

CITY OF SANTA ROSA
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
STAFF REPORT FOR CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD
September 4, 2019

PROJECT TITLE

Carpenter Urban Cottages

APPLICANT

David Carpenter; Alima Silverman

ADDRESS/LOCATION

715 Tupper Street; 25 Rae Street

PROPERTY OWNER

David Carpenter

ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBER

009-201-004; 009-201-009

FILE NUMBER

LMA15-013

APPLICATION DATE

August 18, 2015

APPLICATION COMPLETION DATE

July 23, 2019

REQUESTED ENTITLEMENTS

Major Landmark Alteration

FURTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED

None

PROJECT SITE ZONING

PD 0225-H (Planned Development,
Historic Combining District)

GENERAL PLAN DESIGNATION

Medium Density Residential

PROJECT PLANNER

Kristinae Toomians

RECOMMENDATION

Approval

For Cultural Heritage Board Meeting of: September 4, 2019

CITY OF SANTA ROSA
CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD

TO: CHAIR EDMONDSON AND MEMBERS OF THE BOARD
FROM: KRISTINAE TOOMIANS, SENIOR PLANNER
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
SUBJECT: URBAN COTTAGES LANDMARK ALTERATION PERMIT

AGENDA ACTION: RESOLUTION

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning and Economic Development Department that the Cultural Heritage Board, by Resolution, approve a Landmark Alteration Permit for the construction of four multi-family dwellings in the Burbank Gardens Historic Preservation District, located at 715 Tupper Street and 25 Rae Street.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The project proposes construction of four residential cottages over two lots at 715 Tupper Street and 25 Rae Street. The Tupper Street parcel is currently developed with an 821-square-foot single-family home, built in vernacular style in 1906. The Rae Street parcel is vacant. A component of the project will be to improve Rae Street with pavement and curb, gutter, and sidewalk. Because the project proposes new residential units that meet General Plan densities while remaining sympathetic to the detached bungalow aesthetic of the neighborhood and without altering the existing residential structure, Planning and Economic Development is recommending approval of the Landmark Alteration Permit.

BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The project proposes to construct four residential cottages on two adjacent parcels at 25 Rae Street and 715 Tupper Street. Each cottage will have approximately 576-square-feet of floor area. The cottages are designed to be universally accessible, with no steps at the entry way and appropriately sized door clearances. The project parcels will include separate covered parking and outdoor space for each of the cottages as well as for the existing house, which will not be altered as part of this project.

Access to the units will be provided via the existing driveway on Tupper Street as well as through the paving and improvement of Rae Street. An existing shed will be demolished and several trees will be removed, including three of five coast live oaks and one eucalyptus, which will be mitigated for in accordance with the City's tree ordinance.

The project is located within the Burbank Gardens Preservation District. The district is characterized by modest, single-family homes, which are predominately bungalows. The period of significance for the district is identified in the Zoning Code as 1875 to 1940s.

2. Surrounding Land Uses

North: Unimproved Rae Street; Rae Street Park

South: Single-family homes

East: Single-family home with accessory dwelling unit; parking facility

West: Single-family homes

The project site is located in a predominately residential area and surrounded on three sides by single-family development. An unimproved section of Rae Street abuts the northern boundary of the project site and Rae Street Park, a public park with pedestrian connections to Sonoma Avenue is located to the north. Tupper Street is primarily occupied by single-story bungalow houses, with a few two-story or raised structures. To the east is a surface parking facility associated with the Bethlehem Towers affordable development beyond.

3. Existing Land Use – Project Site

The project site is divided into two parcels which were originally part of a larger parcel that extended from Tupper Street to Matanzas Creek. The Tupper Street parcel is developed with a single-story, 821 square-foot single-family cottage. A single-room accessory structure is located behind the existing residence. The Rae Street parcel is vacant and contains several ornamental and fruit trees in addition to a large eucalyptus.

4. Project History

On September 5, 2007, the Cultural Heritage Board reviewed a proposed triplex for the project site as a concept item. The same proposal returned to the Board on February 20, 2008, for additional concept review.

