

CITY OF SANTA ROSA
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
STAFF REPORT FOR MINOR DESIGN REVIEW
June 20, 2019

PROJECT TITLE

Dutton Flats Multi-Family Development

APPLICANT

Dutton Flats LP

ADDRESS/LOCATION

206 W. 3rd St.
208 W. 3rd St.
214 W. 3rd St.

PROPERTY OWNER

Godfrey A Babbini Trust, et al.

ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBER

125-061-026
125-061-027
125-061-028

FILE NUMBER

DR19-028

APPLICATION DATE

April 15, 2019

APPLICATION COMPLETION DATE

May 31, 2019

REQUESTED ENTITLEMENTS

Minor Design Review

FURTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED

No additional discretionary action is required.

PROJECT SITE ZONING

Neighborhood Commercial (CN)

GENERAL PLAN DESIGNATION

Retail & Business Services

PROJECT PLANNER

Andrew Trippel

RECOMMENDATION

Approve

Agenda Item # _____
For Zoning Administrator Meeting of: June 20, 2019

CITY OF SANTA ROSA
ZONING ADMINISTRATOR

TO: ZONING ADMINISTRATOR
FROM: ANDREW TRIPPEL, CITY PLANNER
PLANNING & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
SUBJECT: DUTTON FLATS MULTI-FAMILY DEVELOPMENT

AGENDA ACTION: Resolution

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended by the Planning and Economic Development Department that the Zoning Administrator, by resolution, approve Minor Design Review for the Dutton Flats project.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Dutton Flats project proposes a 5-story, 41-unit, 100% affordable, multi-family rental housing project, consisting of 11 one-bedroom units, 15 two-bedroom units, and 15 three-bedroom units for tenants with income 30-60% or less of Area Median Income (AMI). The project is eligible for a 35% State Density Bonus and has requested three concessions and two waivers from Zoning Code development standards.

On April 25, 2019, a request to elevate project review to a public hearing was received from the applicant. Planning staff has acted upon that request.

BACKGROUND

In April of 2019, Dutton Flats LP representing the Dutton Flats Project, submitted a Minor Design Review application and request for 35% State Density Bonus to the City of Santa Rosa for the review of a proposed multi-family housing project consisting of 41 income-restricted, apartment units with community amenities spaces and an outdoor children's play area on a 1.03-acre site comprised of three (3) parcels addressed as 208, 206, and 214 W. 3rd Street.

The proposed total unit count reflects (1) a 30-unit/acre base density allowed by the site's zoning district determined in compliance with the definition for Maximum Allowable

Density contained in Zoning Code § 20-31.020, plus (2) eligibility for a 35% State Density Bonus [(30du/acre x 1.03 acre) x 1.35].

The proposed project site is located within the Downtown Station Area Specific Plan Boundary, which is a designated Priority Development Area. Pursuant to Zoning Code § 20-16.070 Modifications to the Design Review process, Design Review approval for new development and major remodels, with the exception of projects located within the Historic (-H) Combining District, that meet the stated criteria, are delegated to the Zoning Administrator, through the Minor Design Review process. The proposed project meets the stated criteria, as evaluated in this Staff Report's Zoning Code analysis section, and therefore is delegated to the Zoning Administrator through the Minor Design Review process, for Design Review approval.

1. Project Description

The proposed ±1.01-acre project site is comprised of three parcels located in Northwest Santa Rosa on the southeast corner of the Dutton Avenue/W. 3rd Street intersection within the Downtown Station Area Specific Plan boundary. It is bounded by W. 3rd Street to the north, Decoe Street to the east, residential use and City of Santa Rosa right-of-way to the south, and Dutton Avenue to the west (see Attachment 1: Location Map). The proposed project would be within ½-mile of the Sonoma-Marin Area Rail Transit (SMART) rail station in Railroad Square, within ¾-miles of Downtown Santa Rosa and the 2nd Street Transit Mall, and less than ¼-mile from commercial retail goods and services businesses at the Dutton Avenue and Sebastopol Road intersection and along the Sebastopol Road corridor.

The subject parcels' General Plan Land Use designations are *Retail and Business Services*, and they are zoned *Neighborhood Commercial-Station Area* (CN-SA). The proposed multi-family residential land use is consistent with General Plan Land Use Designation pursuant to General Plan Policy LUL-E-6 which allows residential development in Retail and Business Services designations. The use is a Permitted Use in the CN zoning district.

Dutton Flats LP, representing the Dutton Flats Project, submitted a Minor Design Review application and request for State Density Bonus to the City of Santa Rosa for the review and approval of 41 income-restricted, multi-family apartment units with community amenities spaces and an outdoor children's play area. Two connected residential buildings would provide dwelling units for tenants with income 30-60% or less of Area Median Income (AMI). A total of 41 vehicle parking spaces are proposed, along with a building-integrated bus shelter and an 80+ bicycle storage and bicycle maintenance area (see Attachment 2: Project Description and Attachment 3: Plan Set).

The proposed 5-story residential apartment building is sited in the northwest corner of the project site adjacent to property lines bounded by W. 3rd Street and Dutton Avenue. The building forms an 'L' shape structure with one section of the structure

fronting W. 3rd Street between Decoe Street and Dutton Avenue (W. 3rd Street Section), and another section of the L fronting Dutton Avenue between W. 3rd Street and the Highway 12 Dutton Avenue off-ramp (Dutton Avenue section). These sections are approximately 265 feet and 160 feet in length, respectively, and the building footprint is approximately $\pm 15,775$ square feet. The sections conjoin at the southeast corner of the W. 3rd Street and Dutton Avenue intersection where the juncture of the two buildings forms a double-height intersecting cube (± 18 feet in height at grade) that serves as the main entry to the project. The front entry doors face W. 3rd Street.

