

CITY OF SANTA ROSA
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
STAFF REPORT FOR CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD
August 21, 2019

PROJECT TITLE

Thomas Replacement House

ADDRESS/LOCATION

124 W. 6th St.

ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBER

010-166-004

APPLICATION DATE

June 16, 2019

REQUESTED ENTITLEMENTS

Major Landmark Alteration Permit

PROJECT SITE ZONING

R-1-6-H-SA

PROJECT PLANNER

Adam Ross

APPLICANT

Charlotte and Jack Thomas

PROPERTY OWNER

Charlotte and Jack Thomas

FILE NUMBER

LMA19-006

APPLICATION COMPLETION DATE

July 16, 2019

FURTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED

No additional discretionary actions are required.

GENERAL PLAN DESIGNATION

Low Density Residential

RECOMMENDATION

Approval

For Cultural Heritage Board Meeting of: August 21, 2019

CITY OF SANTA ROSA
CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD

TO: CHAIR EDMONDSON AND MEMBERS OF THE CULTURAL
HERITAGE BOARD
FROM: ADAM ROSS, CITY PLANNER
PLANNING & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
SUBJECT: THOMAS REPLACEMENT HOUSE
AGENDA ACTION: ADOPT RESOLUTION

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning and Economic Development Department recommends that the Cultural Heritage Board, by resolution, approve a Major Landmark Alteration Permit for the construction of a new 1,789 square-foot detached single-family dwelling and a new detached garage with an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) above the garage to replace a 1,790 square-foot home destroyed by a house fire in the West End Preservation District, proposed for 124 W. 6th St., Santa Rosa, Assessor's Parcel No. 010-166-004.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Landmark Alteration Permit is for the construction of a new 1,789 square-foot single-family residence and a 627 square-foot two-car, detached garage at the rear of the property, and a 634 square-foot ADU above the garage at 124 W. 6th Street in Santa Rosa's West End Preservation District. Because the proposed project incorporates West End Preservation District character defining elements and applicable Design Guidelines for New Construction, described in the *Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties*, Planning and Economic Development is recommending approval.

BACKGROUND

In October of 2017, the project site was destroyed by a house fire. The site was originally developed with a 1,790 square-foot home, constructed in the 1890's with additions to the home taking place between the 1920's through the 1970's.

On May 15, 2019, the Cultural Heritage Board (CHB) reviewed the proposed project as a Concept Review item. The CHB provided comments and recommendations for the project.

On June 19, 2019, the Applicant formerly submitted for the Major Landmark Alteration Permit for the site with considerations and changes in responses to the CHB recommendations.

1. Project Description

The proposed project is for the construction of a new 1,789 square-foot, two-story single-family dwelling with a detached garage with a second-story Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) in the West End Preservation District to replace a two-story, single-family dwelling unit that was destroyed by a house fire in October 2017. The initial house was constructed circa 1890 and was listed as a contributor to the Historic District. It was repeatedly remodeled and added to over the last century, with the street side facades covered with aluminum siding.

The proposed new house features a simple footprint, classic bayfront windows, and a front and rear porch. Typical of construction in the West End Historic District, the new 2-car, detached garage will replace the previous street front-loaded garage, and a detached carport will be located at the rear of the new house, accessed by a side driveway. The proposed Carriage Style garage will include an accessory dwelling unit above. The new buildings will be energy-efficient, employ green construction, have solar panels, and allow more area for water conserving landscaping. The setback on Pierson Street will be increased from the original five (5) feet to 10 feet, opening up the corner for greater visibility of traffic on both West 6th and Pierson Streets.

The property is located within the West End Preservation District. The District is characterized by modest, single-story vernacular houses on narrow but deep lots. The predominant architectural styles are bungalow, Queen Anne, or Colonial cottages. The period of significance for the district is identified in the Zoning Code as 1870s to 1940s.

2. Surrounding Land Uses

North: Single-Family Residential (historic)

South: Santa Rosa Creek (Prince Memorial Greenway)

East: Vacant Lot

West: Single-Family Residential (historic)

The project site is located within a residential area reflecting Traditional Neighborhood design principles of the West End Preservation District. It is

surrounded by single-family residential development, an unimproved vacant lot to the east, and Santa Rosa Creek to the south.