On January 2, 2013, the Department of Planning and Economic Development received applications proposing construction of four new units that would occupy the project parcels in addition to the existing house on Tupper Street (Urban Cottages).

On January 13, 2014, the original Urban Cottages applications were withdrawn.

On August 18, 2015, a new Landmark Alteration Permit application for the Urban Cottages project was received by Planning and Economic Development.

On October 28, 2015, a Notice of Application was mailed to property owners in the vicinity of the project site.

On February 8, 2019, the applicant submitted revised plans, which include covered parking areas, which serve as attachments between each pair of single-family attached residences.

ANALYSIS

1. General Plan

The General Plan land use designation for the site is Medium Density Residential, which allows a density of 8-18 units per acre. This designation permits a range of housing types, including single-family attached and multi-family developments. The project site is 12,500-square-feet, or 0.29-acres. The proposed development will result in a density of approximately 17 dwelling units per acre, which is within the allowable density limit.

2. Zoning

According to Zoning Code Section 20-28.040, the Burbank Gardens Preservation District was designated by the City Council on March 25, 2003, and established the period of significance for the District ranging from 1875-1940s. It identifies the following character defining elements:

The Burbank Gardens Preservation District is a fairly homogenous district of small single-family homes, predominately Bungalows representing the bulk of development that occurred in the 1920s and 1930s, with some examples of Italianate, Queen Anne, Colonial, Period Revival, and some post war styles.

Typical lots are narrow, generally measuring 40 to 50 feet. Houses generally follow a similar front setback on any given block face and front stoops or small porches create clearly defined entries with orientation to the street. Front yard fencing is generally three-foot tall picket fencing if any at all. Small front yards include informal landscaping. Single car garages are located at the rear of property, often on a side property line with narrow driveway access.

Houses are single story with some exceptions found in the northern portion of the district, closer to Santa Rosa Creek. The predominant exterior materials are wood (shingle, shiplap, and clapboard) and stucco. Architectural detailing is minimal and simple. Double hung wood windows are common.

Although some houses are found on Santa Rosa Avenue, in general the character along this outer edge of the district is different. Most district properties along Santa Rosa Avenue are considered noncontributing properties, although two National Register properties (Luther Burbank Home and Gardens and Park Apartments) are found along this strip.

The project parcel is located within the PD-0225 (Planned Development) Zoning District with a historic preservation overlay. The PD-0225 Burbank Gardens Neighborhood Planned Development District is divided into various zoning subdistricts. The subject site is identified as R-3-PD, multiple-family zone. The PD Policy Statement recommends that development in the R-3 sections be permitted to maximum densities, so long as the proposed project is designed to be compatible with the neighborhood or utilize an appropriate historical architectural design. It also requires that parking facilities, including guest parking, be easily accessible in order to encourage off-street parking.

A Landmark Alteration Permit is required because the project involves new construction of residential units within a preservation district.

Pursuant to Zoning Code Section 20-58.060 (F), the Board should consider the following criteria to the extent applicable in their discussion:

1. The consistency, or lack thereof, of the proposed change with the original architectural style and details of the building;
2. The compatibility of the proposed change with any adjacent or nearby landmark structures or preservation district structures;
3. The consistency and/or compatibility of the proposed colors, textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features and details with the time period of the building's construction, and/or adjacent structures;
4. Whether the proposed change will destroy or adversely affect an important architectural feature or features;
5. The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (1983 Revision); and
6. Other matters, criteria and standards as may be adopted by resolution of the CHB.

A Major Landmark Alteration Permit is required because: the site is located within the Burbank Gardens Preservation District and the existing residence at 715 Tupper Street is a contributor to the district; and, it also involves new construction of four multi-family units.

The California Department of Parks and Recreation Primary Record, prepared in 2002 describes the structure built in 1906 as "Vernacular Cottage," and describes it as a contributor to the historic district.

