

Memorandum

date May 27, 2020

to Mr. Len Marabella, CEO, Catholic Charities

cc Bert Bangsberg, Project Manager; Theresa Ballard, Pyatok Architects; Tina Wallis, Esq.

from Amber Grady, ESA

subject Caritas Village Project – Design Review Memo

The Caritas Village Project site---which is bound by Seventh Street to the north, Morgan Street to the west, Sixth Street to the south and A Street to the east---is located within the southernmost portion of the St. Rose Historic Preservation District (District), a locally listed historic district in the City of Santa Rosa.

In accordance with mitigation measure **MM CUL-4: Compatible Design**, of the *Caritas Village Project EIR*, Environmental Science Associates (ESA) has been tasked with working with the design team to ensure that the proposed project meets the requirements of the City of Santa Rosa Design Guidelines, particularly those that apply to the St. Rose Historic Preservation District under *Section 2.4 Historic Districts within the Downtown Area and Station Area* and *Section 4.7: Historic Properties and Districts*. Amber Grady, a senior architectural historian that meets the Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualifications Standards, has prepared this document. QA/QC has been provided by Becky Urbano, a senior architectural historian that also meets the Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualifications Standards.

St. Rose Historic Preservation District

The following is quoted from the City's *Processing Review Procedures* and gives a brief summary describing the St. Rose Historic Preservation District:¹

The St. Rose Neighborhood includes a unique cross section of Santa Rosa's residential building types as well as a number of fine institutional and commercial buildings. The historic homes date from 1872 to the 1940's. Many of the homes, particularly the well maintained bungalows along Lincoln Street, were built in the 1920's for Santa Rosa's small business owners such as bakers, druggists, and salesmen as well as firemen, auto mechanics, foremen, farmers, and the City's treasurer. In addition, the District includes seven of Santa Rosa's grandest surviving 19th Century homes.

¹ City of Santa Rosa Department of Community Development, *Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties*, Adopted by City Council Resolution No. 24694 on January 9, 2001 (rev. September 2006).

The District grew up around the St. Rose Church, a Gothic Revival stone structure built by local Italian stone masons in 1900. Many of Santa Rosa’s finest 19th Century downtown homes were moved into the St. Rose neighborhood as the commercial areas of the City expanded. The Post Office (now the Sonoma County Museum) was moved from Fifth Street to its present site on Seventh Street in 1979.

The period of significance for the District is 1872-1948 and when it was originally surveyed in 1989 it included 96 contributors, 37 non-contributors, and five open spaces.² The 1989 Department of Parks and Recreation 523 D – District (DPR) form individually presented the neighborhoods around the St. Rose Church. The project site is part of the South St. Rose District. The South St. Rose District is a subarea within the larger St. Rose Historic Preservation District boundary and appears to include the area bound by Ninth (north), Morgan (west), Seventh (south), and B (both sides) (east) streets. The majority of B Street is commercial, but a few residences are present.

St. Rose Historic Preservation District Character-Defining Features

The National Parks Service (NPS) provides guidance on a number of technical topics related to historic resources in the form of Preservation Briefs.³ Each resource is unique, with its own distinctive visual character. As such, NPS Preservation Brief 17 was created to provide guidance in identifying and defining those visual aspects and physical features that comprise a resource’s appearance. These visual aspects and physical features are referred to as character-defining features. Below are the character-defining features that have been identified for the St. Rose Historic Preservation District. This is not intended to be a comprehensive list for the entire District, but focuses first on those overall CDFs followed by those that are present throughout a set of subareas that were examined in relation to the proposed project including the residential of the South St. Rose District and commercial and institutional buildings.

District-Wide Character-Defining Features

- Irregular street pattern
- St. Rose Church is central and flanked to the north and south by distinct residential neighborhoods

Residential – South St. Rose District – Character-Defining Features

The residential development is primarily located along Morgan, A, and Eighth streets and was constructed between 1870 and 1924.

- One- to two-and-a-half-story single and multi-family homes.
- Variety of architectural styles including: 1930s track type, 19c Vernacular, Bungalow, Craftsman, Colonial Revival, Gothic Revival, Italianate, Mediterranean Revival, Prairie School, Provincial, Queen Anne, and Stick/Eastlake.⁴
- Narrow, rectangular lots with modest front yard setbacks and larger rear yards.
- Gabled, hipped and flat roof types

² Bloomfield, Anne, *St. Rose Local District Department of Parks and Recreation Historic Resources Inventory*, July 1989.

³ <https://www.nps.gov/tps/education/online-pubs.htm>

⁴ Bloomfield, Anne, *St. Rose Local District Department of Parks and Recreation Historic Resources Inventory*, July 1989.