Proposed building setbacks include a 0 to 2-foot setback from the Dutton Avenue property line, an approximately 9.5-foot setback from the W 3rd Street property line, a 10-foot side setback from Decoe Street, and a 13-foot setback from the rear property line. The forward placement of the building on the site results in a majority of the site being located behind the building. This area is utilized for pedestrian and vehicular internal site circulation and provides 30 standard and 11 compact parking spaces for the project. It also features a small outdoor children's play area of ± 200 square feet adjacent to the building and some landscaped open space.

The overall building height, at grade, is ± 60 feet for both sections. Stair towers at the end of each section and at the juncture of the two sections rise to ± 63 feet. Community amenities areas located in the ground level of the Dutton Avenue section and in approximately 100 feet of the W. 3rd Street section are connected by the project's main entry intersection cube. These spaces are ± 18 -feet in height, with the remainder of the building height programmed for residential use.

The project's 41 residential units consist of 11 one-bedroom, 15 two-bedroom, and 15 three-bedroom units. The ground floor and second floor include one one-bedroom units and three three-bedroom units, while floors 3-5 each feature three one-bedroom, five two-bedroom, and three three-bedroom units. Each unit is designed with a 74-square foot exterior deck.

The $\pm 5,775$ square-foot Community Amenities Area is reserved for use by residents only. The Area features a Fitness Room and indoor Children's Play Area, Game Room and Community Room, a Tech Area, and a Bike Kitchen with storage for approximately 80 bicycles. Additional ground floor spaces include leasing offices, a mail/package room, and restroom facilities for the ground floor activities. Floor-to-ceiling glass curtain walls open the Community Amenities Area and offices to the exterior sidewalk so that these activity-generating residential areas are easily viewed from the public right-of-way.

The proposed project site is vacant, generally level, and naturally drains to the northeast. It is mostly without vegetative cover; however, 16 existing non-Heritage trees are located throughout the site. Removal of trees to accommodate development would be mitigated through the planting of 28 24-inch box trees of various species as described in the landscape plan. Required public improvements

would include installation of new, expanded sidewalks along Dutton Avenue and W. 3rd Street frontages; development of a bus pullout on W. 3rd Street in front of the property along with a building-integrated bus shelter, and street and sidewalk improvements on Decoe Street.

A noise assessment/mitigation study will be required to be submitted with the building permit application. The noise mitigation recommendations shall include information about how the dwelling units will need to be constructed so that the sound levels within the dwelling units do not exceed City General Plan and State mandated noise levels. As proposed, the project includes the following features:

- HVAC: HVAC systems will be hidden in deck closets or screened on roof, and noise mitigation will meet industry standards.
- Exterior Walls Upgrades: Noise mitigation will meet industry standards for exterior walls.
- Exterior Windows and Door Upgrades: Noise mitigation will meet industry standards for exterior walls and windows.

Project construction would utilize steel modular components for residential portions of the building. This method reduces overall construction time and use of construction equipment in comparison to traditional stick-built construction. Construction would take approximately 12 months, including on-site grading. Construction would be anticipated to begin in winter of 2020 and completed during winter of 2021.

2. Surrounding Land Uses

North: Low Density Residential

South: Public roadway

East: Medium Low Density Residential

West: Retail and Business Services

Surrounding land uses consist of commercial uses to the west across Dutton Avenue, residential uses to the north across W. 3rd Street and to the east across Decoe Street. Land uses along the southern project boundary consist of a residential use accessed from Decoe Street and City of Santa road right-of-way as part of the Highway 12 Dutton Avenue off-ramp. The land use designation on the project site and all abutting properties, as well as those commercial uses across Dutton Avenue, are Retail & Business Services. Land use to the north across W. 3rd Street is Low Density Residential, and land use to the east across Decoe Street is Medium-Low Density Residential. Consistent with the land use designations, the sites are zoned Neighborhood Commercial-Station Area (CN-SA), or Residential (R-1-6-SA and R-2-SA).

3. Existing Land Use – Project Site

All parcels comprising the proposed project site are vacant. Aerial data from 1963 indicated that a detached single-family residential use occupied the parcel at 206 W. 3rd Street while the other parcels appear to be used for small-scale agriculture. By 1977, the parcel at 214 W. 3rd was developed for a commercial gas station use, with the other parcels used residentially. In approximately 2004, all structures on all parcels were demolished and remediation of the gas station site was completed.

4. Project History

February 6, 2019	Pre-application Neighborhood Meeting was hosted by City.
February 7, 2019	Required Concept Design Review was conducted by Design Review Board.
April 15, 2019	Minor Design Review, Density Bonus, and Zoning Clearance applications were submitted by Dutton Flats, LP.
May 9, 2019	A Notice of Application was distributed.
May 10, 2019	A Notice of Incomplete Application and Project Issues Letter was distributed.
June 7, 2019	A Notice of Public Hearing was distributed.
June 14, 2019	A Notice of Density Bonus eligibility was issued.

PRIOR CITY COUNCIL REVIEW (Indicate N/A if not applicable)

Not applicable.

