

CITY OF SANTA ROSA
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
STAFF REPORT FOR CULTURAL RESOURCE BOARD
NOVEMBER 6, 2019

PROJECT TITLE

Meuser Remodel

ADDRESS/LOCATION

403 Brown Street

ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBER

009-262-001

APPLICATION DATE

May 7, 2019

REQUESTED ENTITLEMENTS

Landmark Alteration Permit

PROJECT SITE ZONING

PD 0225-H (Planned Development within the Historic combining district)

PROJECT PLANNER

Susie Murray

APPLICANT

Brian Meuser

PROPERTY OWNER

Brian Meuser & Lisa Kranz Meuser

FILE NUMBER

LMA19-007

APPLICATION COMPLETION DATE

May 7, 2019

FURTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED

Building Permit

GENERAL PLAN DESIGNATION

Low Density Residential

RECOMMENDATION

Approval

Agenda Item #6.1
For Cultural Heritage Board Meeting of: November 6, 2019

CITY OF SANTA ROSA
CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD

TO: CHAIR EDMONDSON AND MEMBERS OF THE BOARD

FROM: SUSIE MURRAY, SENIOR PLANNER
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

SUBJECT: MEUSER REMODEL

AGENDA ACTION: RESOLUTION

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended by the Planning and Economic Development Department that the Cultural Heritage Board, by resolution, approve a Landmark Alteration Permit for the Meuser Remodel.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Meuser Remodel (project) proposes to remove the second story of the residential structure; construct an addition at the southwest corner of the house; construct a new combined garage/studio accessory structure; and replace the existing fence and expand the fence line for the property located at 403 Brown Street; Assessor's Parcel No. 009-262-001. The Cultural Heritage Board is being asked to act on a Landmark Alteration Permit. No other entitlements are required.



BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The subject site is located on the southwest corner of the intersection of Brown Street and Wheeler Street in the Burbank Gardens Preservation District. The proposed changes include the following:

- Remove the second story of the residential structure, effectively restoring the street-facing façades to the original appearance and construct a new composition shingle roof to match the existing roofing material.
- Construct an addition at the southwest corner of the house in a location that is not readily visible from the public right-of-way. The project will reuse materials when possible, and new materials will be selected to match the existing exterior finishing materials.
- Construct a combined garage/studio structure that will replace two structures, a garage and studio, that were previously removed. Exterior materials on the new garage/studio will be in keeping with the dwelling.
- Replace the existing fence with a six-foot Craftsman-style redwood fence and expand the fence line. The fence that parallels the Brown Street frontage will be 18 feet behind the sidewalk. The fence that parallels Wheeler Street will be placed 14 feet behind the sidewalk aligned with the house.

2. Surrounding Land Uses

The parcel is surrounded by properties developed with similar single-family residential uses.

3. Existing Land Use – Project Site

The subject property is developed with a single-family dwelling. Through the recent approval of an over-the-counter demolition permit, several non-contributing accessory structures were removed.

4. Project History

On May 7, 2019, Planning and Economic Development accepted the subject application requesting a Landmark Alteration Permit for the proposed exterior modifications.

On August 2, 2019, Building Permit No. B19-4255 was issued for the demolition of three accessory structures.

PRIOR CITY COUNCIL REVIEW

Not applicable.

ANALYSIS

1. General Plan

The General Plan land use designation for the site is Low Density Residential, which allows residential development at a density of two-eight units per acre and is intended primarily for single family residential development. General Plan Goal HP-B provides direction to preserve Santa Rosa's historic structures and neighborhoods.

2. Priority Development Areas

The property is within the Santa Rosa Avenue Corridor priority development area.