- Landscaping including mature trees.
- Sidewalks (with or without narrow strip of landscaping between street and the sidewalk).

Commercial Character-Defining Features

The three commercial developments are located along B Street and Healdsburg Avenue near 10th Street and were constructed between 1937 and 1940.

- Uniformity of architectural styling, Art Deco Style
- Mid-rise

Institutional Character-Defining Features

The institutional development is primarily comprised of the buildings associated with the St. Rose Church--- located between 9th, 10th, B, and Washington Streets. All of the institutional properties within the District were constructed between 1900-1931.

- A variety of architectural styles including: Colonial Revival, Craftsman, Mediterranean Revival, Romanesque

Consistency Analysis

The project site is located at the southern end of the District on a block that is surrounded on three sides by blocks or developments that are not part of the District. Hwy 101 is to the west while the Santa Rosa Plaza borders the east and south of the project site; these are modern buildings and structures and are outside of the district boundaries. Therefore, how the new building relates to the contributing buildings along Seventh Street is the most critical as this Seventh Street façade of the proposed Caritas Homes would directly face contributing buildings of the St. Rose Historic Preservation District to the north. This block of the District between Morgan and A streets is dominated by single and multi-family homes in a variety of architectural styles. The majority of these homes are two story with gabled or hipped roofs. Directly across from the project site there is currently a community garden that covers two lots at the northwest corner of Seventh and A streets and the secondary (south) façade of a home at the northeast corner of Seventh and Morgan.

City of Santa Rosa Design Guidelines

The proposed project is required to be consistent with the City of Santa Rosa Design Guidelines. Applicable portions include *Section 2.4: Historic Districts within the Downtown Area and Station Area* and *Section 4.7: Historic Properties and Districts*. The following provides the relevant text of those two sections followed by an analysis of the proposed project’s consistency with each.

Section 2.4: Historic Districts within the Downtown Area and Station Area⁵

Goal 2.4.1: Design buildings to be sensitive to the neighborhood with regard to scale, architectural style, use or materials, bulk and historic context. This is especially important in designated historic districts.

Guidelines

- A. A particular architectural style or design is not specified; however, the scale, mass and size of the building are often more important than the decorative details which are applied.
- B. Setbacks should be carefully considered in relationship to adjacent structures.
- C. Designs should be compatible with the historic buildings in terms of mass, materials, color, proportions, and spacing of windows and doors. Refer also to Section 4.7 (Historic Districts).

Goal 2.4.2: Design new development in and adjacent to historic preservation districts to be compatible with existing structures.

Guidelines

- B. New development adjacent to the St. Rose and West End historic neighborhoods should be compatible in height and scale with existing structures.

Analysis

Section 2.4: Historic Districts within the Downtown Area and Stations Area of the City of Santa Rosa Design Guidelines includes two goals and their associated guidelines, listed above, that are applicable to the proposed project. The intent of these guidelines is to produce new buildings that are compatible with, and sensitive to, the existing buildings and structures in the District. The guidelines provide direction with regards to scale and proportions, mass, size and height, setbacks, color, materials, and spacing of windows and doors.

The Seventh Street façade has been designed to reflect the scale, proportions, and massing of a block of single family homes. This façade is divided into two and three story bays that each include one-story, covered patios facing Seventh Street and window and door spacing that is similar to the patterns and proportions of the district-contributing homes to the north. The 3+ story portions of the building are set back and divided to read as separate buildings behind a row of single family homes. Since the District is a mix of residential, commercial, and institutional architectural types mixed with single blocks this aesthetic is in keeping with a typical view from within the District.

While the guidelines do not specify an architectural style there are certain architectural elements that are prevalent in the residential portion of the South St. Rose District and on the more prominent buildings, including the St. Rose Church, Rectory, and School as well as the Post Office and Federal Building (now Museum of Sonoma County), that have been included to provide continuity. For example, the dominate roof type for residential buildings in the surrounding blocks is hipped or gabled. The Seventh Street façade also uses hipped roof forms on many of the corner building units, which is in keeping with one of the prevalent roof types for homes in the South St. Rose District. Ground floor, one-story patios will also be covered with hipped roofs and present a similar aesthetic to the front/entry porches of the homes to the north of the project site. The patios also include wood railing and beams, which is consistent with the material use on the historic homes. Siding materials

⁵ *City of Santa Rosa Design Guidelines: Section 2.4 Historic Districts within the Downtown Area and Station Area*, August 2010, <https://srcity.org/368/Design-Guidelines>.

for the proposed project include stucco and horizontal siding, which are common materials found throughout the District. The St. Rose Rectory and School and the Post Office and Federal Building are clad in stucco making this the dominant wall surface for the larger scale buildings in the District. Craftsman style accents have been included in the design including exposed beams in soffits, wood patio fences and tile accents. The Craftsman architectural style is represented through the District and these architectural elements of the proposed project created a visual connection, a consistency, with those Craftsman style historic resources.