ANALYSIS

1. General Plan

The General Plan Land Use designation of all proposed project site parcels is *Retail and Business Services*. Although this land use designation generally only allows retail and service enterprises, offices, and restaurants, Land Use and Livability Policy LUL-E-6 allows residential or mixed-use development in the *Retail and Business Services* or *Office* designations. In accordance with General Plan Policy LUL-E-6, the proposed Multi-family residential use was determined to be an allowed use in the site's current *Retail and Business Services* General Plan Land Use designation.

Other applicable General Plan Goals and Policies include:

LAND USE AND LIVABILITY

LUL-A	Goal – Foster a compact rather than a scattered development pattern in order to reduce travel, energy, land, and materials consumption while promoting greenhouse gas emission reductions citywide.
LUL-A-1	As part of plan implementation – including development review, capital improvements programming, and preparation of detailed area plans – foster close land use/transportation relationships to promote use of alternative transportation modes and discourage travel by automobile.
LUL-E	Goal – Promote livable neighborhoods by requiring compliance with green building programs to ensure that new construction meets high standards of energy efficiency and sustainable material use. Ensure that everyday shopping, park and recreation facilities, and schools are within easy walking distance of most residents.
LUL-E-2	As part of planning and development review activities, ensure that projects, subdivisions, and neighborhoods are designed to foster livability. Diversity and Choice. Neighborhoods should provide choices for residents with different values. Different housing types and locations within the city accommodate a diverse range of needs.
LUL-E-6	See introductory paragraph this section.
LUL-F	Goal – Maintain a diversity of neighborhoods and varied housing stock to satisfy a wide range of needs.
LUL-F-1	Do not allow development at less than the minimum density prescribed by each residential land use classification.
LUL-F-3	Maintain a balance of various housing types in each neighborhood and ensure that new development does not result in undue concentration of a single housing type in any one neighborhood.
LUL-M	Goal – Ensure new development and streetscape projects provide pedestrian and bicycle circulation improvements.
URBAN DESIGN	
UD-G	Goal - Design residential neighborhoods to be safe, human-scaled, and livable by addressing compact development, multi-modal connectivity and reducing energy use.
UD-G-8	Promote personal safety in project design, particularly in multifamily development, by locating windows and walkways to assure visual access to common areas. Locate children's play space within view of the nearest units and discourage designs with unutilized open space.
HOUSING	
H-A	Goal – Meet the housing needs of all Santa Rosa residents.
H-A-5	Improve community acceptance of higher-density housing through community-based outreach, recognition of existing livable neighborhoods, and assurance of well-designed, high-density projects.
H-C	Goal – Expand the supply of housing available to lower-income households.
H-C-4	Utilize the Santa Rosa Housing Trust to maximize and leverage available federal, state, and local funding to assist in the development of affordable housing, the preservation and rehabilitation of low-income housing, the development and maintenance of homeless shelters, and the acquisition and development of facilities for the physically and developmentally disabled.

H-C-6	Facilitate higher-density and affordable housing development in Priority Development Areas (PDA), which include sites located near the rail transit corridor and on regional/arterial streets for convenient access to bus and rail transit. Implement existing PDA specific plans—the Downtown Station Area Specific Plan and the North Santa Rosa Station Area Specific Plan
H-C-13	Encourage the development of units with three or more bedrooms in affordable housing projects.
H-C-15	Encourage new affordable housing development to provide amenities for residents, such as on-site recreational facilities, children’s programs (day care or after-school care), and community meeting spaces.
H-F	Goal – Remove constraints to very low- and low-income housing production.
H-F-1	Ensure that residential projects are heard by the first decision-making board, within a period not to exceed 120 days of receipt of a complete application for development approval.
H-F-2	Fast track all development projects that fully comprise units affordable to extremely low-, very low-, and low-income households with long-term affordability restrictions. Utilize a fast track schedule mutually acceptable to the project applicant and the City.
H-F-4	Continue to implement the City’s Density Bonus Ordinance, consistent with state law.
H-F-5	Utilize the design review checklist to expedite affordable housing developments through the Design Review process.
H-G	Goal – Develop energy-efficient residential units and rehabilitate existing units to reduce energy consumption.
H-G-1	Maximize energy efficiency in residential areas. Utilize the following techniques: Implement CALGreen Tier 1 standards.
H-G-2	Require, as allowed by CALGreen Tier 1 standards, energy efficiency through site planning and building design by assisting residential developers in identifying energy conservation and efficiency measures appropriate to the Santa Rosa area.
H-G-3	Promote energy efficiency in the provision and use of water in all residential developments.
H-G-4	Reduce the amount of water used, encourage the use of recycled water for landscaping where available, and require compliance with the City’s Water Efficient Landscape Ordinance.

2. Other Applicable Plans – Downtown Station Area Specific Plan

The proposed project site is located with the Downtown Station Area Specific Plan (DSASP) and is within a designated Residential Sub-Area. A primary objective of the DSASP is to “...increase the number of residents and employees within walking distance of the [then proposed] SMART site through the intensification of land uses in the Plan Area” (DSASP: Introduction p. 1-1).

The Santa Rosa Downtown Station is operational, and the proposed Dutton Flats would contribute to the growing number of dwelling units located within ½ mile of the Station. DSASP policies are codified in the -Station Area (-SA) zoning combining district to which the project site is subject. The proposed project site is zoned CN-SA

with a residential base density that is allowed by the zoning district. The Project supports all goals and policies contained in the DSASP that relate to the multi-family residential development.

