CITY OF SANTA ROSA PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH JARVIS FAY & GIBSON, LLP AGREEMENT NUMBER

This "Agreement" is made as of this _	day of	, 2020,	by and between the
City of Santa Rosa, a municipal corporation ("	City"), and Jarvis	Fay & Gibson, LLP (("Consultant").

RECITALS

- A. City desires to obtain specialized legal services to assist in the defense of a legal challenge to the City's water rates pursuant to Proposition 218, *Kessner v. the City of Santa Clara, et al.*, filed in the Santa Clara County Superior Court as case number 20CV364054.
- B. City desires to retain a qualified law firm to provide such advice as more particularly set forth in Exhibit A to the Agreement.
- C. Consultant represents to City that it is a firm composed of highly trained professionals and is fully qualified to conduct the services described above and render advice to City in connection with said services.
- D. The parties have negotiated upon the terms pursuant to which Consultant will provide such services and have reduced such terms to writing.

AGREEMENT

NOW, THEREFORE, City and Consultant agree as follows:

1. SCOPE OF SERVICES

Consultant shall provide to City the services described in Exhibit A ("Scope of Services"). Consultant shall provide these services at the time, place, and in the manner specified in Exhibit A is attached hereto for the purpose of defining the manner and scope of services to be provided by Consultant and is not intended to, and shall not be construed so as to, modify or expand the terms, conditions or provisions contained in this Agreement. In the event of any conflict between this Agreement and any terms or conditions of any document prepared or provided by Consultant and made a part of this Agreement, including without limitation any document relating to the scope of services or payment therefor, the terms of this Agreement shall control and prevail.

2. COMPENSATION

a. City shall pay Consultant for services rendered pursuant to this Agreement at the rates, times and in the manner set forth in <u>Exhibit A</u>. Consultant shall submit monthly statements to City which shall itemize the services performed as of the date of the statement and set forth a progress report, including work accomplished during the period, percent of each task completed, and planned effort for the next period. Invoices shall identify personnel who have worked on the services provided, the number of hours each worked during the period covered by the invoice, the hourly rate for each person, and a description of the services performed by each person, consistent with the rates and amounts shown in <u>Exhibit A</u>.

- b. The payments prescribed herein shall constitute all compensation to Consultant for all costs of services, including, but not limited to, direct costs of labor of employees engaged by Consultant, travel expenses, telephone charges, copying and reproduction, computer time, and any and all other costs, expenses and charges of Consultant, its agents and employees. In no event shall City be obligated to pay late fees or interest, whether or not such requirements are contained in Consultant's invoice.
- c. Notwithstanding any other provision in this Agreement to the contrary, the total maximum compensation to be paid for the satisfactory accomplishment and completion of all services to be performed hereunder shall in no event exceed the sum of <u>one hundred fifty thousand (\$150,000)</u>. The City's Chief Financial Officer is authorized to pay all proper claims from Charge Number 130101-5321 (other outside services).

3. DOCUMENTATION; RETENTION OF MATERIALS

- a. Consultant shall maintain adequate documentation to substantiate all charges as required under Section 2 of this Agreement.
- b. Consultant shall keep and maintain full and complete documentation and accounting records concerning all extra or special services performed by it that are compensable by other than an hourly or flat rate and shall make such documents and records available to authorized representatives of City for inspection at any reasonable time.
- c. Consultant shall maintain the records and any other records related to the performance of this Agreement and shall allow City access to such records during the performance of this Agreement and for a period of four (4) years after completion of all services hereunder.

4. INDEMNITY

- a. Consultant shall, to the fullest extent permitted by law, indemnify, protect, defend and hold harmless City, and its employees, officials and agents ("Indemnified Parties") from all claims, demands, costs or liability (including liability for claims, suits, actions, arbitration proceedings, administrative proceedings, regulatory proceedings, losses, expenses or costs of any kind, interest, defense costs, and expert witness fees), that arise out of, pertain to, or relate to the negligence, recklessness, or willful misconduct of Consultant, its officers, employees, or agents, in said performance of professional services under this Agreement, excepting only liability arising from the sole negligence, active negligence or intentional misconduct of City.
- b. The existence or acceptance by City of any of the insurance policies or coverages described in this Agreement shall not affect or limit any of City's rights under this Section 4, nor shall the limits of such insurance limit the liability of Consultant hereunder. The provisions of this Section 4 shall survive any expiration or termination of this Agreement.

