

DRAFT

RESOLUTION NUMBER [to be entered by Secretary After Approval]

RESOLUTION OF THE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD OF THE CITY OF SANTA ROSA GRANTING DESIGN REVIEW APPROVAL FOR AVENUE 320 APARTMENTS, A 39 UNIT MULTIFAMILY HOUSING PROJECT, INCLUDING ADAPTIVE REUSE OF AN EXISTING OFFICE BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW FOUR-STORY MULTIFAMILY BUILDING WITHIN THE DOWNTOWN STATION AREA SPECIFIC PLAN LOCATED AT 320 COLLEGE AVENUE AND 320 LINCOLN AVENUE, FILE NO. DR19-045

WHEREAS, on January 21, 2021, the Design Review Board of the City of Santa Rosa considered a 39-unit multifamily market rate housing project, including adaptive reuse of an existing three-story office building facing College Avenue into 20 multifamily residential units with parking on the ground floor, and construction of a new four-story multifamily building facing Lincoln Street, housing 19 new residential units on a 0.63-acre infill lot within the downtown station area specific plan; and

WHEREAS, the Design Review Board, at the same time considered written and oral reports of staff, testimony, and other evidence presented by all those who wished to be heard on the matter; and

WHEREAS, the Design Review Board, after due consideration of all evidence and reports offered for review, does find and determine the following:

1. The design and layout of the proposed development is of superior quality, and is consistent with the General Plan, and applicable Downtown Station Area Specific Plan (DSASP), applicable Zoning Code standards and requirements, the City's Design Guidelines, architectural criteria for special areas, and other applicable City requirements (e.g., City policy statements and development plans) in that the General Plan Land Use Designation and zoning district is Neighborhood Mixed Use, which specifically allows multifamily residential by right. The project is within the allowable density and has demonstrated the compatibility with the City's Design Guidelines as they relate to multifamily housing, neighborhood design, DSASP development standards, and the project's compatibility with the existing neighborhood; and
2. The design is appropriate for the use and location of the proposed development and achieves the goals, review criteria and findings for approval as set forth in the Framework of Design Review (Design Guidelines, Introduction, Subsection C) in that the design is appropriate in for its location by utilizing an existing office building for adaptive reuse for residential units within the Downtown Core, and constructing a new four-story structure that incorporates architectural features found throughout the existing St. Rose Preservation District while also differentiating itself as not to replicate any of the contributing properties to the district as supported by the Historic Resource Analysis completed by Mark Parry, a qualified Historic Architect and Architectural Historian on August 13, 2020. The massing and layout of the site uses an existing path of travel to limit the overall construction requirements of the site an placing the new building so not to inhibit the ingress and egress of the site. The project enhances the existing office building with new windows, architectural features, and the existing brick. The new building incorporates three materials including plaster siding, cement shingles, and steel awnings, as well as a variety of window types and stepped design on all four sides of the building. Further, the site incorporates the existing landscaped design and creates an internal courtyard between the buildings that establishes a sense of place when preserving a heritage oak tree. The site provides large scale windows on the ground floor facing Lincoln Street to create a link between creating a focal point of interest at the entryway while incorporating landscaping between the sidewalk and entrance. Additionally, the new building steps back each level from Lincoln Street and creating a

DRAFT

sense of place with patios and balconies on each stepped level that enhances the residential relationship between the existing and future businesses and retail hub of the downtown to promote the livability of Downtown Santa Rosa; and

