circulation system.
- HP-B Preserve Santa Rosa’s historic structures and neighborhoods.
- HP-B-1 Ensure that alterations to historic buildings and their surrounding settings are compatible with the character of the structure and the neighborhood. Ensure that rehabilitation projects follow the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation to a reasonable extent, taking into consideration economic feasibility.

- NS-B-1 Do not locate noise-sensitive uses in proximity to major noise sources, except residential is allowed near rail to promote future ridership.
- NS-F-1 Require remediation and cleanup in identified areas where hazardous materials have impacted soil or groundwater.

Staff response: The General Plan Land Use Designation of Transit Village Medium was implemented to allow higher density residential projects in proximity to the SMART station. The proposed project includes a Density Bonus, which allows development at densities higher than allowed by the General Plan in return for affordable units.

DeTurk Winery Village is a proposal to construct a 185-unit residential mixed-use development at a density of 53 units per acre. Pursuant to General Plan Policy H-F-4 (shown above), the project is consistent with both the City's and the State's Density Bonus regulations (Government Code Section 65915). The project has designated 15 units (11 percent of the maximum allowable density) for very low-income residents and, as such, qualifies for a 35 percent density increase and up to two Concessions. To achieve this number of units, the project requires approval of a Density Bonus. City Council approved the Vacation of Public Right-of-way for 18,725 square feet along the east side of Donahue Street, between W. 8th Street and W. 9th Street (RES-2017-070). Conditions requiring those two entitlements have been added to the Conditions of Approval for both the Preliminary Design Review and the Landmark Alteration Permit.

The project site is located within the West End Preservation District, which is made up predominantly of smaller single-family residences west of the project site. The DeTurk Winery Village site is separated from the residential portion of the neighborhood to the west by the DeTurk Round Barn and a park.

The General Plan directs us not to locate noise-sensitive uses in proximity to major noise sources. Developments proximate to the tracks are the exception as provided in General Plan Policy NS-F-1.

2. Downtown Station Area Specific Plan (DSASP)

The DSASP is the result of a community-based vision for downtown Santa Rosa. It is centered around the SMART Station and defines the framework for development. There are several goals and policies that overlap with the General Plan goals and policies discussed above. To avoid duplication, the goals and policies shown below represent those that were not discussed in the previous section.

- LUL-E Promote livable neighborhoods. Ensure that everyday shopping, park and recreation facilities, and schools are within easy walking distance.
- SP-LU-2.1 Provide a variety of housing types and densities in the Specific Plan Area.
- SP-LU-2.3 Utilize existing City programs and policies to encourage and facilitate development of affordable housing within the Specific Plan Area.

- SP-LU-5.1 New development shall be designed to reinforce and enhance the distinctive and unique qualities of the Sub-Area it is located within.
- SP-LU-5.5 Infill development in the residential and historic sub-areas should incorporate and reflect character defining elements of the area as identified by the City's Cultural Heritage Board and follow the design guidelines outlined in the City's Processing Review Procedures for Historic Properties.
- SP-LU-6 Encourage development projects that will improve the quality of life in the Specific Plan Area and draw new residents into the core of Santa Rosa.
- SP-T-4.1 Ensure that parking requirements in the Specific Plan Area stimulate transit-oriented development by supporting and encouraging shared parking where possible and by allowing reductions to on-site parking requirements when supported by a parking study.
- SP-T-4.2 New on-street parking spaces created as part of a new development project may be counted towards meeting the project's overall parking requirement.
- SP-T-4.5 The largest mixed-use projects should be given incentives to provide additional shared parking spaces that benefit the surrounding area.
- SP-T-4.9 Monitor parking demand over time, particularly in locations where Specific Plan Sub-Areas and adjacent residential neighborhoods interface, including the West End Neighborhood.
- SP-T-4.11 Allow private residential development projects to provide "unbundled" parking, defined in the Zoning Code as parking spaces that are separated from the cost of housing, meaning that residents with no vehicles would realize a cost savings by not leasing a parking space. Correspondingly, residents may pay more to lease more than one parking space.