3. Existing Land Use – Project Site

The site was previously developed for low density residential use with a single-family dwelling unit and a detached garage. The low-density residential use will continue.

4. Project History

April 11, 2019	Concept Application submitted
May 15, 2019	Concept Item before the CHB
June 19, 2019	Project Application submitted
July 9, 2019	Notice of Application Sent
July 19, 2019	Application Deemed Complete

PRIOR CITY COUNCIL REVIEW (Indicate N/A if not applicable)

Not applicable.

ANALYSIS

The proposed Thomas House replaces a previously existing 1,790 square-foot single-family dwelling with a one and a half car, detached garage that were destroyed in a 2017 fire, unrelated to the Tubbs Fire. Construction of a new 1789 square-foot single family residence and a 590 square-foot detached garage is proposed with a 634 square-foot ADU above the garage is proposed to replace the damaged structures. In accordance with Zoning Code [Section 20-28.040, subsections D and E](#), proposed development is evaluated using the West End Preservation District Character Defining Elements as a district-specific framework, as well as the standards set forth in Section [20.28.040.E](#), and includes the Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

1. General Plan

The General Plan land use designation for the site is Low Density Residential (2 to 8 units per acre) and the site was developed at a density of 6 units per acre. The proposed development would not result in a change of density.

2. Other Applicable Plans

The project site is located within the Downtown Station Area Specific Plan boundary; however, the Downtown Station Area Plan does not regulate development of single-family detached housing.

3. Zoning

The subject parcel is zoned R-1-6-H-SA (Residential; Single-Family; Historic; Station Area), which is consistent with the parcel's Low Density Residential General Plan Land Use designation. The proposed development of the single-family dwelling is a permitted use in the R-1-6-H-SA Zoning District. The proposed project is compliant with primary building separation, lot coverage, height limit, landscaping, and parking development standards for the R-1-6-H-SA Zoning District.

The Applicant is requesting a 10-foot side corner and front setback. Zoning Code Section 20-22.050, Table 2-4, normally requires that a side corner and front setback be 15 feet; however, Zoning Code Section 20-28.040(E)(4)(a-c) grants the review authority the ability to permit setbacks that are in compatible within a Historic Preservation District, provided:

1. The review authority first finds that the reduced setback will not significantly impair the residential privacy of the proposed structures or any adjacent existing or anticipated residential structures or use; and
2. The review authority first finds that the reduced setback enhances and protects the historic development pattern of the preservation district or any adjacent contributing properties and that approving a reduced setback facilitates a superior project.

Staff has reviewed the information provided by the Applicant, as well as the existing homes in the area and recommends that the CHB approve the reduced setbacks. Fencing is proposed with the project and a Minor Conditional Use Permit for the fencing shall be required for all fencing greater than three (3) feet within the corner side setback as proposed with this project. Compliance with the City's Outdoor Lighting and Noise Ordinances is required.

4. Historic Preservation Review Standards

The proposed project site is located within the West End Preservation District boundary and is subject to additional regulation by the Historic Combining District (-H). Historic Combining District regulations allow any land use normally allowed in the primary zoning district, subject to: the land use permit requirements of the primary district; specific site development standards of the -H combining district; the requirements of Zoning Code Chapter 20-58; the West End Character Defining Elements specific framework; the *Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties*; and, The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

-H combining district specific site development standards

The proposed use is permitted by right in the R-1-6 Zoning District. The height of the proposed structure is approximately 28.25 feet, which does not exceed the

maximum allowable height of 35 feet.

The Applicant is requesting a 10-foot side corner and front setback. Zoning Code Section 20-22.050, Table 2-4, normally requires that a side corner and front setback be 15 feet; however, Zoning Code Section 20-28.040(E)(4)(a-c) grants the review authority the ability to permit setbacks that are in compatible within a Historic Preservation District, provided:

1. The review authority first finds that the reduced setback will not significantly impair the residential privacy of the proposed structures or any adjacent existing or anticipated residential structures or use; and
2. The review authority first finds that the reduced setback enhances and protects the historic development pattern of the preservation district or any adjacent contributing properties and that approving a reduced setback facilitates a superior project.

Staff has reviewed the information provided by the Applicant as well as the existing homes in the area and recommends that the CHB approve the reduced setbacks.