3. Zoning

The subject property is located within the PD 0225-H (Burbank Gardens Planned Development, within the Historic combining district), which is consistent with the General Plan land use designation. The planned development boundary map, Exhibit A to the attached Policy Statement, further identifies the site in the R-2-PD zone, which defers to the R-2 zoning district for development standards. The following development standards are relevant to this project:

Element	Front and coner side yard setbacks	Interior side and accessory structure rear setbacks	Allowable height	Allowable coverage	Complies with Zoning Code
Primary Dwelling	10 Feet	5 Feet	35 Feet	---	Yes
Garage	19 Feet	5 Feet	16 Feet	---	Yes
Lot Coverage	---	---	---	50 Percent	Yes
Six-foot Fence	10 Feet	None	*6 Feet	---	Yes

Zoning Code Chapter 20-28 discusses preservation districts. The Burbank Gardens Preservation District was established on March 25, 2003, and identifies 1875 through the 1940s as the period of significance. Pursuant to Zoning Code Section 20-28.040(K) character defining elements of the district include small single-family homes, predominately Bungalows, which represents the bulk of development that occurred in the 1920s and 1930s. Other types of architecture within the district include Italianate, Queen Anne, Colonial, Period Revival, and some post war styles. In addition to architecture, Cultural Heritage Board Resolution No. 209, dated March 15, 2006 (attached), adds hardscape, landscape and site planning as potential character defining elements.

Pursuant to Zoning Code Section [20-58.060 \(Landmark Alteration Permits\)](#), the project requires a Landmark Alteration Permit because it involves changes to street-facing facades. Prior to taking action, the Cultural Heritage Board is required to consider the following criteria, provided in Zoning Code Chapter 20-58, in determining whether to grant or deny the permit.

- The consistency, or lack thereof, of the proposed change with the original architectural style and details of the building;
- The compatibility of the proposed change with any adjacent or nearby landmark structures or preservation district structures;
- The consistency and/or compatibility of the proposed colors, textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features and details with the time period of the building's construction, and/or adjacent structures;
- Whether the proposed change will destroy or adversely affect an important architectural feature or features;
- The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (1983 Revision); and
- Other matters, criteria and standards as may be adopted by resolution of the CHB.

A Historic Resource & Consistency Analysis (historic analysis), prepared by Lilly Bianco, dated May 6, 2019 (attached), concludes:

The modifications proposed under the "403 Brown Street Rehabilitation Project" would be sensitive to the identified historic resource. All Modifications proposed preserve the essential character defining features of the building and proposed new construction at the property side and rear, including detached accessory structures, feature a simplified compatible design that is largely consistent with what exists, thereby retaining the integrity of the subject property and ensuring that the historic relationship of the property to the surrounding district is maintained.

Refer to the Historic Preservation Review section of this report for more discussion.

4. Design Guidelines

Consistent with the General Plan, the Design Guidelines that provide direction to preserve Santa Rosa's historic heritage; encourage maintenance and retention of historic structures and district; and ensure that alterations to historic buildings are compatible with the character of the structure and the neighborhood.

Relevant policies addressing accessory structures, additions and fences may be reviewed online at [Design Guidelines, Section 4.7- Historic Properties and Districts](#). Refer to the Historic Preservation Review Standards section of this report for more discussion.

5. Historic Preservation Review Standards

There are several guidelines pertaining to the construction of accessory structures, additions to the existing structures and design/placement of fences on historic properties. Listed below is a summary of those guidelines as they pertain to this project; a comprehensive list can be viewed at [Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties](#).

Section A – Accessory Buildings

- A reconstructed garage should occupy the original building footprint, wherever possible, be placed at the rear of the property, and should reflect the same materials and design of the primary dwelling.
- A new garage, carport, or accessory building should be in proper scale for the property and have an appropriate site relation to the main structure as well as surrounding structures.

Section B – Additions

- Construct additions so that there is the least possible loss of historic fabric. Also, ensure that character-defining features of the historic building are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed. Additions should be designed so that they are differentiated from the historic building.
- Limit the size and scale of an addition so that it does not visually overpower the original structure and should be located where it is as inconspicuously as possible.

Section D – Fences

- Fencing materials and design should be compatible with the architectural style of the primary structure on the lot and should not obscure the front elevation of the primary structure on the property. Therefore, front yard privacy fences should not be allowed.
- Structural members of a fence should be turned in to face the property. The finished side of the fence should be presented to the street.
- On corner lots, the guidelines apply to the front yard and street side yard of the property.