Staff response: The subject site is currently developed with several historic and non-historic structures, as determined in the Historic Evaluations, prepared by Susan Clark, M.A., Architectural Historian, dated September 2016, and Diana Painter, PhD, Architectural Historian, dated April, 2019, referenced throughout this report. The project is proposing 185 for rent residential units, 15 of which will be designated for very-low income occupants, defined as a household whose income does not exceed 50 percent of the area median income for Sonoma County, as published and periodically updated by the State Department of Housing and Community Development pursuant to Section 50079.5 of the California [Health and Safety Code](#). The project will also retain approximately 18,600 square feet of existing commercial space and provide 164 parking spaces, of which 42 will be on-street and 122 will be off-street.

As discussed in the General Plan discussion of this report, the project includes a Density Bonus, which will increase the density to 53 units per acre. The project

also offers a mix of housing types including both apartments and townhouses, both available with 1- and 2-bedroom floor plans. The exterior materials include cementitious, metal, and brick siding and have been selected at the direction of both the DRB and CHB original review of the project in 2016, intended to celebrate the industrial history of the site. Refer to the Historic Preservation Review Standards of this report for more discussion.

The commercial area, located on the ground floor, currently operates as a gym. The gym will continue to operate under this proposal and will be open to the public. This project also removes approximately 2,400 square feet of the commercial space in DeTurk Winery building, currently occupied by the gym, and is repurposed into a portion of the parking garage for the proposed residential units. The portion of the parking garage will provide more circulation within the site by connecting the entrance onto Donahue St., with Building D's parking garage and entrance/exit located on West 9th Street.

There are several goals and policies relating to parking. The project meets parking requirements. In addition to the parking spaces provided, the applicant will provide the following incentives to residents:

- Providing unbundled parking spaces, defined as spaces that are separated from the cost of housing, so that residents with no vehicles would realize a cost savings by not leasing a parking space. Correspondingly, residents may pay more to lease more than one parking space.
- Stripe 45 diagonal public parking spaces along the west side of Donahue Street. These parking spaces will be limited to 2-hour parking Monday through Friday, 8:00 am to 6:00 pm, which will be enforced by the City. The spaces will be available during night time and weekends for unrestricted periods of time.

3. Zoning

North: TV-R-SA-LIL (Transit Village Residential, within the Station Area and Limited Light Industrial combining districts)

South: TV-R-H-SA (Transit Village Residential, within the Historic and Station Area combining districts)

East: TV-R-SA (Transit Village Residential, within the Station Area combining district)

West: R-1-6-H (Single-Family Residential, within the Historic combining district), R-2-H (Medium Density Multi-Family Residential, within the Historic combining district) and OSR-H (Open Space – Recreation, within the Historic combining district)

The subject site is located within the TV-R-H-SA zoning district. This zoning district is applied to areas within approximately one-half mile of the transit facility that are appropriate for mixed use projects.

Entitlements and Review Process

Pursuant to Zoning Code Section 20-58.060(C)(3), Design Review is required for any project greater than 5,000 square feet within the -H combining district. The review process for these two entitlements is as follows:

- Preliminary Design Review for a project that is subject to this Subsection will be conducted in a joint meeting of the DRB and CHB.
- Final Design Review. Final Design Review will be by the DRB, or delegated to Staff, in compliance with Section 20-52.030 (Design Review).

When considering a Landmark Alteration, the review authority should consider the following criteria:

- The consistency, or lack thereof, of the proposed change with the original architectural style and details of the building;
- The compatibility of the proposed change with any adjacent or nearby landmark structures or preservation district structures;
- The consistency and/or compatibility of the proposed colors, textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features and details with the time period of the building's construction, and/or adjacent structures;
- Whether the proposed change will destroy or adversely affect an important architectural feature or features;
- The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (1983 Revision); and
- Other matters, criteria and standards as may be adopted by resolution of the CHB

Staff response: As stated in the Department of Parks and Recreation Primary Record (attached), the subject site is currently developed with the historic DeTurk Winery complex consisting of the former 3-section winery buildings and U.S. Bonded Warehouse. The historic evaluation, prepared by Susan Clark, dated September 2016, with an additional historic evaluation, prepared by Diana Painter, PhD, dated April 17, 2019, found that the proposed apartment buildings are compatible with the historic winery and US Bonded Warehouse in terms of scale, materials, height, and setbacks. Painter's report concludes that Clark's 2016, findings for the previous project remain and that the DeTurk Park and DeTurk Round Barn located across Donahue Street provide an adequate buffer between the residential neighborhood and the current project's site. Refer to the Historic Preservation Review Section for more discussion regarding the historic analysis.