3. The design and layout of the proposed development will not interfere with the use and enjoyment of neighboring existing or future developments in that the project is located on a previously developed infill lot, does not exceed the max Floor Area Ratio of 4:1, and complies with all development standards. Further, a Focused Traffic Study by W-Trans, dated November 5, 2020, concludes the new use will generate 23 new trips on a daily basis and would decrease the AM Peak Hour Trips to the site nine (9) and five (5) PM Peak Hour Trips and will not result in unsafe traffic conditions. The adapted reuse of existing office building into residential units does not enhance the size of the existing building and is a less intense use as opposed to the office previous office use and does not inhibit or interfere with the use and enjoyment of neighboring existing or future developments; and
4. The architectural design of the proposed development is compatible with the character of the surrounding neighborhood in that a Historic Resource Evaluation completed by Mark Parry, a qualified Historic Architect and Architectural Historian on August 13, 2020, concluded that the project incorporates several elements of the St. Rose Preservation District while maintaining the district's historic integrity by use of sympathetic composition, detailing, and application of contemporary reflections of character defining elements. Further, the Historic Resource Evaluation states that the proposed building is compatible with the adjacent or nearby landmark structures, and the new building does not destroy or adversely affect any important architectural features critical to the district. Finally, the existing office building was built to be retrofitted and adapted to accommodate new residential units is along a commercial corridor on College Avenue with similar structures of the similar size, form, and massing.; and
5. The design of the proposed development will provide a desirable environment for its occupants, visiting public, and its neighbors through the appropriate use of materials, texture, and color, and would remain aesthetically appealing and be appropriately maintained in that the project enhances the existing office building utilizes existing architectural characteristics and increases the downtown core. The proposed new building creates a sense of place by incorporating cement shingles, plaster, and a soft color palette consisting of green and white hues; and
6. The proposed development will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, or welfare or materially injurious to the properties or improvements in the vicinity in that the project was reviewed by City Departments and has been conditioned appropriately; and
7. The review authority finds that the increased height does not detract from the character of the preservation district or any adjacent contributing properties; and
8. The review authority may require conditions of approval that pertain to the placement of screens, the location and type of openings, the location and projections of sun decks, porches, balconies, patios, and similar architectural amenities, to enhance or preserve the residential privacy of the proposed structures and of any adjacent existing or anticipated residential structures or uses; and
9. The proposed project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and is exempt from CEQA pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15182(b) and (c). In addition, the Project also qualifies for a Class 32 Infill Exemption pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15332:

DRAFT

- a. The Project is consistent with the applicable General Plan designation of Neighborhood Mixed Use and all applicable General Plan polices as well as with applicable zoning designation of Neighborhood Mixed Use and regulations, in that the Downtown Station Area Specific Plan implements the General Plan and envisions residential, commercial, or mixed-use development of the site, and the development is consistent with development standards required.
- b. The proposed development occurs within city limits on a project site of no more than five acres substantially surrounded by urban uses in that the proposed development is on a 0.62-acre parcel and the site is immediately adjacent to parcels that are developed with qualified urban uses pursuant to Public Resource Code Sections 21072 and 21061.3.
- c. The project site was previously graded around 1977 to accommodate the existing three (3) story office building with parking lot and site improvements and is substantially surrounded by development. The project will be conditioned to perform surveys and provide any necessary exclusion zones prior to construction activity.
- d. Approval of the project would not result in any significant effects relating to traffic, noise, air quality, or water quality in that:
 - i. A Focused Traffic Study by W-Trans assessed potential impacts to traffic in their Focused Traffic Study, dated November 5, 2020, which concluded that the redevelopment would result in an average of 29 new trips per day to the project site, with nine fewer trips during AM peak hour and four fewer trips during PM peak hour. The Study concluded that because the redevelopment would result in fewer trips during both peak hours, the project would have a beneficial impact on traffic operations in the surrounding roadway network.
 - ii. The City's Noise Ordinance requires that ambient noise levels in Office and Commercial zoning districts do not exceed 60 decibels from 7:00 AM to 10:00 PM or 55 decibels from 10:00 PM to 7:00 AM at the property line. It allows air-conditioning apparatus or similar mechanical device to exceed the ambient base noise level by more than five decibels at the property line. Ambient noise level is the level obtained when the noise level is averaged over a period of 15 minutes without inclusion of noise from isolated, identifiable sources, at the location and time of day near that at which a comparison is to be made. Compliance with the City's Noise Ordinance is required.

Primary sources of project-related noise would be mechanical equipment such as unit HVACs, personal vehicles, and person-to-person conversations. These sources of project-related noise are not anticipated to exceed ambient noise levels allowed by the City's noise ordinance, and the project will be conditioned to comply with the City's Noise Ordinance.
 - iii. The Project will be compliant with the City's Climate Action Plan as demonstrated by Appendix E and a CalEEMod test (Attachment 11) was conducted by City Staff and concluded that the Project would not result in any significant impacts to air quality.

DRAFT

- iv. The project is required to implement permanent storm water Best Management Practices (BMP) in accordance with the City's Low Impact Development Technical Design Manual. Implementation of BMPs ensures compliance with the North Coast Regional Water Quality Control Board's NPDES Municipal Separate Storm Sewer Systems (MS4) Permit requiring Governing Agencies to implement a myriad of programs to prevent pollution, improve and protect storm water quality, reduce storm water runoff, and enhance the ecologic vitality of local creeks and waterways.
- v. The site can be adequately served by all required utilities and public services.

