

CITY OF SANTA ROSA  
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT  
STAFF REPORT FOR CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD  
**FEBRUARY 19, 2020**

**PROJECT TITLE**

Bayer Shed, Fence, and Arbor

**ADDRESS/LOCATION**

832 Tupper Street

**ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBER**

009-253-008

**APPLICATION DATE**

July 17, 2019

**REQUESTED ENTITLEMENTS**

Landmark Alteration Permit

**PROJECT SITE ZONING**

R-3-18-H (Multi-Family Residential, within the Historic Combining district.)

**PROJECT PLANNER**

Monet Sheikhal

**APPLICANT**

Chris Bayer

**PROPERTY OWNER**

Christopher W Bayer

**FILE NUMBER**

LMA19-012

**APPLICATION COMPLETION DATE**

July 17, 2019

**FURTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED**

Building Permit

**GENERAL PLAN DESIGNATION**

Medium Density Residential

**RECOMMENDATION**

Approval

Agenda Item #6.1  
For Cultural Heritage Board Meeting of February 19, 2020

CITY OF SANTA ROSA  
CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD

TO: CHAIR EDMONDSON AND MEMBERS OF THE BOARD

FROM: MONET SHEIKHALI, CITY PLANNER  
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

SUBJECT: BAYER SHED, FENCE AND ARBOR

AGENDA ACTION: RESOLUTION

---

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended by the Planning and Economic Development Department that the Cultural Heritage Board, by resolution, approve a Landmark Alteration Permit for a new fence, arbor and shed for the property located at 832 Tupper Street, Assessor's Parcel No. 009-253-008.

---

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The proposed project involves a Landmark Alteration Permit to legalize a newly constructed fence and arbor located within the front setback along Tupper Street. The height of the fence range is from 43.5 to 47.5 inches and the height of the arbor is eight feet at the center.

The applicant is also proposing to build a 120-square foot storage shed on the east side of the property. The shed will be set back 18 feet from the front of the property, measured from the back of the sidewalk, and two feet from the side property line. The front of the storage shed will be parallel with the front of the house.

BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The subject property is located on the south side of Tupper Street in the Burbank Gardens Preservation District. The parcel is currently developed with a single-family home, which is considered a contributor to the Burbank Gardens Preservation District. There is conflicting information as to when the house was built. The Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) Primary Record shows the house was built in 1933 and the City's GIS system shows the house was built in 1923. The house is classified as Bungalow on the Primary Record as shown on the attached DPR Form.

The project requires a Landmark Alteration Permit to legalize the approximately four-foot fence and eight-foot arbor. Fence and arbor materials include cedar wood pickets and posts. The arbor will be set back 18-inch from the sidewalk to ensure that any overhang from the arbor eaves are not crossing the property line. The front fencing rails would then be attached to the arbor posts at a slight angle. The driveway will have two gates made from the same cedar pickets, which will open inward. Hinges, latches, and fence rail brackets will all be black metal.

The applicant is also requesting a setback reduction for the proposed storage shed. The required setbacks for an accessory structure in R-3-18 zoning district is 20 feet for the front setback and 5 feet for the side setback. The proposed storage shed will be placed 18 feet from the back of the sidewalk and 2 feet from the side of the property line.

The storage shed will be built to match the exiting house and garage. Some of the aesthetic features of the storage shed will include a pitched roof (to coordinate with the pitch of the roof on the house and garage), original restored craftsman wood door and windows, cedar lap siding, and eaves and shingle roofing.

2. Surrounding Land Uses

The parcel is surrounded by properties developed with similar residential uses.

3. Existing Land Use – Project Site

The subject property is developed with a single-family dwelling.

4. Project History

On July 17, 2019, Planning and Economic Development accepted the subject application requesting a Landmark Alteration Permit for the proposed fence, arbor and storage shed.

PRIOR CITY COUNCIL REVIEW

Not applicable.

ANALYSIS

1. General Plan

The General Plan land use designation for the site is Medium Density Residential, which allows residential development at a density of 8 to 18 units per acre and is intended primarily for multi-family residential development. General Plan Goal HP-B provides direction to preserve Santa Rosa's historic structures and neighborhoods.