The project includes a restoration component and will restore the street facing façade of the brick buildings including retaining the stepped parapet on the DeTurk Winery building. Painter's report concluded that the current project meets the requirement of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Development Standards

The Zoning Code establishes development standards for properties located within the TV-R zoning districts. The following discussion explains how these requirements have been addressed in the DeTurk Winery Village project:

Setbacks

There are no required setbacks in this zoning district unless specified by the review authority. Table 2-19 requires that at least 60% of the street frontage along W. 9th Street be located on the property line. During the March 5, 2016, Concept Design Review meeting, the applicant was directed to separate the new apartment building (Building D) from the existing brick structure. Both historic evaluations prepared by Clark (2016) and Painter (2019) stated that the Building A is separated enough to preserve the façades from the historic buildings, including the character-defining port hole windows.

Building Height

Table 2-5 of the Zoning Code provides that the maximum allowable height for a building within the TV-R zoning district is four stories, except for properties that abut residential and historic residential uses and zoning districts, where the maximum height shall transition down to three stories adjacent to the residential property. Table 2-19 limits the building height along W. 9th to three stories.

Zoning Code Section 20-28.040 provides development standards for combining districts. Building height for structures within the -H combining district are generally limited to 35' tall, and structures within the -SA combining district, shown in Table 2-20, are required to be between 35'-45' tall. In the event of any conflict, as is the case here, the standards of the -H combining district shall apply.

Zoning Code section 20-28.040(E)(3)(c) allows the review authority to approve an increase in height provided that the review authority finds first that the increased height does not detract from the character of the preservation district or any adjacent contributing properties. The review authority may require Conditions of Approval that pertain to architectural design and amenities so as to preserve residential privacy.

Staff response: The purpose of the height limits within the -H combining district is to preserve and enhance the neighborhood character within preservation districts. The tallest point of the structures proposed as part of this project is 46 feet. One of the design features includes an open balcony on 4th floor units facing Donahue Street, which provides visual relief to allow the building to appear to transition from three- to four-stories stepping away from Donahue Street.

The Historical Evaluations, prepared by Susan Clark, dated September 2016, and Diana Painter, dated April 2019, states that the proposed height is similar to the historic winery building, and space has been left between the old and new

structures so that key features of the historic structures remain clearly visible from the street. Painter's 2019, report also indicates that although the West End Preservation District is mostly single-family homes, the site is located at the boundary of the District, is separated by DeTurk Park, and is adjacent to other commercial uses and the SMART Rail. The reports conclude that, in terms of height, the proposed apartment buildings are compatible with the historic winery and the West End Preservation District.

The project includes a Density Bonus, pursuant to both Zoning Code Section 20-31.090(B) and State Density Bonus Regulations (Gov Code § 65915 et seq) because this housing developer is electing to construct units for very-low income occupants, the project is entitled to two concessions. The applicant is requesting one concession pertaining to the height of the building and one concession for relief from the dispersion requirements. The project requires a lot merger and does not propose to create new parcels.

Zoning Code Section 20-31.090(B) requires the City to grant the concession requested by the applicant unless the City can make a written finding, based on substantial evidence, of any other following:

- The Concession or Incentive does not result in identifiable and actual cost reductions, as defined in California Government Code Section 65915, to provide for affordable housing costs or for rents for the targeted units as specified in Section 20- 31.060 (State Density Bonus).
- The Concession or Incentive would have a specific, adverse impact, as defined in paragraph (2) of subdivision (d) of California Government Code Section 65589.5 or Section 20- 31. 020 (Definitions), upon public health and safety or the physical environment or on any real property that is listed in the California Register of Historical Resources and for which there is no feasible method to satisfactorily mitigate or avoid the specific, adverse impact without rendering the development unaffordable to low-income and moderate -income households.
- The incentive or concession would be contrary to State or Federal law.