Specific Plan Policies	Project Consistency
Policy SP- LU-1.1: Establish appropriate land use designations and development standards which will result in a substantial number of new housing units within walking distance of the Downtown SMART Station site.	The proposed project's Retail & Business Services land use designation supports new housing development through General Plan Policy LUL-E-6 which allows for residential development in the Retail & Business Services designation. Neighborhood Commercial (CN) zoning district allows a maximum of 30 dwelling units per acre.
Policy SP- LU-1.2. Improve pedestrian, bicycle and bus transit connections from surrounding areas to the Downtown SMART Station site as well as between neighborhoods surrounding the SMART Station site.	Project meets the pedestrian-oriented and transit-oriented policies aspect of the Specific Plan. Sidewalks adjacent to the site will be improved to 8-10 feet wide, building design incorporates a transit shelter, and road improvements incorporate a bus pullout on the W 3 rd Street frontage.
Policy SP - LU-1.3. Create pedestrian friendly environments and provide convenient connections to the transit facility for all modes of transportation.	Please see comment above. Additionally, the project site is within ½ mile of the Santa Rosa Downtown SMART Station in Railroad Square and is located on Santa Rosa City Bus and Sonoma County Transit routes that service a proposed on-site bust stop.
Policy SP - LU-2.1. Provide a variety of housing types and densities in the Specific Plan Area.	The project provides a mix of one-, two, and three- bedroom apartment units near the top end of the density range. All units are affordable.
Policy SP-LU-2.3. Utilize existing City programs and policies to encourage and facilitate development of affordable housing within the Specific Plan area.	The project is eligible for the City's High Density Multi-Family Residential Incentive Program approved by City Council on August 25, 2018 due to its location within the DSASP boundary. The project's required Major Design Review Project review is reduced to Minor Design Review pursuant to Zoning Code Chapter 20-16, Resilient City Development Measures, Section 20-16.070 – Modifications to the Design Review process. Also, the project benefits from expedited Planning review due to inclusion of affordable housing pursuant to internal Planning policy.
Policy SP - LU-2.5. Evaluate issues of "visitability" in residential building design and develop a program for implementation of appropriate policies and/or standards.	All units are single level units that will be adaptable/accessible and are all located on accessible routes via corridors and an elevator. All common amenity areas are also located on accessible routes and accessible parking is provided as required.
Policy SP-LU-3.1. Promote site and building design that improves energy efficiency by incorporating natural cooling and passive solar heating. This may include extended eaves, window overhangs, awnings and tree placement for natural cooling, and building and window orientation to take advantage of passive solar heating.	Building design includes a single-loaded corridor on the south and east-facing rear building facades. This configuration insulates most units from exposure to full-sun thus preventing unwanted heat gain.

Policy SP - LU-3.2. Support the use of green or sustainable building materials, including recycled content materials that are consistent with the underlying architectural style and character of the building.	Total recycled content value of construction materials will exceed 10% of total material cost in accordance with Cal Green Tier 1 requirements.
Policy SP - LU-3.3. Encourage green site design by utilizing native and/or drought-tolerant trees and plants where possible, incorporating permeable paving and designing resource-efficient landscapes and gardens.	Trees and plantings will be drought-tolerant/low water use. Landscape design incorporates resource-efficiency into materials used, plantings, and trees.
Policy SP – LU-3.4. Utilize the Santa Rosa Build It Green (SR BIG) Program/Green Build Guidelines as a comprehensive guide for achieving sustainable building design and building practices.	The buildings have been designed to meet or exceed the CalGreen Tier 1 Standards and the project is fully compliant with the city of Santa Rosa Climate Action Plan.
Policy SP – LU-5.1. New development shall be designed to reinforce and enhance the distinctive and unique qualities of the Sub-Area it is located within.	According to the DSASP, the Residential Sub-Area designation seeks to maintain and enhance existing residential character of those areas with this designation. The project would be a 100% residential project, thus maintaining the existing residential character. By providing multi-family rental housing with varied dwelling unit sizes ranging from one- to three-bedrooms, the project would enhance residential character by offering greater diversity in housing type and accommodations for households of varying income levels. The building's residential use is expressed in that each unit is designed with a 74-square foot exterior deck. Residential units are distinguishable on the exterior by six projected vertical planes on the W. 3rd Street section and two projected vertical planes on the Dutton Avenue section. Each projected plane is comprised of side-by-side windows and deck openings stacked. Approximately 120 feet of the W. 3rd Street frontage and the Dutton Avenue frontage are differentiated from the 2-story community amenities space by a horizontal band comprised of board form concrete veneer. The elevations are further differentiated by vertical bands of color that help to identify residential units and add visual interest.
Policy SP – LU-5.2. Prepare and implement streetscape design “palettes” for Sub-areas within the Plan Area that will accent the individual Sub-Areas and help define the character and role of the street.	Evenly spaced “Boulevard Street Type” trees within tree wells are proposed along Dutton Avenue and W. 3 rd Street. Street lights and Streetscape Furnishings comply with City standards, existing Class II bicycle lanes comply with Bicycle Provisions, and the proposed Transit Provisions bus shelter and bench amenity comply with Boulevard Streetscape Standards.
Policy SP-LU-5.3. Require public and private improvement projects to be designed in conformance with the Development	The proposed project complies with Boulevard Development Guidelines and Boulevard Streetscape Standards as codified in the current