5. INSURANCE

a. Consultant shall maintain in full force and effect all of the insurance coverage described in, and in accordance with, Attachment One, "Insurance Requirements." Maintenance of the insurance coverage set forth in Attachment One is a material element of this Agreement and a material part of the consideration provided by Consultant in exchange for City's agreement to make the payments prescribed hereunder. Failure by Consultant to (i) maintain or renew coverage, (ii) provide City notice of

any changes, modifications, or reductions in coverage, or (iii) provide evidence of renewal, may be treated by City as a material breach of this Agreement by Consultant, whereupon City shall be entitled to all rights and remedies at law or in equity, including but not limited to immediate termination of this Agreement. Notwithstanding the foregoing, any failure by Consultant to maintain required insurance coverage shall not excuse or alleviate Consultant from any of its other duties or obligations under this Agreement. In the event Consultant, with approval of City pursuant to Section 6 below, retains or utilizes any subcontractors or subconsultants in the provision of any services to City under this Agreement, Consultant shall assure that any such subcontractor has first obtained, and shall maintain, all of the insurance coverages set forth in the Insurance Requirements in Attachment One.

- b. Consultant agrees that any available insurance proceeds broader than or in excess of the coverages set forth in the Insurance Requirements in Attachment One shall be available to the additional insureds identified therein.
- c. Consultant agrees that the insurance coverages and limits provided under this Agreement are the greater of: (i) the coverages and limits specified in Attachment One, or (ii) the broader coverages and maximum limits of coverage of any insurance policy or proceeds available to the name insureds.

6. ASSIGNMENT

Consultant shall not assign any rights or duties under this Agreement to a third party without the express prior written consent of City, in City's sole and absolute discretion. Consultant agrees that the City shall have the right to approve any and all subcontractors and subconsultants to be used by Consultant in the performance of this Agreement before Consultant contracts with or otherwise engages any such subcontractors or subconsultants.

7. NOTICES

Except as otherwise provided in this Agreement, any notice, submittal or communication required or permitted to be served on a party, shall be in writing and may be served by personal delivery to the person or the office of the person identified below. Service may also be made by mail, by placing first-class postage, and addressed as indicated below, and depositing in the United States mail to:

City Representative:

Consultant Representative:

Molly MacLean Assistant City Attorney City of Santa Rosa 100 Santa Rosa Ave, Rm 8 Santa Rosa, CA 95404 (707) 543-3053

Ben Fay Jarvis Fay & Gibson 492 Ninth Street, Suite 310 Oakland, CA 94607 (707) 510-238-1402

8. INDEPENDENT CONTRACTOR

a. It is understood and agreed that Consultant (including Consultant's employees) is an independent contractor and that no relationship of employer-employee exists between the parties hereto for any purpose whatsoever. Neither Consultant nor Consultant's assigned personnel shall be entitled to any benefits payable to employees of City. City is not required to make any deductions or withholdings from the compensation payable to Consultant under the provisions of this Agreement, and Consultant shall be issued a Form 1099 for its services hereunder. As an independent contractor, Consultant hereby agrees to indemnify and hold City harmless from any and all claims that may be made against City based upon any contention by any of Consultant's employees or by any third party, including but not limited to any state or federal agency, that an employer-employee relationship or a substitute therefor exists for any purpose whatsoever by reason of this Agreement or by reason of the nature and/or performance of any services under this Agreement.

- b. It is further understood and agreed by the parties hereto that Consultant, in the performance of Consultant's obligations hereunder, is subject to the control and direction of City as to the designation of tasks to be performed and the results to be accomplished under this Agreement, but not as to the means, methods, or sequence used by Consultant for accomplishing such results. To the extent that Consultant obtains permission to, and does, use City facilities, space, equipment or support services in the performance of this Agreement, this use shall be at the Consultant's sole discretion based on the Consultant's determination that such use will promote Consultant's efficiency and effectiveness. Except as may be specifically provided elsewhere in this Agreement, the City does not require that Consultant use City facilities, equipment or support services or work in City locations in the performance of this Agreement.
- c. If, in the performance of this Agreement, any third persons are employed by Consultant, such persons shall be entirely and exclusively under the direction, supervision, and control of Consultant. Except as may be specifically provided elsewhere in this Agreement, all terms of employment, including hours, wages, working conditions, discipline, hiring, and discharging, or any other terms of employment or requirements of law, shall be determined by Consultant. It is further understood and agreed that Consultant shall issue W-2 or 1099 Forms for income and employment tax purposes, for all of Consultant's assigned personnel and subcontractors.
- d. The provisions of this Section 8 shall survive any expiration or termination of this Agreement. Nothing in this Agreement shall be construed to create an exclusive relationship between City and Consultant. Consistent with all the California Rules of Professional Responsibility, Consultant may represent, perform services for, or be employed by such additional persons or companies as Consultant sees fit.