2. Priority Development Areas

Not applicable.

3. Zoning

The subject property is located within the Burbank Gardens Preservation District and it is zoned R-3-18-H (multi-family residential-combining district), which is consistent with the General Plan land use designation. Zoning Code Chapter 20-28 discusses preservation districts. The Burbank Gardens Preservation District was established on March 25, 2003, and identifies 1875 through the 1940s as the period of significance. Pursuant to Zoning Code Section 20-28.040(K) character defining elements of the district include small single-family homes, predominately Bungalows, which represents the bulk of development that occurred in the 1920s and 1930s. Other types of architecture within the district include Italianate, Queen Anne, Colonial, Period Revival, and some post war styles. In addition to architecture, Cultural Heritage Board Resolution No. 209, dated March 15, 2006 (attached), adds hardscape, landscape and site planning as potential character defining elements.

Pursuant to Zoning Code Section 20-58.060 (Landmark Alteration Permits), an approved Landmark Alteration Permit is required for a reduction in storage shed setbacks, fence height exceeding 3 feet, and the proposed arbor. Prior to taking action, the Cultural Heritage Board is required to consider the following criteria, provided in Zoning Code Chapter 20-58.060, in determining whether to grant or deny the permit.

- The consistency, or lack thereof, of the proposed change with the original architectural style and details of the building;
- The compatibility of the proposed change with any adjacent or nearby landmark structures or preservation district structures;
- The consistency and/or compatibility of the proposed colors, textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features and details with the time period of the building's construction, and/or adjacent structures;
- Whether the proposed change will destroy or adversely affect an important architectural feature or features;
- The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (1983 Revision); and
- Other matters, criteria and standards as may be adopted by resolution of the CHB.

Section 20-28.040 from Zoning Code allows setback reductions for properties that are located within historic districts. Per this section the purpose for the setback reduction is because the historic development pattern is a unique and defining feature in each of the City's preservation districts and on each landmark property. Standard setback requirements may not be sensitive to such unique

attributes and therefore it is important to allow flexibility in determining appropriate setbacks to preserve and enhance existing conditions or character.

Reduced setbacks may be applied to development within a designated preservation district or on a designated local landmark. The reduced setback may be applied to new buildings as well as the addition or expansion of an existing building. A reduction of setbacks required by the primary zoning district may be approved provided that:

- (1) The review authority first finds that the reduced setback will not significantly impair the residential privacy of the proposed structures or any adjacent existing or anticipated residential structures or use; and
- (2) The review authority first finds that the reduced setback enhances and protects the historic development pattern of the preservation district or any adjacent contributing properties and that approving a reduced setback facilitates a superior project.

4. Design Guidelines

The following are the goals outlined in the Historic Properties and Districts section of the Santa Rosa Design Guidelines (page 4.7-1):

- A. To preserve Santa Rosa's historic heritage.
- B. To encourage maintenance and retention of historic structures and districts.
- C. To ensure that alterations to historic buildings are compatible with the character of the structure and the neighborhood.
- D. To discourage the demolition of significant historic structures.
- E. To assist property owners and designers in developing plans for historic properties and to encourage the compatibility of new structures in historic districts, and having those plans approved by the City.

The following are the specific guidelines outlined in the Historic Properties and Districts section of the Santa Rosa Design Guidelines:

Accessory Buildings (page 4.7-3)

1. Locate a new garage, carport, or accessory building to the side or rear of the property, wherever possible.
2. Derive accessory building designs and details from the same era as the main structure. The details can be less elaborate than those found on the main structure.
3. Design an accessory building to be in proper scale for the property and have an appropriate site relation to the main structure as well as surrounding structures.

Fences (page 4.7-5)

1. Design new fences to be compatible with the architectural style, material, scale, and era of the main building or neighborhood.
2. Fencing should not obscure the front elevation of the primary structure on the property.

#### 4. Historic Preservation Review Standards

There are several guidelines pertaining to the construction of accessory structures, additions to the existing structures and design/placement of fences on historic properties. Listed below is a summary of those guidelines as they pertain to this project; a comprehensive list can be viewed at Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties.