Guidelines and Streetscape Standards established in Chapter 5 of the DSASP.	Zoning Code and other applicable City regulations.
Policy SP-T-4.6. Require one parking space per unit for affordable housing projects and 0.5 spaces per unit for senior housing projects within the Specific Plan Area.	The project is parked consistent with the DSASP, that is, 1 reserved space per unit, pursuant to Zoning Code Section 20-36.040 Table 3-4: DSASP – Affordable Residential Uses – All Sub-areas. A Focused Traffic Study was prepared and supports the proposed on-site parking arrangement.
Policy SP-UPS-1. Ensure that private development provides it fair share of funding for necessary improvements to public services and utilities in the Plan Area.	The project will be required to pay all applicable site development, building, utility and impact fees including, but not limited to, the Capital Facilities Impact Fee for this use and area.
Policy SP-UPS-2.2. New development and streetscape landscaping shall employ water conservation and re-use measures.	The landscape plan utilizes low water-use plant materials and complies with the City's Water Efficient Landscape Policy.
Policy SP-UPS-2.4. New development within the Specific Plan Area shall be required to comply with the City's Water Efficient Landscape Policy.	See above comment.
Policy SP-UPS-4.1. Expand recycling efforts in multifamily and commercial projects in the Plan Area and continue to encourage recycling by all residents.	A brochure regarding the importance of recycling will be distributed to all residents and recycling containers will be easily accessible for all residents.
Policy SP-UPS-5.1. New development and capital improvement projects shall reduce pollution and runoff flows impacting Santa Rosa Creek by following the City's Standard Urban Storm Water Mitigation Plan (SUSMP).	The project employs bio-retention areas and is fully consistent with the City's SUSMP.

3. Zoning

All parcels comprising the proposed project site are zoned *Neighborhood Commercial – Station Area (CN-SA)*. The project is subject to Boulevard Street Type Development Standards due to its location on Dutton Avenue between W. 3rd Street and Sebastopol Road and its location on W. 3rd Street between Dutton Avenue and Santa Rosa Creek. Below are specific use and site development aspects of the proposed project that warrant further analysis.

Minor Design Review Required – Pursuant to Zoning Code § 20-16.070

Modifications to the Design Review process, “Design Review approval for new development and major remodels, with the exception of projects located within the Historic (-H) Combining District, that meet the stated criteria, are delegated to the Zoning Administrator, through the Minor Design Review process.” The project is located within the Downtown Station Area Specific Plan boundary, which is a Priority Development Area, as identified in the applicable section's Figure 1.1. Therefore, the project's required Design Review is delegated to the Zoning Administrator through the Minor Design Review process.

Section 20-16.070 (A)(2) and (3) require pre-application Concept Design Review and a Neighborhood Meeting. These requirements were completed during February

6-7, 2019. Section 20-16.070(A)(4) grants the Zoning Administrator the authority to refer a project to Design Review Board for review. The Zoning Administrator has not referred this project.

Allowable Land Use – Multi-family dwelling is a Permitted Use in the CN zoning district. The project is additionally subject to §20-23.050 CN zoning district standards, which encourages but does not require mixed use development.

Allowable Density/Density Bonus – The project proposes 41 dwelling units, all of which would be income-restricted to tenants with income 30-60% or less of Area Median Income (AMI) pursuant to an Affordable Housing Agreement with the City of Santa Rosa. An application for a 35% State Density Bonus was submitted with the Minor Design Review application. Planning staff determined that the project is eligible for a 35% State Density Bonus (see Attachment 4: Notice of Density Bonus Eligibility). The applicant also requested three (3) concessions and two (2) waivers from current development standards pursuant to Zoning Code Sections 20-31.060(B), 20-31.090(A and B), and 20-31.100(G):

Concession 1:	Reduce required building setbacks
Concession 2:	Alternative calculation of required vision triangle
Concession 3:	Extend building structure into a public right-of-way
Waiver 1:	Increase in allowable maximum building height
Waiver 2:	Reduce minimum 5-foot distance of driveway apron from property line

The applicant has demonstrated that the concessions would result in identifiable and actual cost reductions to offset the cost of affordable housing in the project. Planning staff has determined that granting of the concessions or waivers would not have an adverse impact, as defined in paragraph (2) of subdivision (d) of Section 65589.5 of the California Government Code, upon public health and safety or the physical environment or on any real property that is listed in the California Register of Historical Resources.

Building Setbacks –The proposed side and rear setbacks comply with required CN setbacks. The Boulevard Street Type Development Standards contained in the -SA combining district required that at least “60% of the buildings along the street frontage of each block shall be set back a minimum of 10 feet to provide extra sidewalk, landscape, or public space” [§20-28.060(E)(3)]. Proposed setbacks from Dutton Avenue and W. 3rd Street are less than 10 feet. The applicant has requested a Density Bonus concession to allow a reduction of the required 10-foot setbacks.

Analysis of Concession Request: The proposed project site is an irregular-sized city block in both linear feet of street frontage and in gross square footage. The project proposes a minimum 10-foot sidewalk on the Dutton Avenue frontage with 0-2 feet

of additional setback from property line to building, and it proposes a minimum 8-foot wide sidewalk on the W. 3rd Street frontage with additional setback from the property line to building of 0-9.5 feet.

Vision Triangle – Section 20-30.070(E) requires that “the boundaries of a vision triangle are formed by drawing lines from the point of intersection of a lot’s street corner property lines to points 30 feet along the two property lines, and then connecting the two points with a straight line.” The proposed vision triangle would be calculated by drawing lines from the point of intersection of the Dutton Avenue and W. 3rd Street curbs to points 30 feet along the two street curbs, and then connecting the two points with a straight line. The building structure would be located a minimum of 5 feet behind the vision triangle.