9. ADDITIONAL SERVICES

Changes to the Scope of Services shall be by written amendment to this Agreement and shall be paid on an hourly basis at the rates set forth in <u>Exhibit A</u>, or paid as otherwise agreed upon by the parties in writing prior to the provision of any such additional services.

10. SUCCESSORS AND ASSIGNS

City and Consultant each binds itself, its partners, successors, legal representatives and assigns to the other party to this Agreement and to the partners, successors, legal representatives and assigns of such other party in respect of all promises and agreements contained herein.

11. TERM, SUSPENSION, TERMINATION

a. This Agreement shall become effective on the date that it is made as set forth on the first page of the Agreement, and shall continue in effect until both parties have fully performed their

respective obligations under this Agreement, unless sooner terminated as provided herein.

- b. City shall have the right at any time to temporarily suspend Consultant's performance hereunder, in whole or in part, by giving a written notice of suspension to Consultant. If City gives such notice of suspension, Consultant shall immediately suspend its activities under this Agreement, as specified in such notice.
- c. City shall have the right to terminate this Agreement at any time, in its absolute discretion and without cause, by giving a written notice of termination to Consultant. Consultant shall have the right to terminate this Agreement on 30 days' written notice to the extent permitted by the California Rules of Professional Responsibility. Upon such termination, Consultant shall submit to City an itemized statement of services performed as of the date of termination in accordance with Section 2 of this Agreement. These services may include both completed work and work in progress at the time of termination. City shall pay Consultant for any services for which compensation is owed; provided, however, City shall not in any manner be liable for lost profits that might have been made by Consultant had the Agreement not been terminated or had Consultant completed the services required by this Agreement. Consultant shall promptly deliver to City all documents related to the performance of this Agreement in its possession or control. All such documents shall be the property of City without additional compensation to Consultant.

12. TIME OF PERFORMANCE

The services described herein shall be provided during the period, or in accordance with the schedule, set forth in <u>Exhibit A</u>. Consultant shall complete all the required services and tasks and complete and tender all deliverables to the reasonable satisfaction of City.

13. STANDARD OF PERFORMANCE

Consultant shall perform all services performed under this Agreement in the manner and according to the standards currently observed by a competent practitioner of Consultant's profession in California. All products of whatsoever nature that Consultant produces under the terms of this Agreement shall be prepared in a professional manner and conform to the standards of quality normally observed by a person currently practicing in Consultant's profession, and shall be provided in accordance with any schedule of performance. Consultant shall assign only competent personnel to perform services under this Agreement. Consultant shall notify City in writing of any changes in Consultant's staff assigned to perform the services under this Agreement prior to any such performance. In the event that City, at any time, desires the removal of any person assigned by Consultant to perform services under this Agreement, because City, in its sole discretion, determines that such person is not performing in accordance with the standards required herein, Consultant shall remove such person immediately upon receiving notice from City of the desire of City for the removal of such person.

14. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Consultant covenants that neither it, nor any officer or principal of its firm, has or shall acquire any interest, directly or indirectly, that would conflict in any manner with the interests of City, or that would in any way hinder Consultant's performance of services under this Agreement. Consultant further covenants that in the performance of this Agreement, no person having any such interest shall be employed by it as an officer, employee, agent or subcontractor, without the written consent of City.