##### Section A – Accessory Buildings

- A new garage, carport, or accessory building should be located to the side or rear of the property, wherever possible.
- A new garage, carport, or accessory building visible from the street should be constructed of materials that are in keeping with the main building on the lot.
- The design for a new garage, carport, or accessory building visible from the street should be inspired by the main building. Building details should be derived from the main structure but can be less elaborate than the main structure.
- A new garage, carport, or accessory building should be in proper scale for the property and have an appropriate site relation to the main structure as well as surrounding structures.

##### Section D – Fences

- Fencing materials and design should be compatible with the architectural style of the primary structure on the lot.
- For picket fences, the height of the support posts cannot exceed 36 inches above grade, and the recommended height of the pickets is 30 inches.
- Wooden fences should be painted or stained to match or to be compatible with the house and the neighborhood.
- Structural members of a fence should be turned in to face the property. The finished side of the fence should be presented to the street.
- Fencing should not obscure the front elevation of the primary structure on the property. Therefore, front yard privacy fences should not be allowed.

The 43.5-inch pickets with 47.5-inch posts and eight-foot seven-inch arbor is constructed of cedar and will not block the street-facing elevations of the home. The Arbor will be used for front entry way and is designed for use by Craftsman style homeowners. The property is within the Burbank Gardens Historic District

and there are similar fences and arbors in height and style throughout the neighborhood. The proposed fence and arbor are compatible with the house and the surrounding neighborhood.

The new 120 square foot storage shed will be placed on the east side of the property, aligned with and behind the front of the house. The storage will be setback two-feet from the side and 18-feet from the front property line. It will be constructed with cedar siding to match the existing house siding and will have similar aesthetic features of the main house, such as a pitched roof, eaves, shingle and all wood Craftsman style window and door. Also, it will be painted to match with the main house and the garage.

The reduced side and front setbacks for the storage shed will not significantly impair the residential privacy of the adjacent property. The storage shed will be approximately 25-feet away from the residential structure on the east side. The reduced setbacks at the front of the property will protect historic development pattern of the Burbank Garden Historic District.

The reduced front yard setback mirrors the historic development pattern on the property and along the street and is consistent with the adjacent contributing property. The proposed accessory structure location and design will result in a superior project.

#### **Secretary of the Interior – Standards for Rehabilitation**

Since the fence will not be touching or connected to the main house, the historic value of the building will not be diminished. The proposed fences, arbor, and storage shed will not obscure the structure, although they will change the appearance of the site as viewed from Tupper Street.

The project is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (1983 Revision) in that the proposed fence and storage shed will not alter any historic materials, features, and special relationships that characterize the property.

#### 5. Neighborhood Comments

No neighborhood comments have been received.

#### 6. Public Improvements/On-Site Improvements

The project has not been conditioned to require any onsite or offsite improvements.

#### FISCAL IMPACT

Approval of this action does not have a fiscal impact on the General Fund.

#### ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT

The proposed project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and qualifies for a Class 3 Section 15303 in that it involves the construction of a small accessory structures for an existing residence.

BOARD/COMMISSION/COMMITTEE REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Not applicable.

NOTIFICATION

The public hearing was noticed pursuant to Zoning Code Chapter 20-66. Public notification was provided by posting two onsite signs, publishing a notice in the Press Democrat, mailing a notice to property owners and occupants within 600 feet of the subject property, and bulletin board postings at City Hall and on the City website.

Pursuant to Government Code Section 65091, where necessary, the City has incorporated notice procedures to the blind, aged, and disabled communities. These procedures include audio amplifier/assistive listening device support at public meetings, closed captioning, and optical character recognition conversion of electronic notices.

ISSUES

No issues were identified during staff's review of the project materials.

ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1: Disclosure Form
- Attachment 2: Location Map
- Attachment 3: DPR, Primary Record
- Attachment 4: Project Description
- Attachment 5: Site Plan Dated Received July 17, 2019
- Attachment 6: Proposed Fence and Arbor
- Attachment 7: Proposed Storage Shed

Resolution 1: Landmark Alteration Permit

CONTACT

Monet Sheikhal, City Planner  
[msheikhali@srcity.org](mailto:msheikhali@srcity.org)  
707-543-4698