

RESOLUTION NO. RES-2017-014

RESOLUTION OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF SANTA ROSA GRANTING AN APPEAL AND APPROVING A LANDMARK ALTERATION PERMIT FOR DETURK WINERY VILLAGE LOCATED AT 806 DONAHUE STREET AND 8 W. 9<sup>TH</sup> STREET IN THE WEST END PRESERVATION DISTRICT, ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBERS 010-091-001 AND 010-091-007, FILE NUMBER PRJ16-012

WHEREAS, on November 5, 2015, the Cultural Heritage and Design Review Boards conducted the first of two Joint Concept Design Review meetings for the proposed DeTurk Winery Village project located at 806 Donahue Street and 8 W. 9<sup>th</sup> Street ("DeTurk Winery Village project" or "project"); and

WHEREAS, on February 24, 2016, a Neighborhood Meeting was held at the DeTurk Round Barn to introduce the conceptual project plans to the surrounding neighborhood; and

WHEREAS, on March 3, 2016, the Cultural Heritage and Design Review Boards conducted the second Joint Concept Design Review meeting at which point they provided direction, in terms of project design and materials, to the project applicant; and

WHEREAS, on April 19, 2016, the City Council adopted Resolution No. 28768 stating its Intention to Consider Vacation of Public Right-of-way for a 18,725 square foot area along the east side of Donahue Street, between W. 8<sup>th</sup> Street and W. 9<sup>th</sup> Street; and

WHEREAS, on May 24, 2016, the DeTurk Winery Village project applications were submitted to Planning and Economic Development; and

WHEREAS, on October 6, 2016, the Design Review Board and Cultural Heritage Board held a duly noticed public hearing to consider the project; and

WHEREAS, at that meeting on October 6, 2016, the Cultural Heritage Board of the City of Santa Rosa considered the Landmark Alteration Permit, at which time it received written and oral reports of staff, testimony, and other evidence presented by all those who wished to be heard on the matter; and

WHEREAS, at that meeting on October 6, 2016, the Cultural Heritage Board cited two (2) action items for the project and continued to the meeting to a date uncertain; and

WHEREAS, on November 3, 2016, the Cultural Heritage Board and Design Review Board held a duly noticed public hearing to further consider the project; and

WHEREAS, at that meeting on November 3, 2016, the Cultural Heritage Board of the City of Santa Rosa further considered the Landmark Alteration Permit, at which time it received written and oral reports of staff, testimony, and other evidence presented by all those who wished to be heard on the matter; and

WHEREAS, at that meeting on November 3, 2016, the Cultural Heritage Board of the City of Santa Rosa, after due consideration, investigation, and study made by itself and on its behalf and due consideration of all evidence and reports, denied the Landmark Alteration Permit; and

WHEREAS, on November 10, 2016, an appeal, filed by Richard Deringer, the project applicant of the DeTurk Winery Village project, was submitted to the City Clerk; and

WHEREAS, on January 31, 2017, the Council of the City of Santa Rosa, after due consideration, investigation, and study made by itself and on its behalf and due consideration of all evidence and reports offered, does find and determine the following:

- A. The proposed DeTurk Winery Village is consistent with the original architecture style and details of the existing building including colors, textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features and details with the time period of the building's construction and/or adjacent structures. The historic evaluation prepared by Susan Clark, dated September 2016, coupled with an addendum, also prepared by Susan Clark, dated November 29, 2016, found that the industrial design and materials proposed for the DeTurk Winery Village development are consistent with the historic winery complex.
- B. The proposed changes may require alteration of interior walls within the historic structures, however, the street-facing exterior walls will be preserved. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards provides accepted guidelines for adaptive reuse projects. A project involving a new addition to a historic building is considered acceptable within the framework of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards if it: preserves significant historic materials and features; preserves the historic character of the building; and protects the historic significance by making a visual distinction between old and new. The historic evaluation prepared by Susan Clark, dated September 2016, coupled with an addendum, also prepared by Susan Clark, dated November 29, 2016, concluded that the Project as proposed meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The proposed design of the DeTurk Winery Village project will thus not adversely affect important architectural features of the historic buildings on site.
- C. The proposed DeTurk Winery Village is compatible with adjacent or nearby landmark structures or preservation district structures. The historic evaluation prepared by Susan Clark, dated September 2016, coupled with an addendum, also prepared by Susan Clark, dated November 29, 2016, concluded the industrial design and materials proposed for the project are consistent with the historic winery and will not detract from the residential streetscape of the West End neighborhood.
- D. The proposed project is consistent with applicable standards from the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The aforementioned historic evaluation and addendum, summarized below, address the ten standards for rehabilitation:
  1. *A property shall be used for its intended historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.*

The Santa Rosa General Plan land use designation does not allow industrial uses. As such, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards provides accepted guidelines for adaptive reuse projects;

2. *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

The project preserves the primary façade of the DeTurk Winery along Donahue Street. As conditioned, the property owner will be required to maintain the historic elevation with an approved maintenance and preservation plan.

