

CITY OF SANTA ROSA  
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT  
STAFF REPORT FOR CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD  
**December 5, 2018**

**PROJECT TITLE**

John & Andrea Hibbard Addendum:  
Garage without ADU

**APPLICANT**

John & Andrea Hibbard

**ADDRESS/LOCATION**

629 Monroe Street

**PROPERTY OWNER**

John Hibbard

**ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBER**

180-810-019

**FILE NUMBER**

LMA18-027

**APPLICATION DATE**

October 26, 2018

**APPLICATION COMPLETION DATE**

November 20, 2018

**REQUESTED ENTITLEMENTS**

Amendment to Major Landmark Alteration  
Permit

**FURTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED**

Building Permit

**PROJECT SITE ZONING**

PD-H (Planned Development, within the  
Historic and Station Area combining  
districts)

**GENERAL PLAN DESIGNATION**

Low Density Residential (2-8 units per  
acre)

**PROJECT PLANNER**

Kristinae Toomians

**RECOMMENDATION**

Approval

Agenda Item #1  
For Cultural Heritage Board Meeting of December 5, 2018

CITY OF SANTA ROSA  
CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD

TO: CHAIR DE SHAZO AND BOARD MEMBERS  
FROM: KRISTINAE TOOMIANS, SENIOR PLANNER  
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

SUBJECT: JOHN & ANDREA HIBBARD ADDENDUM: GARAGE WITHOUT  
ADU

AGENDA ACTION: RESOLUTION

---

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning and Economic Development Department recommends that the Cultural Heritage Board, by resolution, approve the John & Andrea Hibbard Addendum: Garage without ADU for the property located at 629 Monroe Street, Santa Rosa, Assessor's Parcel No. 180-810-019.

---

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

On February 21, 2018, the Cultural Heritage Board approved a Major Landmark Alteration Permit (File No. LMA17-025) to allow the construction of a 436-square-foot addition and interior remodel to the rear of the main residence; the demolition of the existing 563-square-foot detached garage; and, the replacement of the demolished garage with a new 462-square-foot detached two-car garage, with a 462-square-foot accessory dwelling unit above.

On October 26, 2018, the applicant submitted an amendment to the Major Landmark Alteration Permit (File No. LMA18-027) to modify the previously approved scope of work. The applicant proposes to replace the 563-square-foot garage with a new 416-square-foot garage without an accessory dwelling unit above.

The dwelling, constructed in 1924, is located at 629 Monroe Street and is a contributor to the McDonald Preservation District. The District was established by the City Council in 1998, and recognizes the period of significance ranging from 1878 to 1940.

BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant proposes to demolish the existing 563-square-foot detached garage and, replace it with a new 416-square-foot detached garage that will front onto 12<sup>th</sup> Street. The garage will be clad in board and batten up to the water

table, with shingles above to match the main house. The new garage will be superficially connected to the main house with a covered breezeway. The applicant proposes a custom wooden garage door in western cedar or mahogany. One “arts and crafts” style light fixture will be installed centered above the garage door.

2. Surrounding Land Uses

North: Low Density Residential

South: Low Density Residential

East: Low Density Residential

West: Medium Density Residential (8-13 units per acre)

The project site is surrounded by single-family homes. The subject property is situated on the southeast corner of Monroe and 12<sup>th</sup> Streets. The front door of the residence faces Monroe, while the garage faces 12<sup>th</sup> Street. The residence backs up to an existing alley. The adjacent residence east of the alley, facing 12<sup>th</sup> Street takes access off of the alley. The property is less than 300-feet north of College Avenue, where several residential structures were converted to various commercial uses.

3. Existing Land Use – Project Site

The approximately 7,815-square-foot lot is developed with a 2,829-square-foot, two-story, single-family-dwelling and a 563-square-foot, detached garage.

4. Project History

On February 21, 2018, the Cultural Heritage Board approved a Major Landmark Alteration Permit (File No. LMA17-025) to allow the construction of a 436-square-foot addition and interior remodel to the rear of the main residence; the demolition of the existing 563-square-foot detached garage; and, the replacement of the demolished garage with a new 462-square-foot detached two-car garage, with a 462-square-foot accessory dwelling unit above.

On October 26, 2018, the applicant submitted an amendment to the Major Landmark Alteration Permit (File No. LMA18-027) to modify the previously approved scope of work. The applicant proposes to replace the 563-square-foot garage with a new 416-square-foot garage without an accessory dwelling unit above.

ANALYSIS

1. General Plan

The General Plan land use designation for the site is Low Density Residential, which allows a density of 2-8 units per acre. This land use designation is generally intended for detached single family residential uses. Consistent with the General Plan, the subject site, which is approximately 7,815-square-feet, is developed with one detached single-family residence.

2. Zoning

Zoning Code Section 20-28.040 advises that the McDonald Preservation District was established in 1998, and establishes the period of significance for the District ranging from 1878-1940. It does not, however, identify character defining elements. The McDonald District is predominantly developed with single-family dwellings, with some duplexes, small apartment buildings, churches, schools, nurseries, and warehouses. General characteristics of the McDonald District include large, medium, and small house on medium to large lots, with less than 40 percent lot coverage. Entry doors generally face the street and many lots have alley access. Most buildings are one and two-story and are clad in wood siding or stucco. Dominant architectural styles include: bungalows, colonial revival, craftsman, English cottage, Greek revival, hip-roofed cottage, Italianate, Mediterranean revival, prairie school, provincial, Queen Anne, shingle, Stick-Eastlake, Tudor revival, and 1930's tract type.

The project parcel is located within the PD-0226 (Planned Development) zoning district with a historic preservation overlay. The PD-0226 Junior College Planned Development District is divided into various zoning subdistricts. The subject site is identified as R-1-PD, single-family residential. The parcel has been developed in a manner consistent with the R-1-PD subdistrict of the Junior College Planned Development.