Analysis of Concession Request: The proposed project site’s property lines are located at the rear of existing sidewalks/public rights-of-way, and the intersection is a controlled traffic intersection. The structure would be located well behind the vision triangle with at least 10 feet of sidewalk between the structure and street curbs. City Traffic and Engineering Development Services staff have reviewed the requested concession and concluded that granting of this concession would not have an adverse impact upon public health and safety or the physical environment.

Building Structure in public right-of-way – The project proposes construction of a building-integrated bus shelter, which would be located on private property, to comply with a City Transit requirement that a bus shelter be installed at this location. The bus shelter would achieve a required minimum 5-foot deep sheltered area by intruding into the proposed building 2 ½ feet and then incorporating a 2 ½ foot deep awning attached to the building. It would require dedication of a public access easement in order for the bus shelter to serve a public purpose. Section 20-30.110(B) prohibits any portion of any structure, including eaves or roof overhangs, [from extending] beyond a property line, or into a public or private service easement, an access easement, or street right-of-way. A concession to allow the building to overhang the public right-of-way as needed to implement the building-integrated bus shelter is requested.

Analysis of Concession Request: A building integrated bus shelter would allow for the unobstructed use of the W. 3rd Street pedestrian walkway, and it would allow for installation of a realtime arrival display that depends upon data network and power connections. City Traffic, Transit, and Engineering Development Services staff have reviewed the requested concession and concluded that granting of this concession would not have an adverse impact upon public health and safety or the physical environment.

Building Height – Zoning Code Section 20-23.040 (Table 2-7) allows a maximum building height of 45 feet in the Neighborhood Commercial (CN) Zoning District, and applicable Boulevard Street Type development standards contained in Section 20-28.060 (Table 2-16) allow a maximum building height of four stories. The proposed

building would be five stories tall and approximately 63-feet in height at its highest point. The applicant has requested a Density Bonus waiver to allow a building height exceeding the maximum allowable building height.

Analysis of Waiver Request: The application of building height development standards would preclude construction of this proposed housing development meeting the requirements of §20-31.060.

Driveway Clearance from Obstruction – Section 20-36.080(E) requires that the “nearest edge of a driveway apron or curb return shall be at least five feet from the nearest property line.” The project proposes a 20-foot wide entry/exit drive aisle for two-way traffic to be located within 5 feet of the property line, which would place the driveway apron within 5 feet of the property line.

Analysis of Waiver Request: The application of this development standard would preclude construction of this proposed housing development meeting the requirements of §20-31.060.

The project as proposed complies with all other Zoning Code Development Standards and applicable regulations.

4. Design Guidelines

Prior to submitting an application for Minor Design Review, the proposed project was reviewed by Design Review Board (DRB) who provided recommendations (see Attachment 5: DRB Concept Design Review). The applicant has responded to DRB recommendations by redesigning the rear yard area to include orchard style parking, an outdoor children’s play area, and landscaped open spaces. Design details are provided in Attachment 3: Dutton Flats Plan Set and Attachment 6: Design Narrative.

The proposed project has been reviewed and found to be consistent with the following City of Santa Rosa Design Guidelines:

Section 2: Downtown Area/Station Area	
Goal 2.1.8	Control onsite surface parking
Goal 2.1.10	Provide special treatment to gateway sites and terminated vistas.
Goal 2.1.12	Preserve the distinct character of each Sub-Area within the Station Area by designing new development with the unique characteristics and vision for the seven diverse neighborhoods.
Goal 2.2.2	Provide generous street-level windows.
Goal 2.2.3	Incorporate appropriately designed utility and mechanical equipment.
Goal 2.2.5	Reinforce pedestrian activity.
Goal 2.3.4	Accentuate the primary entrances of buildings.
Goal 2.3.7	Encourage superior design with well-crafted and detailed building facades,

	particularly at the street level.
Goal 2.3.8	Create buildings that provide human scale.
Goal 2.3.9	Encourage buildings with active and open facades that interest those walking by and create an active pedestrian-oriented streetscape.
Goal 2.3.11	Encourage buildings that minimize energy consumption.
Goal 2.3.12	Incorporate sustainable building principles into all new development.
Section 3.2: Multiple-Family Residential	
Note: This section primarily addresses the Medium Low, Medium and Medium High density (8-30 dwelling units per acre) land use designations as identified in the General Plan. Some provisions may not be appropriate for densities above 30 dwelling units per acre.	
Site Development Guidelines	
Neighborhood and Street Pattern	<p>Integrate multiple-family projects with pedestrian and bicycle circulation systems that extends to neighborhood centers, along creek corridors and to adjacent neighborhoods and shopping districts.</p> <p>If a multiple-family project is located across the street from a single family neighborhood, orient the buildings to the street with individual entries, patio areas and landscaping facing the single-family homes.</p>
Space Hierarchy	<p>Locate common facilities such as laundries and play areas so they are clearly intended for the residents and are not public amenities.</p> <p>Provide a visual buffer in the form of landscaping, privacy walls or semi-private patios between the interior of dwellings and sidewalks and common open spaces.</p>
Common Open Space	Include play equipment for children under the age of five in child play areas. The play area should be visible to as many units as possible to provide casual surveillance. Separate the play area from traffic. Provide benches or picnic tables for adults that are accompanying younger children.
Semi-Private Open Space	Provide each unit with a minimum of 40 square feet of semi-private open space directly adjacent to the unit.
Pedestrian Circulation	Provide sidewalks from dwellings to all common facilities such as; laundry, play areas, trash dumpsters, parking, etc.
Landscaping and Site Furniture	<p>Water all common areas using an automatic irrigation system.</p> <p>Plant street trees no more than 30 feet on center.</p> <p>Avoid the use of ivy as a ground cover as it creates a habitat attractive to rats.</p>
Building Design Guidelines	
Forms and Materials	<p>Break up the mass of larger structures with articulation of the form, use of color and the use of multiple materials, including: horizontal wood, cement fiber and composite siding, vertical wood siding, stucco, wood shingles, real and cultured masonry.</p> <p>Design all four sides of buildings.</p> <p>If a multiple-family project is located across the street from a single family neighborhood, orient the buildings to the street with individual entries, patio areas and landscaping facing the single-family homes.</p>
Entrances	Orient the main entrance of each unit, or the building to the street or to a common open area.