Zoning Code Chapter 20-58

[Section 20-58.060.C.2.e](#) requires a Major Landmark Alteration Permit for construction of a new primary dwelling. The Cultural Heritage Board is required to consider criteria provided in [Section 20-58.060.F](#) in determining whether to grant or deny a Landmark Alteration Permit.

West End Preservation District Character Defining Elements

Character defining elements are identified in Zoning Code [Section 20-28.040.F.5](#). The proposed project reflects the following character defining elements:

- Modest, vernacular house on a narrow, deep lot.
- Horizontal wood siding exterior building material with vertical window orientation.
- Orientation to the street with a usable entry porch.
- On-site covered parking in a detached garage set behind the main house near the property lines and accessible by a narrow, Hollywood-style driveway.
- A front and corner side yard setback that is less than a 15-foot setback by approximately 5 feet and continues the irregular setback pattern of single-family dwellings along W. 7th Street and Pierson St.
- Additional architectural features include a simple footprint, classic bayfront windows, and a front and rear porch.

Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties: Design Guidelines for New Construction

Successful new or infill construction will complement a historic area and enhance its overall character. A particular architectural style or design is not specified for new construction. Scale, mass, and size of building in relation to lot size and adjacent structures may be more important than decorative details.

- **Height** – While the existing two-story homes within the West End Preservation District have partially subterranean first floors, resulting in a lower overall height, the proposed project provides a nine-foot first-story ceiling height and an eight-foot second-story ceiling height, for an overall height of approximately 28.25-feet. The proposed height is compatible with adjacent one- and two-story structures in that the overall height is two to five feet taller than most surrounding second-story homes, and well within the 35-foot height restriction of the West End Preservation District.
- **Proportion** – The lot dimensions of the proposed project site are approximately 120 x 60 feet. The project lot is 39 x 26 feet, which is less than the overall dimensions of the previously existing structure, resulting in a newer building more compatible with the West End Preservation District of modest small homes on long deep lots.
- **Rhythm** – The entrance of the proposed structure is oriented toward the street, and the placement of windows and entry door on the main façade is reflective of the preservation district's vernacular design.
- **Setbacks** – The proposed front yard setback of 10-feet is more than that of the previously existing structure and the new garage has moved to the rear of the property and is more consistent with the West End Preservation District's existing detached accessory structures. Additionally, this project does not propose front yard parking within the required setback or a highly visible front-loaded garage.
- **Materials and Structures** – The proposed project materials include Hardie plank beveled siding with fish scale shingles on the front elevation roof pitch. Vinyl windows are proposed due to budget constraints and exterior mullions are not available with vinyl windows. However, wood windows are not precluded for a future installation.
- **Roof Shape** – The proposed roof design of the main dwelling unit features a gable roof that is mostly flush in the rear while the front is accentuated with a stepped roof above a bay window that runs up the full height of the front elevation. The detached garage provides a gambrel style roof that provides a separate distinct style from the main house without clashing between the two.
- **Architectural Details and Decorative Features** – Decorative wood posts have been added to the front porch. Curved shingle siding is located on the front elevation above the ceiling line to the top of roof pitch with a

decorative trim treatment located at the top of roof pitch.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

Planning staff reviewed the proposed project in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and found the following standards to be applicable. These standards are presented below.

Standard 1 states that: "A property shall be used for its historic use or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment." The property's historic use is single-family residential. The proposed project would not result in a change to the historic use.

Standard 2 states that: "The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided." The project site was destroyed in October 2017 due to a house fire, and the property lost all historical architectural features. The previous project had several additions throughout the 1900's losing most of the original home's historic features. The new project will use part of the original home's foundation, and provide similar roofs, materials, sizing, and provide a front porch typical of the West End Preservation District; therefore, the project will be in keeping with the original home's historic features.

The proposed project site features an accessory garage structure located to the rear of the site. The previous garage was set back approximately five feet from the curb on 6th Street. The project proposes construction of a new driveway extending from the street to the accessory structure located in the rear of the property using the existing curb cut.

Standard 9 states that: "New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment." The proposed project reflects many of the West End Preservation District Character Defining Elements and complies with most Design Guidelines for New Construction identified in the Processing Review Procedure. Notable differences include an increased side corner and front setback area, a new porch, use of vinyl windows, standardization of window fenestrations and window sizes, uniform application of architectural details such as exterior window moldings and sidings. These aspects of the project differentiate the proposed structure as new construction.