15. CONFLICT OF INTEREST REQUIREMENTS

- a. **Generally.** The City's Conflict of Interest Code requires that individuals who qualify as "consultants" under the Political Reform Act, California Government Code sections 87200 *et seq.*, comply with the conflict of interest provisions of the Political Reform Act and the City's Conflict of Interest Code, which generally prohibit individuals from making or participating in the making of decisions that will have a material financial effect on their economic interests. The term "consultant" generally includes individuals who make governmental decisions or who serve in a staff capacity.
- b. **Conflict of Interest Statements**. The individual(s) who will provide services or perform work pursuant to this Agreement are "consultants" within the meaning of the Political Reform Act and the City's Conflict of Interest Code:

____ yes __X__ no (check one)

If "yes" is checked by the City, Consultant shall cause the following to occur within 30 days after execution of this Agreement:

- (1) Identify the individuals who will provide services or perform work under this Agreement as "consultants"; and
- (2) Cause these individuals to file with the City Clerk the assuming office statements of economic interests required by the City's Conflict of Interest Code.

Thereafter, throughout the term of the Agreement, Consultant shall cause these individuals to file with the City Clerk annual statements of economic interests, and "leaving office" statements of economic interests, as required by the City's Conflict of Interest Code.

The above statements of economic interests are public records subject to public disclosure under the California Public Records Act. The City may withhold all or a portion of any payment due under this Agreement until all required statements are filed.

16. MISCELLANEOUS

- a. Entire Agreement. This Agreement contains the entire agreement between the parties. Any and all verbal or written agreements made prior to the date of this Agreement are superseded by this Agreement and shall have no further effect.
- b. Modification. No modification or change to the terms of this Agreement will be binding on a party unless in writing and signed by an authorized representative of that party.
- c. Compliance with Laws. Consultant shall perform all services described herein in compliance with all applicable federal, state and local laws, rules, regulations, and ordinances, including but not limited to, (i) the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 (42 U.S.C. 12101, et seq.) ("ADA"), and any regulations and guidelines issued pursuant to the ADA; and (ii) Labor Code sections 1720, et seq., which require prevailing wages (in accordance with DIR determinations at www.dir.ca.gov) be paid to any employee performing work covered by Labor Code sections 1720 et seq. Consultant shall pay to the City when due all business taxes payable by Consultant under the provisions of Chapter 6-04 of the Santa Rosa City Code. The City may deduct any delinquent business taxes, and any penalties and interest added to the delinquent taxes, from its payments to Consultant.

- d. Discrimination Prohibited. With respect to the provision of services under this Agreement, Consultant agrees not to discriminate against any person because of the race, religious creed, color, national origin, ancestry, physical disability, mental disability, medical condition, genetic information, marital status, sex, gender, gender identity, gender expression, age, sexual orientation, or military and veteran status of that person.
- e. Governing Law; Venue. This Agreement shall be governed, construed and enforced in accordance with the laws of the State of California. Venue of any litigation arising out of or connected with this Agreement shall lie exclusively in the state trial court in Sonoma County in the State of California, and the parties consent to jurisdiction over their persons and over the subject matter of any such litigation in such court, and consent to service of process issued by such court.
- f. Waiver of Rights. Neither City acceptance of, or payment for, any service or performed by Consultant, nor any waiver by either party of any default, breach or condition precedent, shall be construed as a waiver of any provision of this Agreement, nor as a waiver of any other default, breach or condition precedent or any other right hereunder.
- g. Incorporation of Attachments and Exhibits. The attachments and exhibits to this Agreement are incorporated and made part of this Agreement, subject to terms and provisions herein contained.

111

111

111

17. AUTHORITY; SIGNATURES REQUIRED FOR CORPORATIONS

Consultant hereby represents and warrants to City that it is (a) a duly organized and validly existing Limited Liability Partnership, formed and in good standing under the laws of the State of California, (b) has the power and authority and the legal right to conduct the business in which it is currently engaged, and (c) has all requisite power and authority and the legal right to consummate the transactions contemplated in this Agreement. Consultant hereby further represents and warrants that this Agreement has been duly authorized, and when executed by the signatory or signatories listed below, shall constitute a valid agreement binding on Consultant in accordance with the terms hereof.

If this Agreement is entered into by a corporation, it shall be signed by two corporate officers, one from each of the following two groups: a) the chairman of the board, president or any vice-president; b) the secretary, any assistant secretary, chief financial officer, or any assistant treasurer. The title of the corporate officer shall be listed under the signature.

Executed as of the day and year first above stated.