Massing Articulation	Incorporate features such as balconies, cantilevers, dormers, bay windows, patios, entries, accent materials, etc. to provide articulation and interest. Avoid buildings with a massive appearance. Divide buildings into segments that break down the scale.
---------------------------------	--

The project is located on the visually prominent corner of Dutton Avenue and W. 3rd Street. The building form is a 5-story 'L' shape that bounds the edges of both streets. The base along these arterial streets is comprised of an ~ 14-foot high cementitious base with storefront openings placed equally to provide a sense of balance. At the corner, a double height intersecting cube of ~ 18-feet is clad with corrugated metal, with a storefront that serves as the main entry to the project. Above the clad cube sits a rectangular orange/copper-colored tower. Both elements anchor the building and entire project on the street corner and respond meaningfully to the large, active intersection.

All required onsite parking is located behind the 'L' shaped building that fronts Dutton Avenue and W. 3rd Street. Parking areas are only visible from the Decoe Street drive entryway. A building entrance is located at the street sidewalk emphasizes the project's pedestrian orientation, and a small plaza area creates an inviting space at the intersection that is framed by the building's architecture.

The residential character of the neighborhood is maintained and enhanced by the proposed project's fully residential use. It's use creates a strong relationship with the multi-family development located diagonally across the intersection, and the building's ground-level community amenities spaces feature storefront designs that reflect nearby commercial retail uses, thus uniting existing development on all corners of this intersection. The project isolation from surrounding single-family detached and attached residential uses by existing arterial and minor streets allows this higher-density development to co-exist with these previously existing lower-density uses.

Residential units are distinguishable on the exterior by six projected vertical planes on the W. 3rd Street section and two projected vertical planes on the Dutton Avenue section. Each projected plane is comprised of side-by-side windows and deck openings stacked. Approximately 120 feet of the W. 3rd Street frontage and the Dutton Avenue frontage are differentiated from the 2-story community amenity space by a horizontal band comprised of board form concrete veneer. The elevations are further differentiated by vertical bands of color that help to identify residential units and add visual interest. Other exterior finish materials include metal and stucco panels, fiber cement siding, and glass storefront. Balconies and operable windows located at the upper levels and on portions of the ground floor express quality living of a home. The building has been designed to meet or exceed the CalGreen Tier 1 Standards, and the project is fully compliant with the city of Santa Rosa Climate Action Plan.

The landscape plan proposes a series of evenly spaced trees along Dutton Avenue

in tree wells within the 10 ft. wide sidewalk and along W. 3rd Street within the 8-foot wide sidewalk. The building is set back to allow landscape at the back of the sidewalk. Shrubs, ground cover, and flowering plants are proposed along the front, side and rear of the buildings. The parking area is shaded with trees at various locations and shrubs, ground cover, and flowering plants are proposed.

The project landscape design will comply with the latest Water Efficient Landscape Ordinance (WELO) (A.B. 1881) by utilizing a high-efficiency, low flow-type, sub-surface irrigation system with smart controller, flow, and rain sensing equipment. Additionally, the site will be divided into hydrozones based on exposure and plant types with similar water use requirements to ensure an efficient use of water. The proposed plant palette would be comprised of plant species with a low water use WUCOLS classification. Lastly, plants will be selected and spaced to allow them to grow naturally with minimal pruning. All of these factors will ensure the project will utilize less water than what will be allocated for the project (MAWA).

5. Neighborhood Comments

Public comments were received during the Neighborhood Meeting and in response to the Notice of Application and Notice of Public Hearing (see Attachment 7: Public comments through June 14, 2019). Comments generally described concerns about project size, traffic, parking, and lack of outdoor children's play space. Below are staff responses to expressed concerns.

Project Size Concerns (Number of Dwelling Units/Project Density) – The proposed project is a 41-unit, 100% affordable, multi-family development for income-qualified households earning 30-60% or less of Area Median Income (AMI). The 1.01-acre project site is located in the Neighborhood Commercial (CN) zoning district where multi-family development is permitted by right. The maximum density allowed is 30 units per acre. A State Density Bonus for affordable housing was requested and staff determined that the project is eligible for a 35% State Density Bonus which would allow a maximum project density of 43 units per acre.

Traffic Concerns – A Focused Traffic Study prepared by a licensed professional was submitted on May 14, 2019 (see Attachment 8: Focused Traffic Study dated May 14, 2019). The Focused Traffic Study analyzed the anticipated number of new trips that would be generated by the project. The analysis concluded that the project would generate a total of 223 trips per day, with 15 trips during a.m. peak hours and 18 during p.m. peak hours. Given the project's location, these trips would head east or west on W. 3rd Street. The Focused Traffic Study has been reviewed by City Traffic engineers, and public comments and concerns expressed about current traffic levels at the Dutton/W. 3rd intersection have been shared with them as well. They have concluded that the Dutton Flats development will have a negligible effect on this intersection. The project's Focused Traffic Study is available for review.