The Zoning Administrator (ZA) will act on the requested Density Bonus. The ZA's action will be on the Density Bonus and the two Concessions pertaining to the height of the buildings and the dispersion requirement. Zoning Code Section 20-31.100(H)(2) allows applicants to utilize an available Concession or Incentive for relief from the dispersion requirements of the Density Bonus Ordinance if supporting evidence is provided to the Director demonstrating that the dispersal requirement reduces the financing feasibility of the project. Therefore, the Concessions for height and dispersion are not being reviewed by the DRB and CHB as part of this Project.

Parking

Parking requirements have been calculated using a hybrid of City and State

regulations. In total, DeTurk Winery Village must provide 152 spaces, broken down as follows:

- Through a request for Density Bonus, the 185-unit project will designate 15 units for very-low income occupants. Pursuant to State Law (Gov Code §65915(p)(2)), the required parking for the residential portion of this project is 0.5 spaces per bedroom, totaling 115 spaces. These spaces are provided in off-street locations.
- The project includes approximately 18,600 square feet of commercial space. West End Fitness & Sport Center currently operates within that space. An 18% parking reduction was previously granted for the gym reducing the parking requirement to 17 spaces (reference CUP13-049, attached). At the time of approval, West End Fitness & Sport Center occupied 12,500 square feet in Building C.
- Zoning Code Section 20-36 (Table 3-4) requires non-residential uses within the Railroad Corridor Sub-Area to provide one parking space for every 300 square feet of operating space. This standard was applied to the remaining 6,100 square feet of commercial space requiring another 20 parking spaces.

Staff response: The project provides 164 parking spaces, which exceeds the parking requirements as shown above by 12 spaces. Shown in the table below, there are 122 off-street spaces which will be designated solely for residential uses. There are 42 on-street spaces, 10 more than currently available, which will be designated for public use including gym members.

Land Use	Required by	Required Spaces	Available Spaces	Location of Spaces
Residential	Gov Code §65915(p)(2)	115	122	Off-street (59 in Building D; and 63 Building C)
Existing Gym (12,500 SF)	CUP13-049	17	17	On-street
Existing Gym (6,100SF)	Zoning Code Table 3-4	20	25	On-street

Zoning Code Section 20-36.050(C)(4)(c) encourages alternative solutions to meeting parking requirements for development within the DSASP boundary. The project also incorporates the following alternative measures, which are intended to reduce parking demand:

- There will be four community vehicles available for residential occupants of DeTurk Winery Village. There will be no charge to residents for the use of these vehicles. They will be parked in the off-street residential spaces.

- Parking spaces will be unbundled from residential units. Unbundled parking spaces are spaces that are separated from the cost of housing, meaning that residents with no vehicles would realize a cost savings by not leasing a parking space.
- There are 42 parking spaces along the east side of Donahue Street. These spaces are within the project boundary and meet the City's parking requirement. The applicant will provide a public access easement over this area and all 42 spaces will be available to the public on a first come, first serve basis. These spaces will be restricted to 2-hour parking Monday through Friday, 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m., and will have unrestricted parking at night time and on weekends.

A Traffic and Parking Study, prepared by W-Trans, dated September 27, 2016, for the previously approved project and concluded that with the incorporation of these programs, parking demand is met. Additionally, Staff compared the parking requirements between the proposed and previously approved projects and found that the findings from the W-Trans Traffic and Parking Study, dated September 27, 2016, were sufficient because the same number of total units and the same number of affordable units are the same as the previously approved project.

Lot Coverage and Landscaping

Development within the TV-R zoning district is allowed at 100% lot coverage. All landscaping must comply with the City's Water Efficient Landscape Ordinance (WELO).

