

DRAFT

**SANTA ROSA
DESIGN REVIEW BOARD/CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD
SPECIAL JOINT MEETING MINUTES
CITY HALL, 100 SANTA ROSA AVENUE
NOVEMBER 3, 2016**

5 P.M. (CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS)

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Chair Burch called the meeting to order at 5:07 p.m.

Design Review Board Members Present: Chair Burch; Board Members Anderson, Grogan, Sunderlage, Kincaid (arrived 5:17pm.) Absent: Hedgpeth, Zucco (abstained prior)

Cultural Heritage Board Members Present: Chair De Shazo; Board Members Purser, DeBacker, Garrett, Murphey. Absent: Galantine, Fennell

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

August 18, 2016 Special Joint Meeting Minutes (Cultural Heritage Board Only.)

Approved by Design Review Board on September 1, 2016.)

Approved as amended.

October 6, 2016 Special Joint Meeting Minutes (Design Review Board and Cultural Heritage Board)

Approved as amended.

October 20, 2016 Regular Meeting Minutes (Design Review Board Only)

Approved as submitted.

3. BOARD BUSINESS – Statement of Purpose

4. PUBLIC APPEARANCES

Duane DeWitt: Spoke regarding the removal of parking spaces in Copenhagen, Denmark and related it to a similar application to hundreds of US cities and prospectively the City of Santa Rosa. Referenced the book “life between buildings.”

(Board Member Kincaid arrived at this time.)

5. STATEMENTS OF ABSTENSION BY BOARD MEMBERS - None

DRAFT

6. SCHEDULED ITEMS

6.1 LANDMARK ALTERATION & PRELIMINARY & FINAL DESIGN REVIEW DETURK WINERY VILLAGE

8 W 9TH ST & 806 DONAHUE ST – FILE NO. PRJ16-012

BACKGROUND: This project proposes to construct a mixed-use campus consisting of 185 attached residential units, 15 of which shall be designated for very-low income occupants. The project will retain 20,000 square feet of existing commercial space. The project also includes a restoration component for the existing historic structures.

- Susie Murray, City Planner, presented the staff report.
- Rick Deringer, the applicant, gave a presentation.
- Kevin O'Malley, the project architect, gave a presentation to address action items.
- Nicolas Radkey, Historical Consultant, gave a presentation.
- Architect Paul Harris, the landscape architect, gave a presentation to address action items.

Chair Burch opened the public hearing:

- Gina Statler-Calhoun: Disapproved of 4th floor change aesthetics, and requested parking directional changes and locust trees; she asked for a non-reflective surface on the west side of the building.
- Duane DeWitt: Advocated for more housing and supported the project. He asked the boards to not be concerned with building height, to decrease parking stalls, and to consider enclosed bicycle stalls.
- Linda Hiskind: Concerned about her tenants if the project is approved. The project is too large and disrespectful of neighborhood, based on Cultural Heritage Board/Design Review Board neighborhood guidelines.
- Paul Sequeira – Lives near the project and advocated that this is an ideal urban family neighborhood. Welcomes more development, but is concerned about the enormity of the project.

Seeing no one else step forward to speak, Chair Burch closed the public hearing.

Chair Burch adjourned the meeting 8:33p.m. and reconvened at 8:55 p.m.

MOVED by Board Member Anderson, seconded by Board Member Kincaid to waive reading of the text and adopt:

RESOLUTION ENTITLED: RESOLUTION OF THE CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD AND DESIGN REVIEW BOARD OF THE CITY OF SANTA ROSA GRANTING PRELIMINARY DESIGN REVIEW FOR DETURK WINERY VILLAGE LOCATED AT 806 DONAHUE STREET AND 8 W 9TH STREET IN

DRAFT

THE WEST END PRESERVATION DISTRICT, APNS: 010-091-001 AND 010-091-007, FILE NO. PRJ16-012

Board Member DeBacker made the following friendly amendment:

1. To strike the language in Finding No. 1 of the draft Resolution which reads: "...the City's Design Guidelines, architectural criteria for special areas, and other applicable City requirements (e.g., City policy statements and development plans);
2. To strike Finding No. 4 in its entirety. (Finding No. 4 reads: "The architectural design of the proposed development is compatible with the character of the surrounding neighborhood. In response to comments from both the Cultural Heritage Board and Design Review Board at a Joint Concept Design Review meeting held on March 3, 2016, the proposed project incorporates heavy materials in keeping with the industrial history of the DeTurk Winery complex. In a Historic Evaluation prepared by Susan Clark, M.A., Architectural Historian, the DeTurk Round Barn and neighborhood park provide an adequate buffer between the predominately single-family residential West End neighborhood and the subject site, making it possible for the proximity of these two types of development;")
3. To strike the following verbiage from Finding No. 5: "and its neighbors" To take the boards' overt approval out of the equation.

Executive Secretary Bill Rose clarified that the Findings are required language and cannot be removed from the resolution, and suggested that staff analysis is the appropriate section to edit.

Board Member DeBacker withdrew the friendly amendment.

Chair Burch outlined Advisory Conditions:

1. Provide a maintenance and preservation plan for the historic brick façade.
2. Provide peer review or updated, complete historic resource evaluation - include the following sections which are currently missing from the report:
 - a. A full comprehensive, historic context;
 - b. A survey and evaluation based on the neighborhood;
 - c. The association of the building in context with the neighborhood and similar buildings; and
 - d. Include the standard compliance review discussion item per the Secretary of Interior standards.
3. Consider operational characteristics of the project:

DRAFT

- a. Provide the same level of materials and finishes for affordable units;
- b. Provide a monitoring program to maintain the materials and finishes during remodels;
- c. Car share and unbundled parking should run with the lifetime of the development.