3. *Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historic development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.*

The project does not include conjectural features, architectural elements from other buildings or any false sense of historic development.

4. *Most properties change over time. Changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.*

The two significant changes that have occurred include the installation of roll-up doors and the replacement of round windows with squared ones facing Donahue Street. The squared windows have been part of the visual character of the DeTurk Winery for over 100 years and are to be retained.

5. *Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or example of craftsmanship that characterizes a historic property shall be preserved.*

The project was designed around character defining elements of the historic DeTurk Winery.

6. *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.*

There is adequate documentary and pictorial evidence of the historic appearance, building materials, and building techniques of the DeTurk Winery buildings. In terms of repair work the brick exterior will require the majority of the work. To the greatest extent possible, bricks will be repaired or replaced by like bricks.

7. *Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.*

There will be no sandblasting or use of caustic or corrosive cleaning agents.

8. *Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measure shall be undertaken.*

As conditioned, if any archaeological resources are found, work will cease until a qualified archaeologist is consulted.

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be distinguished from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

Tables 1 and 2 in the historic evaluation prepared by Susan Clark, dated September 2016, include a list of character-defining elements for the DeTurk Winery Building and U.S. Bonded Warehouse. An addendum to that report, also prepared by Susan Clark, dated November 29, 2016, concludes that the project has been designed in a manner that if the new construction were to be removed in the future, the historic winery would be closer to its original appearance than it is today. The report also concludes that the project is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

The new additions were designed so if removed in the future there would be no loss of historic integrity.

- E. The proposed project is consistent with the applicable guidelines from the Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties in that, in the findings of the aforementioned historic evaluation, the height, massing, materials and color were all found to be compatible.
- F. Granting the Landmark Alteration Permit for DeTurk Winery Village would not constitute a nuisance or be injurious or detrimental to the public interest, health, safety, convenience, or welfare, or materially injurious to persons, property, or improvements in the vicinity and zoning district in which the property is located in that it is a residential project that implements the goals and policies of the 2035 General Plan and Downtown Station Area Specific Plan.
- G. The proposed project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).
  - Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, the project is consistent with the General Plan, the Downtown Station Area Plan, and zoning, for each of which an Environmental Impact Report (EIR) was certified. No further environmental review is necessary, as analysis has confirmed that there are no new environmental effects, or environmental effects of greater severity, peculiar to the parcel or the project that were not analyzed and addressed in a prior EIR.

- Pursuant to Section 15332, the project is exempt from CEQA as an In-fill Development.

It is consistent with the General Plan land use designation of Transit Village Medium (25-40 units per acre) and complies with the TV-R-H-SA zoning district requirements.

It occurs on a site less than five acres within City limits, surrounded by urban uses.

The site has no value as habitat for endangered, rare or threatened species.

Approval of the project would not result in any significant effects relating to traffic, noise, air quality, or water quality that weren't previously considered in the scope of review of the Downtown Station Area Specific Plan Environmental Impact Report, certified by City Council Resolution No. 26949, dated October 9, 2007.

The site can be adequately served by all required utilities and public services.

- Pursuant to Section 15330, the project is exempt from CEQA in that it involves a minor cleanup effort to eliminate the threat of release of known contamination along Donahue Street through excavation and offsite disposal of contaminated soils.
- Pursuant to Section 15331, the project is exempt from CEQA as maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation or reconstruction of historical resources, in that it involves restoration efforts removing stucco from the exterior brick walls, opening up arched windows and doors, and replacing in kind of extensively deteriorated or missing features on the historic structures. In a historic evaluation prepared by Susan Clark, dated September 2016, these restoration efforts are recommended and have been found to be consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Council of the City of Santa Rosa does hereby grant the appeal and approve the Landmark Alteration Permit subject to the following conditions:

1. Comply with all conditions of approval as stated for Preliminary Design Review, Council Resolution No. RES-2017-013.
2. Provide a maintenance and preservation plan for the historic brick façade.
3. The project shall implement all recommended restoration measures outlined in the Historic Evaluation prepared by Susan Clark, M.A., Architectural Historian.
4. This Resolution approves only a Landmark Alteration Permit for the proposed DeTurk Winery Village project. The project remains subject to separate Council consideration and action with respect to the applicant's request for a Density Bonus

pursuant to Government Code section 65915 and City Code Chapter 20-31, and the applicant's request for a vacation of public right of way pursuant to Streets and Highways Code sections 8300 et seq.

IN COUNCIL DULY PASSED this 31st day of January 2017.

AYES: (7) Mayor Coursey, Vice Mayor Tibbetts, Council Members Combs, Olivares, Rogers, Sawyer, Schwedhelm

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (0)

ABSTAIN: (0)

ATTEST: \_\_\_\_\_ APPROVED: \_\_\_\_\_  
City Clerk Mayor

APPROVED AS TO FORM:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Interim City Attorney