4. Design Guidelines

Design related policies from the Specific Plan have been incorporated into the Core Area section of the Design Guidelines. Listed below are applicable Design Goals and Guidelines which apply to the proposed project, and are not otherwise discussed the General Plan, DSASP, Zoning Code or Historic Preservation Review Standards sections of this report.

Core Area

- 2.1.1 Encourage dense development in the downtown station area.
- 2.1.3 A Projects should be planned to minimize increased use of neighborhood streets. Where possible, parking, loading and other vehicular access should occur at mid-block or alley.
- 2.1.5 Honor the authenticity and maintain the value of old buildings by directing additions, renovation and new construction to reflect the era in which they are constructed.
- 2.1.5 A Additions, renovations, and new buildings should be designed in such a way that they do not appear to have been built earlier than they were. This does not preclude the use of materials, scale, or massing found in older buildings.

- 2.1.6 A Development in the Downtown should respond to adjacent historically zoned buildings and avoid creating awkward or incompatible design solutions.
- 2.1.6 B Compatible design need not be created through historic replication, but should reflect a consideration of the materials, scale and massing of the adjacent historic buildings.
- 2.1.7 A Roofs should be designed and constructed in such a way that they acknowledge their visibility from other buildings in the downtown. Mechanical equipment should be screened when visible from the street or from other nearby buildings.
- 2.1.8 Control onsite surface parking.
- 2.1.8 C Locate building entrance at the street sidewalk and not adjacent to the parking lot.
- 2.1.12 C The Railroad Corridor Sub-Area is the area historically influenced by commercial railway operation, but is envisioned be a diverse mix of multi-family housing, live-work and mixed use residential.
- 2.2.2 Provide generous street-level windows.
- 2.2.10 Promote the continued planting of trees.
- 2.3.4 C Primary building entrances should be accentuated. These entrances should be designed so that they are not easily confused with entrances to ground level businesses.
- 2.3.5 B Care should be taken to avoid nostalgic reproductions and use the materials in a meaningful manner.
- 2.3.6 C Above ground parking should be designed in such a way that neighboring buildings are not adversely affected by headlights.
- 2.3.7 C Use high quality, durable and low maintenance materials in downtown buildings. This is particularly true of the first floor, where heavy use can damage materials and finishes. Preferred materials include: tile, brick, split faced concrete block, concrete cementitious horizontal siding, masonry veneer, and powder coated aluminum or traditional wood storefronts.
- 2.4.1 Design buildings to be sensitive to the neighborhood with regard to scale, architectural style, use or materials, bulk and historic context. This is especially important in designated historic districts.
- 2.4.2 Design new development in historic preservation districts to be compatible with existing structures.

Neighborhood Design

- 1.1 I C Promote neighborhoods that feature a variety of housing types (both single-family and multiple-family) as well as a variety of price ranges.

- 1.1 II A 5 Incorporate a range of residential densities and price ranges within a neighborhood. While remaining consistent with General Plan density requirements, providing a range of housing opportunities supports affordable housing goals as well as creating more interesting neighborhoods.

Multi-Family Residential

- 3.2 I D Encourage multi-family projects which are safe, contribute to safer neighborhoods, and support Police and Fire Department efforts to promote public safety.
- 3.2 II A 5 When existing public amenities such as parks or school playgrounds are in the immediate vicinity, provide pedestrian access to take advantage of these features.
- 3.2 II B 4 Integrate multi-family developments with surrounding neighborhoods as opposed to isolating this housing. Include vehicular connections between new projects and adjacent neighborhoods in an indirect pattern.