Chair Burch outlined Board Member comments:

1. Consider more privacy and glare reduction for at-grade units on Donahue Avenue, which currently have full-height windows.
2. Provide layout and installation details of hardy-plank siding.
3. Provide an updated landscape set with color board for landscape design materials and furnishings, and ensure that the landscape plans are keyed correctly.
4. Provide updated lighting package with recommendations on photometric, number of fixtures, and fixture selections.
5. Consider providing alternative light sources to improve light and circulation for the living spaces in Building A.
6. Provide a complete color board.
7. Consider direct access to the ground floor units of Building D from the garage.
8. Consider variety of building railings on Buildings A and D.
9. Consider the location of trash areas and installation of garbage chutes to minimize the distance tenants travel to dispose of trash.
10. Consider reducing the number of suspended walkways on 4th level of Building D.
11. Provide a more columnar, faster-growing tree along Donahue Street.

Board Member Kincaid made a friendly amendment to add the advisory conditions and board conditions to the Motion.

Board Member Anderson accepted the friendly amendment.

Cultural Heritage Board Vote:

The MOTION FAILED 0-5-2 (Board Members De Shazo, DeBacker, Garrett, Murphey, and Purser voting No, and Board Members Fennell and Galantine absent).

Design Review Board Vote:

The MOTION CARRIED 5-0-2 (Board Members Burch, Kincaid, Sunderlage, Anderson, Grogan voting Aye, and Board Members Hedgpeth and Zucco absent).

DRAFT

The **MOTION FAILED** due to lack of consensus by the Design Review Board and Cultural Heritage Board.

MOVED by Board Member Kincaid to deny Preliminary Design Review approval, and to memorialize the advisory and Board Comments for appealing bodies to consider. The Motion was Withdrawn.

MOVED by Board Member DeBacker seconded by Board Member Garrett, to introduce a **RESOLUTION TO DENY PRELIMINARY DESIGN REVIEW FOR DETURK WINERY VILLAGE** based on noncompliance with Findings 4 and 5:

4. The architectural design of the proposed development is compatible with the character of the surrounding neighborhood. In response to comments from both the Cultural Heritage Board and Design Review Board at a Joint Concept Design Review meeting held on March 3, 2016, the proposed project incorporates heavy materials in keeping with the industrial history of the DeTurk Winery complex. In a Historic Evaluation prepared by Susan Clark, M.A., Architectural Historian, the DeTurk Round Barn and neighborhood park provide an adequate buffer between the predominately single-family residential West End neighborhood and the subject site, making it possible for the proximity of these two types of development; and
5. The design of the proposed development will provide a desirable environment for its occupants, visiting public, and its neighbors through the appropriate use of materials, texture, and color, and would remain aesthetically appealing and be appropriately maintained. During a Joint Design Review meeting held on March 3, 2016, the Cultural Heritage Board and Design Review Board directed the project applicant in terms of design and materials, with the intent to celebrate the historic industrial use while introducing the new residential use. Those recommendations have been incorporated into the project.

And due to noncompliance with: Processing Review Procedures Part 2, Guidelines Section 1G – New Construction, City Goals 4.7 3G, and noncompliance with the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation Sections – New Buildings and District/Neighborhood.

Cultural Heritage Board Vote:

The MOTION to deny Preliminary Design Review CARRIED 5-0-2 (Board Members De Shazo, DeBacker, Garrett, Murphey, and Purser voting Aye, and Board Members Fennell and Galantine absent).

DRAFT

Design Review Board Vote:

The MOTION to deny Preliminary Design Review CARRIED 4-1-2 (Board Members Burch, Kincaid, Anderson, Grogan voting Aye, Board Member Sunderlage voting no, and Board Members Hedgpeth and Zucco absent).

The Design Review Board left the meeting at this time.

MOVED by Board Member Purser, seconded by Board Member Murphey, to Continue Landmark Alteration review to a date uncertain. Following further Cultural Heritage Board discussion, Board Member Purser Withdrew the Motion.

MOVED by Board Member DeBacker, seconded by Board Member Purser, to adopt:

RESOLUTION ENTITLED: RESOLUTION OF THE CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD OF THE CITY OF SANTA ROSA DENYING A LANDMARK ALTERATION PERMIT FOR DETURK WINERY VILLAGE LOCATED AT 806 DONAHUE STREET AND 8 W. 9TH STREET IN THE WEST END PRESERVATION DISTRICT, ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBERS 010-091-001 AND 010-091-007, FILE NUMBER PRJ16-012) FOR THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- Due to the Cultural Heritage Board's inability to make findings A, C, D, E and F, on the basis of Processing Review Procedures Part 2, Guidelines Section 1G – New Construction, City Coals 4.7 3G, and Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation Sections – Site: New Buildings and District/Neighborhood.

The MOTION CARRIED 5-0-2 (Board Members De Shazo, DeBacker, Garrett, Murphey, and Purser voting Aye; Board Members Fennell and Galantine absent.)

7. BOARD MEMBER REPORTS - None

8. DEPARTMENT REPORT - None

9. ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING – Chair De Shazo adjourned the meeting at 12:00 a.m.

DRAFT

PREPARED BY:

Patti Pacheco Gregg, Recording Secretary

PREPARED BY:

Mike Maloney, Recording Secretary

ATTEST:

Bill Rose, Executive Secretary

Patrick Streeter, Executive Secretary

APPROVED:

Chair, Michael Burch

Chair, Stacey De Shazo