CONSULTANT:	CITY OF SANTA ROSA a Municipal Corporation	
Name of Firm: Jarvis, Fay & Gibson, LLP		
TYPE OF BUSINESS ENTITY (check one):	Ву:	
Individual/Sole Proprietor Partnership	Print Name: Dan Galvin	
Corporation Limited Liability Company X Limited Liability Partnership	Title: Board of Public Utilties, Chair	
Signatures of Authorized Person:	APPROVED AS TO FORM:	
By: Print Name. Benjamin P. Fay	Office of the City Attorney	
Title: Partner		

Attachments:

Attachment One - Insurance Requirements
Exhibit A - Scope of Services and Compensation Schedule

ATTACHMENT ONE INSURANCE REQUIREMENTS FOR ATTORNEY SERVICES AGREEMENTS

A. Insurance Policies: Consultant shall, at all times during the terms of this Agreement, maintain and keep in full force and effect, the following policies of insurance with minimum coverage as indicated below and issued by insurers with AM Best ratings of no less than A-:VI or otherwise acceptable to the City.

	Insurance	Minimum Coverage Limits	Additional Coverage Requirements	
1.	Commercial general liability	\$ 1 million per occurrence \$ 2 million aggregate	Coverage must be at least as broad as ISO CG 00 01 and must include completed operations coverage. If insurance applies separately to a project/location, aggregate may be equal to per occurrence amount. Coverage may be met by a combination of primary and umbrella or excess insurance but umbrella and excess shall provide coverage at least as broad as specified for underlying coverage. Coverage shall not exclude subsidence.	
2.	Business auto coverage	\$ 1 million	ISO Form Number CA 00 01 covering any auto (Code 1), or if Consultant has no owned autos, hired, (Code 8) and non-owned autos (Code 9), with limit no less than \$ 1 million per accident for bodily injury and property damage.	
3.	Professional liability (E&O)	\$ 1 million per claim \$ 1 million aggregate	Consultant shall provide on a policy form appropriate to profession. If on a claims made basis, Insurance must show coverage date prior to start of work and it must be maintained for three years after completion of work.	
4.	Workers' compensation and employer's liability	\$ 1 million	As required by the State of California, with Statutory Limits and Employer's Liability Insurance with limit of no less than \$1 million per accident for bodily injury or disease. The Workers' Compensation policy shall be endorsed with a waiver of subrogation in favor of the City for all work performed by the Consultant, its employees, agents and subcontractors.	

B. Endorsements:

 All policies shall provide or be endorsed to provide that coverage shall not be canceled, except after prior written notice has been provided to the City in accordance with the policy provisions.

- 2. Liability, umbrella and excess policies shall provide or be endorsed to provide the following:
 - a. For any claims related to this project, Consultant's insurance coverage shall be primary and any insurance or self-insurance maintained by City shall be excess of the Consultant's insurance and shall not contribute with it; and,
 - b. The City of Santa Rosa, its officers, agents, employees and volunteers are to be covered as additional insureds on the CGL policy. General liability coverage can be provided in the form of an endorsement to Consultant's insurance at least as broad as ISO Form CG 20 10 11 85 or if not available, through the addition of both CG 20 10 and CG 20 37 if a later edition is used.
- C. Verification of Coverage and Certificates of Insurance: Consultant shall furnish City with original certificates and endorsements effecting coverage required above. Certificates and endorsements shall make reference to policy numbers. All certificates and endorsements are to be received and approved by the City before work commences and must be in effect for the duration of the Agreement. The City reserves the right to require complete copies of all required policies and endorsements.

D. Other Insurance Provisions:

- 1. No policy required by this Agreement shall prohibit Consultant from waiving any right of recovery prior to loss. Consultant hereby waives such right with regard to the indemnitees.
- All insurance coverage amounts provided by Consultant and available or applicable to this Agreement are intended to apply to the full extent of the policies. Nothing contained in this Agreement limits the application of such insurance coverage. Defense costs must be paid in addition to coverage amounts.
- Policies containing any self-insured retention (SIR) provision shall provide or be endorsed to provide that the SIR may be satisfied by either Consultant or City. Self-insured retentions above \$10,000 must be approved by City. At City's option, Consultant may be required to provide financial guarantees.
- 4. Sole Proprietors must provide a representation of their Workers' Compensation Insurance exempt status.
- 5. City reserves the right to modify these insurance requirements while this Agreement is in effect, including limits, based on the nature of the risk, prior experience, insurer, coverage, or other special circumstances.