Building Design

- 3.2 III A 1 Break up the mass of larger structures with articulation of the form, use of color and the use of multiple materials.
- 3.2 III A 4 Avoid dressing up fronts of building with higher quality materials and switching to less expensive siding material on the sides and back. Design all four sides of buildings.
- 3.2.III A 5 Within mixed income developments, provide the same level of detailing and materials on the affordable units as on the market rate units.
- 3.2 III C 1 Incorporate features such as balconies, cantilevers, dormers, bay windows, patios, entries, accent materials, etc. to provide articulation and interest.
- 3.2.III E 2 Locate garages so as to minimize their impact from the public street. The main building should be the dominant visual statement along the public street.
- 3.3 II B 13 In a development with a large off-street parking area, clearly demarcate entrance to the parking area. Where there is a high traffic density, provide sufficient number of entrances and exits to avoid traffic bottlenecks, but at the same do not provide an excessive number which may a negative impact on pedestrian and bicycle traffic.
- 3.3 II D 2 When residential uses are combined with commercial uses, care should be taken to ensure adjacent uses will be compatible.
- 3.3 III A 5 For facades greater than 50 feet in length, incorporate significant wall

plane projections or recesses to reduce the massive and uniform look typical of these types of projects.

3.3 III A 11 Include features that articulate upper floor wall plane, such as windows, balconies, and awnings.

3.3 III A 15 Develop a sense of architectural continuity, but all elevations need not be identical.

Historic Districts

4.7 A Preserve Santa Rosa's historic heritage.

4.7 E Assist property owners and designers in developing plans for historic properties and to encourage the compatibility of new structures in historic districts, and having those plans approved by the City.

Staff response: The subject site is located within one-half mile of the Downtown SMART station adjacent to the rail tracks, in an area designated by the General Plan for increased density. It is currently developed with the DeTurk Winery complex made up of the historical DeTurk Winery and U.S. Bonded Warehouse structure.

On January 17, 2019, the applicant came before the DRB and CHB at a Joint Concept Design Review meeting at which point both boards provided direction to the project proponents. Discussion points included: clarification in the Cultural Resource Survey, particularly the typo regarding Building C being mentioned with a fourth-floor addition, and whether or not the site is eligible for national registry as a historic site and cultural resource for CEQA purposes; color of metal siding on the fourth-floor and if the applicant would consider a darker color; a more robust landscape plan; detailed materials for courtyard and other street level areas; and parking count.

The site is separated from the predominantly single-family residential West End neighborhood by DeTurk Park and DeTurk Round Barn. The project will result in the construction of 185 one- and two-bedroom units, of which 15 will be designated for very low-income residents. As discussed in the Historical Evaluations, prepared by Susan Clark, dated September 2016, and Diana Painter, dated April 2019, the proposed materials and design reflect the industrial character of the historic Donahue Street.

Where possible, the design offers street-level windows. Due to the preservation of the onsite historic structures, there are some areas where ground level glazing was not an option. The primary entrance to building D is accentuated by a landscaped area.

There are two off-street parking areas. The primary garage (59 spaces) is located on the ground floor of Building D between residential units that front onto Donahue Street and the SMART rail tracks. Access is taken to this lot from two locations. One entrance is located on W. 9th Street and, due to its proximity to the rail tracks, will be limited to right in/right out only. To minimize the glare from headlights, the second access point is located mid-block along Donahue Street,

south of Decker Street. The remainder of the off-street parking is a garage (63 spaces) located on the first floor of Building C, and takes access from Donahue Street, mid-block just south of Boyce Street. The parking garage located in Buildings C and D are connected with drive aisles through both buildings providing more circulation throughout the site.

A Vacation of Public Right-of-way for a 18,725 square foot stretch of street along the east side of Donahue Street has been approved (RES-2017-070). The area being vacated will be improved with 42 on-street parking spaces, 10 more than are currently available. These parking spaces will be designated for public use with restricted hours as discussed in the Zoning section of this report.

There are several small landscaped areas surrounding the building including at the primary entrance, entries to individual units, and tree wells along the sidewalk. In an effort to maximize landscaped surfaces, the project includes planted areas on the podium level and on the roof. The applicant has also included more landscaping on the street frontage.

Bicycle parking, additional storage and community trash receptacles are located in Buildings A, C, and D.

5. Historic Preservation Review Standards

The General Plan, DSASP, Zoning and Design Review sections of this report include discussion that addresses Historic Preservation. For reference, this section will focus on items not previously addressed.