Photo taken prior to second floor addition (date unknown)



The new garage/studio structure is in substantially the same location as the garage and separate studio structures that were recently remove, at the rear of the property. Because the subject site is a corner lot, and the garage fronts onto Wheeler Street, front yard setbacks apply (refer to the table shown in the Zoning section of this report). Exterior materials have been selected to be similar to the primary dwelling.

The addition to the dwelling is proposed at the southwest corner of the home where it is not readily visible from the public right-of-way. If possible, the addition will utilize existing materials. New materials, including siding, roofing, windows, doors, trim, etc. will be selected to match the rest of the house.

The six-foot fence is a Craftsman design, will be constructed of redwood and will not block the street-facing elevations of the home. The property is in an area designated as R-2-PD in the Burbank Gardens Policy Statement where front and street-facing side yards are required to have a ten-foot setback. The fence along the Wheeler Street frontage is aligned with the house 14 feet behind the sidewalk. The fence along the Brown Street frontage is 18 feet behind the sidewalk.

The historic analysis identifies architectural style of the two-story 403 Brown Street residence as California Bungalow, also known as vernacular Craftsman, stating that it was originally constructed as a single-story home. The house is clad with staggered wood shingle siding and a low-pitched hipped roof. The historic analysis found “all modifications proposed preserve the essential character defining features of the building.” The analysis also stated that the proposed accessory structure features a “simplified compatible design” concluding that the “design is largely consistent with what exists, thereby retaining the integrity of the subject property and ensuring that the historic relationship of the property to the surrounding district is maintained.”

Secretary of the Interior – Standards for Rehabilitation

Pursuant to Zoning Code Section 20-58.060(F), the CHB must consider the Secretary of the Interior's ten standards for rehabilitation:

- A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
- The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
- Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
- Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
- Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
- Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
- Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
- New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

- New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The historic analysis also addressed the Secretary of the Interior's ten standards for rehabilitation finding the project consistent on all counts in that the project will retain the historic significance of the subject property and will not have a negative impact on nearby historic properties, other landmarks or the Burbank Gardens Preservation District as a whole.

6. Neighborhood Comments

No neighborhood comments have been received.

7. Public Improvements/On-Site Improvements

The project has not been conditioned to require any onsite or offsite improvements.

FISCAL IMPACT

Approval of this action does not have a fiscal impact on the General Fund.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT

The proposed project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA):

Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15301, the project is categorically exempt as it involves a minor alteration to an existing residential structure.

The project is also categorically exempt pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15302 in that it involves the construction of a replacement garage and studio on the same site, in the same general location, and will have substantially the same purpose and capacity as the recently demolished structure.

The project is also categorically exempt pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15303 in that involves the construction of a small structure and conversion of an existing residential structure.

BOARD/COMMISSION/COMMITTEE REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Not applicable.

NOTIFICATION

The public hearing was noticed pursuant to Zoning Code Chapter 20-66. Public

notification was provided by posting two onsite signs, publishing a notice in the Press Democrat, mailing a notice to property owners and occupants within 600 feet of the subject property, and bulletin board postings at City Hall and on the City website.

Pursuant to Government Code Section 65091, where necessary, the City has incorporated notice procedures to the blind, aged, and disabled communities. These procedures include audio amplifier/assistive listening device support at public meetings, closed captioning, and optical character recognition conversion of electronic notices.

ISSUES

No issues were identified during staff's review of the project materials.

ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment 1: Disclosure Form
- Attachment 2: Location and Neighborhood Context Maps
- Attachment 3: Project Plans, prepared by Jon Strong, dated July 2019
- Attachment 4: Historic Analysis, prepared by Lilly Bianco, dated May 6, 2019
- Attachment 5: Site Photos
- Attachment 6: State of California, Dept. of Parks and Recreation's Primary Record
- Attachment 7: CHB Resolution No. 209, dated March 15, 2006
- Attachment 8: Policy Statement (Burbank Gardens)
- Attachment 9: Public Correspondence

Resolution 1: Landmark Alteration Permit

CONTACT

Susie Murray, Senior Planner

smurray@srcity.org

707-543-4348