Exhibit A

Scope of Services

Compensation Schedule

JARVIS FAY & GIBSON, LLP

LOCAL GOVERNMENT LAW

March 6, 2020

Molly L. MacLean Assistant City Attorney City Attorney's Office 100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 8 Santa Rosa, CA 95404

> Re: Kessner v. City of Santa Clara, et al. (Fire Hydrant Lawsuit) Santa Clara Superior Court, Case No. 20CV364054

Dear Molly:

You have asked me to provide you with a proposal to assist the City of Santa Rosa in its defense of the lawsuit of *Kessner v. City of Santa Clara* which challenges the City's water rates, in particular the components of the rates that pay for fire hydrants.

As I mentioned when we spoke on the phone, I have broad experience defending cities in legal challenges to municipal utility rates under Propositions 218 and 26 and in litigating class actions. Examples include:

- Lejins v. City of Long Beach (Proposition 218 challenge to water rates)
- Howard Jarvis Taxpayers v. City of Stockton (Proposition 218 challenge to water and sewer rates)
- *Gray v. City of Napa* (Proposition 218 challenge to water rates)
- Great Oaks v. Santa Clara Valley Water District (fifteen lawsuits challenging groundwater pumping charges under Propositions 26 and 218)
- Shatto v. Santa Clara Valley Water District (challenge to groundwater pumping charges under Propositions 26 and 218)
- Aquino v. City of Long Beach (class action challenging municipal gas rates under Proposition 26)
- Spencer v. City of Burbank (class action challenging municipal electric rates under Proposition 26)
- Komesar v. City of Pasadena (class action challenging municipal electric rates under Proposition 26)
- Palmer v. City of Anaheim (class action challenging municipal electric rates under Proposition 26)

I also frequently advise cities and districts on complying with Proposition 218 when setting water rates.

I have been approached by several cities to represent them in this case. The cities of Long Beach, Hayward, Petaluma, and Napa, have already retained me to represent them, and I am in discussions with five others.

I believe that we could obtain significant savings with a joint representation, since there are many costs that could be shared between joint defendants. I have handled joint representations of cities several times before. I provided a joint defense for ten cities in litigation concerning telephone user taxes (Sipple v. City of Hayward) and twenty-seven cities and districts in litigation against Contra Costa County over property tax allocations (City of Brentwood v. Campbell). I also represented most of the cities in San Mateo County in claims against the County regarding property taxes.

For this case, I propose having two fee arrangements with each city. One arrangement would cover those costs that are particular to that city, such as reviewing and analyzing that city's water rates to determine how the rates handle the costs of fire hydrants; any motions or pleadings that need to be made for that city individually; and communications, consultations, and updates for that city. The other arrangement would be for those costs that can be shared between the cities, such as joint research, joint motions, joint oppositions to motions, and case management. I propose dividing these joint costs equally between the cities (i.e., if there are eight cities, then the bill would be divided by eight with each city asked to pay one-eighth).

As we discussed, it was procedurally improper for the plaintiffs to file the case as a single action in one county. For example, Santa Rosa should have been sued in Sonoma County, not Santa Clara County. There is therefore a good chance that the case will be broken up and the plaintiffs will be required to file separate lawsuits in each county. Even if that occurs, we should still be able to share a significant amount of the costs. In particular, the legal research on the main issue—whether fire hydrants are a general government service that is equally available to the public at large—will be very much the same for all cities, and any briefs arguing this point will be very similar.

For the work that is specific to the City of Santa Rosa, I propose the following rates:

Senior Partners: \$340 per hour Partners/Of Counsel: \$305 per hour Associates: \$240 per hour Legal Assistants: \$125 per hour

And for the work that is common to all of the cities, I propose the following rates:

Senior Partners: \$360 per hour Partners/Of Counsel: \$325 per hour Associates: \$250 per hour Legal Assistants: \$125 per hour We do not charge separately for copying, legal research, or administrative overhead. The higher rates for the joint work are partly to account for the increased administrative cost of a joint representation.

Thank you for being interested in retaining Jarvis, Fay & Gibson to assist the City of Santa Rosa in the case. Please let me know if you have any questions.

Very truly yours,

JARVIS, FAY & GIBSON, LLP

Benjamin P. Fay