A Landmark Alteration Permit is required because the project involves exterior alterations to a property located within a preservation district. Zoning Code Section 20-58.060 requires a Landmark Alteration Permit for the restoration, rehabilitation, alteration of or change to the exterior appearance of any structure or building within a preservation district. A Major Landmark Alteration Permit is required for a major renovation or restoration involving an entire façade or building, substantial alterations to an existing structure that do not match the original design, or substantial additions [Zoning Code, Section 20-58.060 (C) (2)].

Pursuant to Zoning Code Section 20-58.060 (F), the Board should consider the following criteria to the extent applicable in their discussion:

1. The consistency, or lack thereof, of the proposed change with the original architectural style and details of the building;
2. The compatibility of the proposed change with any adjacent or nearby landmark structures or preservation district structures;
3. The consistency and/or compatibility of the proposed colors, textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features and details with the time period of the building's construction, and/or adjacent structures;
4. Whether the proposed change will destroy or adversely affect an important architectural feature or features;
5. The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (1983 Revision); and

6. Other matters, criteria and standards as may be adopted by resolution of the CHB.

A Major Landmark Alteration Permit is required because: the site is located within the McDonald Preservation District and is a contributor to the district; it involves a major renovation to the building; and, it includes substantial alterations to the existing structure that do not match the original design. The applicant has applied for a Major Landmark Alteration Permit to complete the proposed project.

Historic architecture report dated November 26, 2018, identifies the proposed changes as a mix of preservation and historic rehabilitation efforts as described by the *Secretary of the Interiors Standards of Care*. According to the report, most of the 1924 Craftsman is intact, while the detached garage, with a tar and gravel roof, was likely added after 1950. The applicant proposes to demolish the existing 563-square-foot detached garage and, replace it with a new 416-square-foot garage. The garage will be clad in board and batten up to the water table, with shingles above to match the main house. The new garage will connect to the main house superficially with a covered breezeway.

The report states that all the work proposed is in general conformance to the *Secretary of Interior's Standards of Care* for the treatment of historic properties, and the proposed decorative features and details are shown to be consistent with the time period of the building's construction, and/or adjacent structures.

### 3. Design Guidelines

The following goals and policies, from the Santa Rosa Design Guidelines, Section 4.7- Historic Properties and Districts, are applicable to the proposed project:

#### **Goals**

- To preserve Santa Rosa's historic heritage.
- To encourage maintenance and retention of historic structures and districts.
- To ensure that alterations to historic buildings are compatible with the character of the structure and the neighborhood.

#### **Policies**

##### A – Accessory Buildings

- Locate a new garage, carport, or accessory building to the side or rear of the property, wherever possible.
- Derive accessory building designs and details from the same era as the main structure. The details can be less elaborate than those found on the main structure.
- Design an accessory building to be in proper scale for the property and have an appropriate site relation to the main structure as well as surrounding structures.

Staff response: The applicant proposes to demolish the existing 563-square-foot detached garage and replace it with a new 416-square-foot garage. The new accessory structure will be constructed in the same location, fronting onto the street side (12<sup>th</sup> Street). The garage will be clad in board and batten up to the water table, with shingles above to match the main house. The new garage will superficially connect to the main house with a covered breezeway

The overall design is harmonious with the original architectural style and, therefore, will be compatible with other structures in the district.

4. Historic Preservation Review Standards

The following guidelines from the City's Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties and the Secretary of the Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Buildings are applicable to the proposed project:

***Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties***

Section A Design Guidelines – Accessory Structures

- 1) Locate a new garage, carport, or accessory building to the side or rear of the property, wherever possible.
- 2) Derive accessory building designs and details from the same era as the main structure.
- 3) The details can be less elaborate than those found on the main structure.
- 4) Design an accessory building to be in proper scale for the property and have an appropriate site relation to the main structure as well as surrounding structures.

Staff response: The applicant proposes to construct a 416-square-foot garage, which will be clad with board and batten up to the water table, with shingles above to match the main house. The overall design of the garage is in keeping with the original architectural style and, therefore, will be compatible with other structures in the district.

Historic architecture report dated November 26, 2018, identifies the proposed changes as a mix of Preservation and Historic Rehabilitation efforts as described by the Secretary of the Interiors Standards of Care. According to the report, most of the 1924 Craftsman is intact, while the detached garage, with a tar and gravel roof, was likely added after 1950.

5. Neighborhood Comments

No neighborhood comments have been received to date.

6. Public Improvements/On-Site Improvements

N/A

### ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT

The proposed project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The project qualifies for a Class 31 Categorical Exemption pursuant to Section 15331, in that “projects limited to maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation, or reconstruction of historical resources in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings (1995, Weeks and Grimmer) are exempt.”

### NOTIFICATION

The project was noticed as a Public Hearing per the requirements of Chapter 20-66 of the City Code. Notification of this public hearing was provided by posting an on-site sign, publishing notice in a newspaper of general circulation, mailed notice to surrounding property owners, electronic notice to parties that had expressed interest in projects taking place in this geographic area of Santa Rosa, and bulletin board postings at City Hall and on the City website.

### ISSUES

N/A

### ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 - Disclosure Form  
Attachment 2 - Location Map  
Attachment 3 – Aerial Map  
Attachment 4 – Historic Properties Inventory  
Attachment 5 – Project Plan  
Attachment 6 – LMA17-025 Project Plans  
Attachment 7 – Secretary of the Interior Standards Compliance Report  
Resolution

### CONTACT

Kristinae Toomians, Senior Planner, KToomians@srcity.org, (707) 543-4692.