Parking Concerns – The Dutton Flats project proposes 41 on-site parking spaces, and +80 indoor bicycle parking spaces for a 100% affordable housing development located within the Downtown Station Area Plan boundary. City Zoning Code Section 20-36.040(G)(Table 3-4) establishes the minimum parking requirement for Affordable Residential Units located in the Downtown Station Area Plan boundary at 1 reserved space per unit. Therefore, the project meets the minimum parking requirement under the current Zoning Code. Additionally, the project is:

- located within ½ mile of SMART's Santa Rosa Downtown Station and within ¾ miles of the City's Transit Mall;
- less than a mile from commercial retail goods and services available in the immediate area, along the Sebastopol Road corridor, and in Downtown Santa Rosa;
- has access to dedicated on-street bicycle facilities on Dutton Ave. and W 3rd Street;
- served by pedestrian infrastructure; and
- within ½ mile of the Prince Memorial/Santa Rosa Creek Greenways and Joe Rodota Trail multi-use paths and various local parks.

Planning staff analysis of on-street parking within ¼ mile of the proposed project indicates that there are at least 68 shared on-street parking spaces within ¼ mile of the proposed Dutton Flats project.

The project will be required to construct a bus stop pull-out and bus shelter to service both Santa Rosa CityBus and Sonoma County Transit bus routes. Additionally, Dutton Flats developers are exploring with City Transit options to provide Real Time Arrival data at the bus shelter and a Dutton Flats resident voucher program to encourage CityBus ridership.

The project proposes to encourage bicycling as an alternate mode of transportation by providing a Bicycle Kitchen in the Community Amenities Area. The Bicycle Kitchen would feature secure, indoor parking for +80 bicycles and space to conduct bicycle maintenance.

Outdoor Children's Play Space – In response to DRB and neighborhood comments, an outdoor children's play area is included in the proposed site plan design.

6. Public Improvements/On-Site Improvements

Required public improvements would include installation of new, expanded sidewalks along Dutton Avenue and W. 3rd Street frontages; development of a bus pullout on W. 3rd Street in front of the property along with a building-integrated bus shelter, and street and sidewalk improvements on Decoe Street.

FISCAL IMPACT

Approval of this action does not have a fiscal impact on the General Fund.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT

The proposed project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and qualifies for an exemption under California Government Code Section 65457 and Section 15182 (Residential Projects Pursuant to a Specific Plan) of the State CEQA Guidelines. These provisions apply to residential Projects where a public agency has prepared an Environmental Impact Report (EIR) on a specific plan. On October 9, 2007, the City Council, concurrent with the adoption of the Downtown Station Area Specific Plan (Specific Plan), certified the Specific Plan EIR (SCH 2006072104). The density, design, and infrastructure plan under the proposed project is consistent with the adopted Specific Plan in that the level and intensity of the proposed developments and the locations of the developments are consistent with the Specific Plan. No special circumstances or potential new impacts related to the Project has been identified that would necessitate further environmental review beyond the impacts and issues already disclosed and analyzed in the Specific Plan EIR. The Specific Plan EIR adequately addressed environmental issues related to the development of the entire Specific Plan area, including the subject property. Therefore, the proposed Project qualifies for the exemption under CEQA Guidelines Section 15182, and California Government Code Section 65457, no further environmental review is required.

The Project qualifies for a Class 32 exemption under California Government Code Section 15332 (In-fill Development Projects) of the State CEQA Guidelines in that the Project is consistent with Santa Rosa General Plan 2035, the Downtown Station Area Specific Plan, and the current City of Santa Rosa Zoning Code; the Project is located within City of Santa Rosa jurisdiction, the Project site is 1.01 gross acres, and the project site is substantially surrounded by residential or commercial development; the Project site is not located within a designated habitat area for any endangered, rare or threatened species; the Project will not result in any significant effects relating to traffic, noise, air quality, or water quality; and the Project site is adequately served by all required utilities and public services.

BOARD/COMMISSION/COMMITTEE REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Not applicable.

NOTIFICATION

The project was noticed as a public hearing per the requirements of Chapter 20-66 of the City Code. Notification of this public hearing was provided by posting an on-site sign, publishing notice in a newspaper of general circulation, mailed notice to surrounding property owners, electronic notice to parties that had expressed interest in

projects taking place in this geographic area of Santa Rosa, and bulletin board postings at City Hall and on the City website. Pursuant to Government Code Section 65091, where necessary, the City has incorporated notice procedures to the blind, aged, and disabled communities. These procedures include audio amplifier/assistive listening device support at public meetings, closed captioning, and optical character recognition conversion of electronic notices.

ISSUES

There are no unresolved issues remaining with the project.

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 Location Map

Attachment 2 Project Description dated received by the City on April 15, 2019

Attachment 3 Revised Plan Set dated received by the City on June 15, 2019

Attachment 4 Notice of Density Bonus Eligibility dated June 14, 2019

Attachment 5 DRB Concept Design Review Minutes dated February 7, 2019

Attachment 6 Design Narrative dated received by the City on April 15, 2019

Attachment 7 Public Comments received through June 14, 2019

Attachment 8 Focused Traffic Study prepared by W-Trans dated May 14, 2019

Resolution 1/Engineering Development Services Exhibit "A"

CONTACT

Andrew Trippel, City Planner

atrippel@srcity.org

707.543.3223