The City has further determined that no exceptions to the exemptions apply and there is no reasonable possibility that the activity will have a significant effect on the environment due to unusual circumstances (CEQA Guidelines Section 15300.2.) This determination is based on the previous grading of the proposed site, and the development primarily being located on the flat portion of the site and substantially surrounded by development.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the Design Review Board of the City of Santa Rosa does hereby grant Preliminary Design Review of Avenue 320 Apartments subject to each of the following conditions and Cultural Heritage Board Landmark Alteration Permit Approval:

PLANNING & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

GENERAL:

1. Compliance with the latest adopted ordinances, resolutions, policies, and fees adopted by the City Council at the time of building permit review and approval. All fees must be paid prior to issuance of a building permit.
2. All work shall be done according to the final approved plans dated November 11, 2020.
3. The developer of Avenue 320 Apartments shall comply with City Code section 21-02, Housing Allocation Plan, through (a) provision of the appropriate number of on-site affordable units, (b) payment of housing impact fees, or (c) an alternative compliance proposed in accordance with City Code section 21- 02.070 and approved by the Director of Planning and Economic Development. For purposes of this condition, the Director of Planning and Economic Development is designated as the review authority for review and acceptance of innovative Housing Allocation Plan compliance strategies under City Code section 21-02.070(D).

BUILDING DIVISION:

4. Construction hours shall be limited to 7:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. Saturdays. No construction is permitted on Sundays and holidays.
5. Grading and Drainage of the site must be per the approved plans. Site drainage shall be to the curb, under the sidewalk, per City standards.
6. Any existing zoning or building violations must be cleared prior to or in conjunction with any new permits.

DRAFT

7. Comply with all Federal, State and local codes, disabled access included.

ENGINEERING DIVISION:

8. Compliance with all conditions as specified by the attached Exhibit "A" dated January 4, 2021.

PLANNING DIVISION:

9. The building materials, elevations, and appearance of this project, as presented for issuance of a building permit, shall be the same as that approved by the Design Review Board. Any future additions, expansions, remodeling, etc., will be subject to review and approval of the Planning Division.

10. PROJECT DETAILS:

- A. All project details shall be in accordance with the restrictions and limitations of the City Zoning and California Building Codes, as well as the City's Design Review Guidelines.
- B. The design of all fencing, sound walls, carports, trash enclosures, and similar accessory site elements shall be compatible with the architecture of main buildings and shall use similar materials. The design must be approved by the Planning Division prior to issuance of a building permit.
- C. All roof appurtenances, accessory equipment, and meters must be totally screened from public view by an architectural design consistent with the building architecture element approved by the Design Review Board or Planning Division.
- D. All outdoor storage of materials and/or refuse bins/cans shall be maintained within a completely screened structure or area. The design of the screened structure or area shall be approved by the Planning Division prior to issuance of a building permit.

11. TREE PRESERVATION:

- A. The applicant shall submit a Tree Mitigation Plan to Planning for review and approval prior to issuance of construction building permit. Consultation with Planning staff during development of the required Tree Mitigation Plan is encouraged.
- B. Tree Preservation notes and protection during construction notes shall be shown on the improvement plans and building plans. The tree driplines shall also be shown on each drawing with the attendant protection instructions.
- C. Prior to issuance of a grading or building permit for any clearing, excavation, construction, or other work on the site, a protection zone shall be established to protect natural vegetation and trees from construction activities. The following conditions and restrictions shall apply:
 - i. The zone shall encompass the "protected perimeter" which shall be either the root zone or other limit as established in this approval.