The *Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties* states that the applicant can provide information regarding the property and its historic significance. It states, "Many property owners have detailed knowledge of their properties, including names of former owners and dates of major alterations." It goes on to state that, "the applicant should work closely with the Cultural Heritage Board to see how much information is needed and whether the information adequate enough for the Board to render a determination."

The applicant self-prepared a Historic Structures Report, dated January 15, 2018, which identifies that the original residence was 376-square-foot and built in 1906. Front and rear additions are evidenced through examination of the floor joists. The existing 325-square-foot detached accessory building has no permit on record and was not indicated on the 1957 Sanborn Map.

The applicant does not propose any exterior alterations to the existing residence but proposes to demolish the existing detached accessory structure.

The new multi-family units are proposed in a cottage style, attached by a covered carport.

3. Design Guidelines

The following goals and policies, from the Santa Rosa Design Guidelines, Section 4.7- Historic Properties and Districts, are applicable to the proposed project:

Goals

- To preserve Santa Rosa's historic heritage.
- To encourage maintenance and retention of historic structures and districts.
- To ensure that alterations to historic buildings are compatible with the character of the structure and the neighborhood.

Policies

G – New Construction

1. Design new construction so that the architectural character of the neighborhood is maintained. Specific architectural styles are not mandated. Designs for new construction can also be contemporary.
2. Design new construction to be compatible in height and proportion with adjacent structures.
3. Use materials and designs similar to that found throughout the neighborhood.

Staff response: The applicant proposes to preserve the existing single-family cottage-style residence, located at 715 Tupper Street, and construct four new multi-family units behind the existing residence. One of the units will front onto Rae Street. The applicant proposes cottage-style, two-story units. Each pair of new units will be attached by a shared carport. The new residential units will be clad in cement lap siding, with shed dormers, 12/12 pitch asphalt cool roofs, vinyl thermal windows, solar collectors, and solar hot water. The applicant proposes a corrugated metal roof carport that will connect each pair of new units. The total height of the units is 25-feet to the top of the roof. The proposed cottage-style units, with siding, gabled roof and porch are in keeping with the existing cottage-style residence.

4. Historic Preservation Review Standards

The following guidelines from the City's Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Buildings are applicable to the proposed project:

Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties

Section G Design Guidelines – New Construction

1. The height of new construction in a Preservation District should be compatible with adjacent structures.
2. New construction should match adjacent structures in proportions of width to height.

3. New construction within Preservation Districts should maintain this rhythm of window and door openings on the main façade. Entrances should be oriented to the street rather than to an alley. Blank walls or garage doors should not dominate the facade.
4. Setbacks should be consistent with adjacent structures and should not vary more than ten percent with the adjacent structures.
5. New construction should be compatible with adjacent buildings on the block.
6. Roofs for new construction should be compatible with adjacent structures.

Staff response: The applicant proposes to preserve the existing single-family cottage-style residence, located at 715 Tupper Street. The proposed cottage-style units are in keeping with the nearby contributing structures, in that they will be clad in siding, and have a gabled roof and porch that are reminiscent of the cottage-style residence. One of the units will front onto Rae Street, which will be upgraded with new pavement, curb, gutter, and sidewalk. The applicant proposes to demolish the existing 325-square-foot detached accessory building, which has no permit on record and was not indicated on the 1957 Sanborn Map.

5. Neighborhood Comments
No neighborhood comments have been received to date.

6. Public Improvements/On-Site Improvements

The applicant will be required to improve Rae Street project frontage to Rural Street Standards, which will include curb, gutter. The applicant will also be required to repair any damaged sidewalk along Tupper Street (See Exhibit A).

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 – Disclosure Form
Attachment 2 – Location Map
Attachment 3 – Neighborhood Context Map
Attachment 4 – Project Plans
Attachment 6 – DPR Form
Attachment 7 – Historic Structures Report
Attachment 8 – PD-0225 Policy Statement
Attachment 9 – Applicant Correspondence (Background)
Attachment 10 – Late Correspondence
Resolution
Exhibit A

CONTACT

Kristinae Toomians, Senior Planner
Planning and Economic Development
100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3
(707) 543-4692
KToomians@SRCity.org