5. Neighborhood Comments

Staff received one neighborhood comment in response to the project Notice of Application. The comment is included in Attachment 9 – Neighborhood Comments. The comment is in support of the project with concern over the line-of-sight on the corner of Pierson Street and West 6th Street. The new layout of the project increases the line of sight and complies with all Vision Triangle

requirements, per Zoning Code Section 20-30.060(C), Figure 3-3.

6. Public Improvements/On-Site Improvements

No public improvements are required. On-site improvements include construction of a new driveway and new walkway.

FISCAL IMPACT

Approval of this action does not have a fiscal impact on the General Fund.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT

The proposed project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and staff has determined that the Project qualifies for a Class 3 Categorical Exemption under CEQA Guidelines Section 1530.3 in that the project is the construction of one new single-family residence, which is the maximum density allowable on this legal parcel.

The City has further determined that no exceptions to the exemptions apply and there is no reasonable possibility that the activity will have a significant effect on the environment due to unusual circumstances (CEQA Guidelines section 15300.2.).

BOARD/COMMISSION/COMMITTEE REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATIONS

On May 15, 2019, the Cultural Heritage Board reviewed the project as a Concept Item. At that time, the CHB provided the following recommendations and comments:

Consider wood or fiberglass-framed windows for thinner sightlines and more glazing-to-frame ratio, avoiding heaviness of vinyl.	The pricing for the wood framed windows is financially burdening at this time and the applicant is proposing vinyl windows. However, the use of vinyl windows does not preclude the future installation of wood framed or fiberglass-framed windows.
Modern ornamentation is acceptable but do not use ornamentation.	The applicant utilizes modern ornamentation at the top of roof pitch and at the front porch columns.
Create a welcoming view with window alignment and symmetry.	The alignment of the windows has now been revised to provide symmetry.
Consider pulling back the dormers on the Accessory Dwelling Unit to show the roofing and create proportion	The dormers have been pulled back on the Accessory Dwelling Unit.
Include handrail and complete lighting plan details at the next submittal	Decorative millwork has been included at the front porch posts. Decorative railings have been added to the front porch and

	steps. The front porch light is shown as a “carriage style” wall mounted lamp.
Adding a second window to the bathroom would be an important addition to create balance	A second window has been added to the upstairs master bathroom.
Consider adding exterior mullions to the glazing to break up the large panes	Exterior mullions are incompatible with vinyl windows. However, the windows have been redesigned since the first proposal, replacing the large front picture windows with two smaller ones and adjusting the east and west windows for a more balanced appearance.
Replace the greenhouse window with the small projected bay window at the street-side (west) elevation	The greenhouse window has been replaced with a projecting bay window and roof on the west elevation.
Consider drop siding in the hardy-plank series	Per the applicant, the original redwood siding was round-edge drop siding, but was replaced several times with beveled siding during the 1950's and 1960's and because of budget constraints, the applicant is requesting the approval of hardy-plank siding.

NOTIFICATION

The Project was noticed as a public hearing per the requirements of Chapter 20-66 of the City Code. Notification of this public hearing was provided by posting an on-site sign, publishing notice in a newspaper of general circulation, mailed notice to surrounding property owners, electronic notice to parties that had expressed interest in projects taking place in this geographic area of Santa Rosa, and bulletin board postings at City Hall and on the City website. Pursuant to Government Code Section 65091, where necessary, the City has incorporated notice procedures to the blind, aged, and disabled communities. These procedures include audio amplifier/assistive listening device support at public meetings, closed captioning, and optical character recognition conversion of electronic notices.

ISSUES

The project as submitted did not present any major issues. There are no unresolved issues remaining with the project.

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1	Disclosure Form
Attachment 2	Location Map
Attachment 3	Project Description
Attachment 4	Conceptual Project Plans
Attachment 5	Response to CHB Comments on May 15, 2019
Attachment 6	Project Plans
Attachment 7	Character Defining Elements for Residential Districts
Attachment 8	West End Character Defining Elements
Attachment 9	West End Historic District Summary Sheet
Attachment 10	Neighborhood Comments received through July 30, 2019
Resolution/Exhibit "A"	

CONTACT

Adam Ross, City Planner
aross@srcity.org
(707) 543-4705