The West End Preservation District was designated by the City Council on August 13, 1996. The period of significance is the 1870s through the 1940s. Character defining elements include a predominantly single-family residential neighborhood made up of single-story vernacular houses on narrow, deep lots. The most common architecture represented are bungalows and Queen Anne or Colonial cottages. The neighborhood also includes a mix of commercial buildings including Stark's Steakhouse, Western Farm Center, CHOPS, and DeTurk Round Barn.

Applicable historic review guidelines for the project include:

Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties

- I.G.1 Height – The height of new construction should be compatible with adjacent structures.
- I.G.2 Proportion – New construction should match adjacent structures in proportions of width and height.
- I.G.5 Materials and Texture – New construction should be compatible with adjacent buildings on the block.
- I.G.7 Architectural Details and Decorative Features – More successful new buildings take their clues from historic images and reintroduce and reinterpret designs of traditional decorative elements.

- I.O.1 Replacement windows and doors should retain the same configuration and details as the originals.
- I.O.5 Ideally, window and door openings should not be reduced or enlarged in size. Alterations to window and door openings should remain in proper proportion to the overall design of the building.
- I.O.6 Sensitively designed exceptions to these guidelines will be considered by the Cultural Heritage Board when such proposals are conceived to accommodate the adaptive reuse of older buildings or to conform to the provisions of the Americans with Disabilities Act.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards

Standards for Rehabilitation

- 2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive material or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- 5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
- 6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
- 8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
- 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Standards for Restoration

- 7. Materials and features from the restoration period will be retained and preserved. The removal of materials or alteration of features,

spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize the period will not be undertaken.

8. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.

Staff response: At the direction of the CHB and DRB during the January 17, 2019, Joint Concept Design Review meeting, the applicant has corrected the typo on Diana Painter's Historic Preservation Survey, dated November 28, 2018, where Building C was listed as gaining a fourth-floor addition with this project, and provided information regarding the site's eligibility for National Registry as a Historic Landmark.

To accommodate the new construction, internal portions of the winery and the cement block building located at 918 Donahue Street will be removed. A project involving a new addition to a historic building is considered acceptable within the framework of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards if it preserves significant historic material and features; preserves the historic character of the building; and protects the historic significance by making a visual distinction between old and new.

The project application includes a historic evaluation prepared by Susan Clark M.A., Architectural Historian, dated September 2016, and Diana Painter, PhD, dated April 2019, which addresses the standards listed above and provides a comprehensive list of historically significant character-defining features for the DeTurk Winery Building and the U.S. Bonded Warehouse.

Clark's report also discusses several alterations that have been made to the historic winery building that are not consistent with its historic integrity. Per the recommendations made by Clark and supported and/or amended by Painter, the following items have been included in the conditions of approval:

- Remove the blue stucco from exterior bricks;
- Where possible, reopen arched windows and doors that have been bricked in;
- Restore the original round windows on the south elevation;
- Remove metal roll up doors and replace with brick; and
- Appropriate repairs should be made to correct deterioration in masonry walls.

Clark (2016) and Painter's (2019) evaluations discuss the relationship to the nearby single-family residential West End neighborhood. While the proposed DeTurk Winery Village architecture shares virtually no common design features with these smaller homes, the report indicates that "the neighborhood park and the DeTurk Round Barn provide a buffer and make it possible for there to be residential development which is compatible with the prominent winery."

6. Neighborhood Comments

Additional comments from the previously approved project are included in the attachment titled "Public Correspondence."

Staff has not received any Public Correspondence regarding the proposed project as of the writing of this Staff Report.

7. Public Improvements/On-Site Improvements

The applicant will stripe 42 diagonal parking spaces, including two ADA spots, crosswalks, and ADA ramps.

The intersections at W. 8th Street and Donahue Street, and W. 9th Street and Donahue Street shall be improved to current City street standards.

A raised median will be installed along W. 9th Street to limit ingress/egress from the garage to right in/right out only.

Sidewalks along W. 9th Street and Donahue Street shall be improved to current City standards.

Existing contamination within Donahue Street will be remediated.