The guidelines do not specify color; however, it is important to note that three different colors are proposed for the Seventh Street façade to further “articulate” this façade so that it reads as multiple adjacent buildings as opposed to a single monolith. The building setback required by the utility easement is planted with landscaping, which is in keeping with the front yard setback of the apartment building (Norma Apartments – 442 B Street) as well as the side yard setbacks of the single family homes. As indicated in the Landscape Site Plan and Planting Candidate List, the landscaping will be a variety of plants and trees, located between the buildings and the public sidewalk, which will provide additional continuity between the project and the surrounding District. A linear courtyard between the two phases of housing maintains the existing mid-block alley that extends north-south, a common element in the District.

Additionally, Goal 2.4.1 includes sensitivity to historic context. It should be noted the District has always included a wide variety of uses with single and multi-family residential, institutional (church, school, etc.), and commercial (medical office buildings).

Section 4.7: Historic Properties and Districts⁶

III. Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts

General design guidelines that apply to all historic structures and neighborhoods have been adopted by the City and are summarized in the following document: “Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties.” It is available at the Department of Community Development. The Secretary of Interior’s “Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings” is a primary reference source used by the Cultural Heritage Board of Santa Rosa to evaluate development proposals and was a reference in developing the guidelines below. A summary of the “Standards” is included in the Appendix. The full document is identified in the Reference Section.

Design review is the process whereby proposed changes to historic properties (generally buildings older than 50 years) are reviewed by the Cultural Heritage Board or Design Review Board to ensure that the historic character of the structure and the neighborhood is maintained. Generally, projects that result in changes to historic buildings need to be reviewed by the City. Examples of such projects are restoration, rehabilitation, alteration, new construction, relocation, and demolition.

The design guidelines apply to all designated landmarks, all existing and proposed new structures located within preservation districts, all commercial projects adjacent to districts, and all historic

⁶ *City of Santa Rosa Design Guidelines: Section 4.7 Historic Properties and Districts*, August 2010, <https://srcity.org/368/Design-Guidelines>.

commercial buildings located anywhere in the City of Santa Rosa. Commercial buildings are defined as duplexes, multiple residential structures, retail buildings, offices, warehouses, institutional buildings, etc.

G. New Construction

1. Design new construction so that the architectural character of the neighborhood is maintained. Specific architectural styles are not mandated. Designs for new construction can also be contemporary.
2. Design new construction to be compatible in height and proportion with adjacent structures.
3. Use materials and designs similar to that found throughout the neighborhood.

Analysis

Section 4.7: Historic Properties and Districts of the City of Santa Rosa Design Guidelines includes three topics related to new construction, listed above: architectural character, height and proportion, and materials and design. In order to be compatible with the architectural character of the neighborhood the project has been designed to reflect architectural modulation found in a row of single family homes. On the Seventh Street Façade this aesthetic is created through varied massing (two and three story bays with the 3+ story portion of the building set back from Seventh Street), inclusion of one story covered patios facing the street, use of the hipped roof shapes (a dominate type in the South St. Rose District), fenestration patterns and proportions (window and door spacing) that relate to the surrounding residential buildings, and use of a varied color and materials palette, as described above, to provided consistency with the architectural style of the District and further visually break up the façade.

Summary

The proposed project is required to be consistent with the City of Santa Rosa Design Guidelines including *Section 2.4: Historic Districts within the Downtown Area and Station Area* and *Section 4.7: Historic Properties and Districts*. The above analysis has concluded that the proposed project has been sensitively designed given its location within the St. Rose Preservation Historic District and is consistent with the Sections 2.4 and 4.7 of the City of Santa Rosa Design Guidelines.

References

Bloomfield, Anne, St. Rose Local District Department of Parks and Recreation Historic Resources Inventory, July 1989.

City of Santa Rosa Design Guidelines (Sections 2.4 Historic Districts within the Downtown Area and Station Area and 4.7 Historic Properties and Districts), August 2010, <https://srcity.org/368/Design-Guidelines>.

City of Santa Rosa Department of Community Development, Processing Review Procedures for owners of historic properties, Adopted by City Council Resolution No. 24694 on January 9, 2001 (rev. September 2006).