DRAFT

- ii. The zone shall be delineated with a brightly colored construction fence. Such fences shall remain continuously in place for the duration of all work undertaken on the site.
 - iii. No storage or construction activities (including trenching, grading or filling) shall be permitted within the protected zone.
 - iv. No burning or use of equipment with an open flame shall occur near or within the protected perimeter.
 - v. All brush, earth, and other debris shall be removed in a manner which prevents injury to the protected trees and/or shrubs.
 - vi. No oil, gas, chemicals, or other substances that may be harmful to trees shall be stored or dumped within the protected perimeter or any other location from which substances might enter the perimeter of a protected tree.
- D. The contractor(s) shall be notified in writing by the developer of the "Protection Zone." Copies of the letter shall be provided to the Planning and Building Divisions prior to issuance of a building or grading permit for any site work.
- E. The protection zone delineated with the brightly colored construction fence shall be posted with signs which state "Tree/Vegetation Protection Zone -- No Construction or Storage Permitted."
- F. Irrigation systems, and plant varieties which require regular watering shall not be permitted within the dripline of an Oak tree which is to be preserved.
- G. No concrete or asphalt paving or compaction of soil shall be permitted within the root zones of protected trees.
- H. Any special work, including mitigation, within the "Protection Zone" must be done under the supervision of a certified arborist.
12. LANDSCAPING:
- A. All required landscaping and irrigation must be installed prior to occupancy per the approved final plans.
 - B. Construction drawings submitted for issuance of a building permit shall include final landscape and irrigation plans, except where not required.
 - C. All landscaping must be continuously maintained in a healthy and attractive condition, free of weeds and debris, in accordance with the approved plans. Dead and dying plant materials shall be replaced with healthy specimens as necessary.
 - D. Street trees will be required and shall be planted by the developer. Selection will be made from the City's approved Master Street Tree Plant List in coordination with the City Parks Division. Planting shall be done in accordance with the City "Standards and Specifications for Planting Parkway Trees." Copies of the Street Tree List and the Planting Standards are available at the Parks Division office.

DRAFT

13. LIGHTING:

- A. All exterior lighting shall be shown and specified on the plans submitted for issuance of a building permit in accordance with the Design Review approval.
- B. Lighting shall comply with the City of Santa Rosa's Outdoor Lighting Ordinance found in Zoning Code Section 20-30.080.

14. PARKING LOT AREA:

- A. The parking lot shall be paved to City standards.
- B. The parking lot shall be provided with concrete curbing around all planter areas unless specifically approved by the Planning & Economic Development Department in some other fashion.
- C. The parking lot shall be striped according to City standards and all handicapped and compact spaces shall be identified and marked accordingly.
- D. Bicycle parking shall be provided in accordance with Zoning Code requirements. The location and number of spaces shall be shown on the site plan submitted for issuance of a building permit.

15. SIGNING:

- A. No exterior signs, banners, or the like are approved with this permit. A planning sign permit application is required for all signs.
- B. Sign permit approval shall be obtained prior to application for a building permit.
- C. Building permits for sign installations shall be separate permits from other building permits issued for construction.

16. NATURAL RESOURCES:

- A. Advisement. The applicant, its successors, heirs, assigns or transferees are advised in writing that this approval or permit prior to the start of any construction may be subject to certain other clearances, approvals, permits, or authorizations by state and/or federal agencies. The applicant shall acknowledge in writing receipt of the above advisement.
- B. If tree removal activity takes place between February 1 – August 31, a survey of subject trees for nesting raptors shall be conducted no more than 72 hours prior to tree removal activities. The survey must be completed by a certified ornithologist, licensed biologist, or licensed arborist. If the survey detects the presence of nesting raptors, tree removal activities must be placed on hold until a time determined by the licensed professional.
- C. Mitigation requirement. The City's approval or permit is valid only if the applicant, its successors, heirs, assigns or transferees, comply with the terms, conditions and mitigations set forth in any clearance, permit or approval except that any permit condition or mitigation that requires project redesign shall trigger a review by the City of Santa Rosa Director of Planning & Economic Development to determine if the project as

Res. No. _____

DRAFT

redesigned is consistent with the original approval. A project that the City determines is not consistent with the City approval shall not be granted subsequent entitlements, such as approval of improvement plans and final maps, but excluding grading or building permits of any type. Such a project would have to be resubmitted to the City and reviewed by the City as a new project, including the submittal of a new application and fees.

- D. Power to stop work if violation occurs. Nothing in this approval shall prevent the City of Santa Rosa from exercising its power to stop work in instances where a violation of state or federal law is brought to the City's attention.

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

17. add/delete text as needed

18. add/delete text as needed

DULY AND REGULARLY ADOPTED by the Design Review Board of the City of Santa Rosa on this 21st Day of January 2021, by the following vote:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSTAIN:

ABSENT:

Approved: _____
Scott Kincaid Chair

Attest: _____
William Rose, Executive Secretary