FISCAL IMPACT

The approval of this project will not result in any significant fiscal impacts. The Vacation of Public Right-of-way was approved and will convert 18,725 square feet of public ROW to taxable real property.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT

The project has been found in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

- The proposed project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The project is statutorily exempt from CEQA pursuant to Government Code Section 65457 in that the project would develop a residential land use that is undertaken to implement, and is consistent with, the Downtown Station Area Specific Plan. The EIR prepared for the Specific Plan was certified by the City Council on October 9, 2007 (Resolution No. 26949) and no events subsequent to certification have required a supplemental EIR pursuant to Public Resources Code section 21166.
- Pursuant to Section 15332, the project is exempt from CEQA as an In-fill Development.
 - It is consistent with the General Plan land use designation of Transit Village Medium (25-40 units per acre) and complies with the TV-R-H-SA zoning district requirements.
 - It occurs on site less than five acres within City limits, surrounded by

- urban uses.
 - The site has no value as habitat for endangered, rare or threatened species.
 - Approval of the project would not result in any significant effects relating to traffic, noise, air quality, or water quality that weren't previously considered in the scope of review of the DSASP Environmental Impact Report, certified by City Council Resolution No. 26949, dated October 9, 2007.
 - The site can be adequately served by all required utilities and public services.
- Pursuant to Section 15330, the project is exempt from CEQA in that it involves a minor cleanup effort to eliminate the threat of release of known contamination along Donahue Street through excavation and offsite disposal of contaminated soils.
 - Pursuant to Section 15331, the project is exempt from CEQA as maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation or reconstruction of historical resources, in that it involves restoration efforts to remove stucco from the exterior brick walls, replacement of the stepped parapet on the west face of the southerly winery building; open up arched windows and doors that were previously sealed up; and replacement in kind of extensively deteriorated or missing features/materials on the exterior masonry walls. In Historic Evaluations, prepared by Susan Clark, M.A., Architectural Historian, dated September 2016, and by Diana Painter, PhD, Architectural Historian, dated April 2019, these restoration efforts are recommended and have been found to be consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

BOARD/COMMISSION/COMMITTEE REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATIONS

On January 17, 2019, the DRB and CHB at a Joint Concept Design Review meeting at which point both boards provided direction to the project proponents. Discussion points included: clarification in the Cultural Resource Survey, how the Project relates to CEQA; and design elements requested by the Design Review Board.

NOTIFICATION

This item was noticed as a Public Hearing per the requirements of Chapter 20-66 as amended by City Council Ordinance CC-ORD-2019-003 of the City Code. Notification of this public hearing was provided by posting an on-site sign, publishing notice in a newspaper of general circulation, mailed notice to surrounding property owners and tenants within 600 feet of the project site, electronic notice to parties that had expressed interest in projects taking place in this geographic area of Santa Rosa, and bulletin board postings at City Hall and on the City website.

ISSUES

There are no remaining issues with this project.

ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1 – Disclosure Form
- Attachment 2 – Location Map
- Attachment 3 – Neighborhood Context Map
- Attachment 4 – Project Description
- Attachment 5 – Project Plans (including site plan, elevations, landscape plans,) dated received June 7, 2019
- Attachment 5a – Grading and Utility Plan
- Attachment 5b – Landscape Plans
- Attachment 5c – Architectural Set
- Attachment 6 – Shadow Study
- Attachment 7 – Affordable Units Exhibit
- Attachment 8 – Attachment 8 - Joint Concept DRB-CHB Minutes dated January 17, 2019
- Attachment 9 – Historic Evaluation, by Diana Painter, PhD, dated April 17, 2019
- Attachment 10 – Traffic & Parking Study from previously approved Project dated, September 27, 2016
- Attachment 11 – Resolution of Approval - CUP13-049
- Attachment 12 – Exhibit A, dated May 23, 2019
- Attachment 13 – Notice of Complete Application & Density Bonus Eligibility

- Resolution 1 – Landmark Alteration
- Resolution 2 – Preliminary Design Review

CONTACT

Adam Ross
City Planner
707-543-4705
aross@srcity.org