RESOLUTION NUMBER [to be entered by Secretary After Approval]

RESOLUTION OF THE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD OF THE CITY OF SANTA ROSA GRANTING DESIGN REVIEW APPROVAL FOR AVENUE 320 APARTMENTS, A 37-UNIT, MULTIFAMILY HOUSING PROJECT INVOLVING TWO STRUCTURES, LOCATED AT 320 COLLEGE AVENUE, ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NO. 010-113-035; FILE NO. PRJ19-028

WHEREAS, on March 20, 2019, a Concept Design Review meeting was held with the Cultural Heritage Board; and

WHEREAS, on May 1, 2019, a Neighborhood Meeting was held to introduce the proposed multifamily housing project to neighbors and interested members of the public; and

WHEREAS, on August 22, 2019, the entitlement applications, including a request for a Design Review and a Landmark Alteration Permit, were submitted to the Planning and Economic Development Department; and

WHEREAS, on October 23, 2020, revised plans were submitted in response to project-related issues raised by staff; and

WHEREAS, on January 21, 2021, the Design Review Board of the City of Santa Rosa considered an earlier version of the Project, a 39-unit multifamily housing project at which point the Board continued the item for redesign; and

WHEREAS, on April 13, 2021, revised plans were submitted in response to comments from the Design Review Board at its meeting of January 21, 2021. Revisions included a reduction in the front setback for Building B, the new structure proposed along the Lincoln Street frontage; a reduction in height for Building B, from four stories to three, stepping down to two stories along the Lincoln Street frontage; and an overall change in the architectural style including architectural elements found throughout the St. Rose Preservation District; and

WHEREAS, on September 16, 2021, the Design Review Board held a duly noticed public hearing to consider granting Design Review; and

WHEREAS, on September 16, 2021, the Design Review Board considered written and oral reports of staff, testimony, and other evidence presented by all those who wished to be heard on the matter; and

WHEREAS, the Design Review Board, after due consideration of all evidence and reports offered for review, does find and determine the following:

1. The design and layout of the proposed development is of superior quality, and is consistent with the General Plan, Downtown Station Area Specific Plan (DSASP), applicable Zoning Code standards and requirements, the City's Design Guidelines, architectural criteria for special areas, and other applicable City requirements (e.g., City policy statements and development plans). The site is in an area designated as Neighborhood Mixed Use on the General Plan Land Use Diagram. These areas are intended for higher density housing, including a mix of low- and mid-rise buildings, duplexes, triplexes, etc, together with a broad mix of commercial uses that that serve local residents.

The Project site is within the NMU (Neighborhood Mixed Use) zoning district, which is consistent with the General Plan land use designation. The Project has been reviewed in compliance with all required development standards including setbacks, height, parking and landscaping. The site has an assigned Floor Area Ratio (FAR) of 4.0 with the goal of meeting the mid-point. The Project is proposed with a FAR of 1.18, less than the mid-point, which is permitted because the development site is within a preservation district.

The Project site is also within the boundary the Downtown Station Area Specific Plan (DSASP). Development standards outlined in the DSASP have been incorporated into the Zoning Code. The proposed development has been found in compliance with the applicable DSASP development and design standards in the Zoning Code.

The Project site is within the boundary of the St. Rose Preservation District. A Historic Evaluation, prepared by Mark Parry, dated July 20, 2021, concluded that "The colors, textures, materials, fenestration, and decorative features and details as proposed are consistent with the period, and are compatible with the historic resource through a strategy of compatible composition with the use of contemporized character defining elements."

2. The design is appropriate for the use and location of the proposed development and achieves the goals, review criteria and findings for approval as set forth in the Framework of Design Review (Design Guidelines, Introduction, Subsection C). The Project implements several goals and policies from the Design Guidelines relating to neighborhood design, the Downtown Station Area, multifamily residential development, landscape design and parking. A Historical Evaluation, prepared by Mark Parry, dated July 20, 2021, found that "The colors, textures, materials, fenestration, and decorative features and details as proposed are consistent with the period, and are compatible with the historic resource through a strategy of compatible composition with the use of contemporized character defining elements." A Traffic Study, prepared by W-Trans, dated November 5, 2020, concluded that the project "is expected to result in an additional 23 new trips on a daily basis and would decrease the peak hour trips to the site with nine fewer trips during the morning peak hour and five fewer trips during the evening peak hour compared to the existing office building."

The Project site is located within the St. Rose Preservation District and is eligible for development with a Floor Area Ration (FAR) of 4.0, which allows for higher density housing. The Project is proposed at a FAR of 1.18 and, while the General Plan directs development at the mid-point, it allows development lower than the mid-point in preservation districts.

3. The design and layout of the proposed development will not interfere with the use and enjoyment of neighboring existing or future developments. Access to Building A fronting College Avenue will be provided from College Avenue and access to Building B fronting Lincoln Street will be provided from Lincoln Street. A Traffic Study, prepared by W-Trans, dated November 5, 2020, concluded that sight distances along Lincoln Street at the new driveway location and along College Avenue for vehicles traveling westbound at the westerly driveway are adequate for the respective posted speed limit on each facility; however, sight distances along College Avenue are inadequate to vehicles traveling eastbound. Sight lines are "restricted by the presence of brick planter boxes adjacent to the driveways." The brink planter boxes are proposed to be removed as a part of Building A modifications.

Building B, a new structure proposed along Lincoln Street, is set back 19.75 feet from the back of sidewalk consistent with neighboring properties, and steps down from three stories to two, also

Res. No. Page 2 of 8

consistent with neighboring properties. A Historic Evaluation, prepared by Mark Parry, dated July 20, 2021, concluded that, "Historic integrity of the district is preserved utilizing sympathetic composition detailing and application of contemporary reflections of character defining elements. The Mission/Spanish Colonial Revival style references are within the district. These [are] all differentiated from other historic properties with the use of contemporary materials and construction techniques."

- 4. The architectural design of the proposed development is compatible with the character of the surrounding neighborhood. The Historic Evaluation, prepared by Mark Parry, dated July 20, 2021, concluded, "The use of traditional historic building composition in forms and detailing lends a familiarity and sensitivity to the surrounding district buildings. The contemporary materials provide a differentiation and avoid false historicisms. The existing College Avenue building (not a contributor or historical in nature) is improved to support the new buildings design features and character to provide integrated site and design aesthetic. This through the use of cementitious siding to replace the wood siding on the front elevation. The unification of the two buildings with consistent color and similar material treatment is effective."
- 5. The design of the proposed development will provide a desirable environment for its occupants, visiting public, and its neighbors through the appropriate use of materials, texture, and color, and would remain aesthetically appealing and be appropriately maintained. The Project plans were revised to implement design changes at the direction of the Design Review Board during its meeting of January 21, 2021, including an increased front setback, reduced building height and revisions to the overall architectural style for Building B. Building A will include relatively minor exterior changes intended to compliment Building B.
- 6. The proposed development will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, or welfare or materially injurious to the properties or improvements in the vicinity. The Project site is designated for higher density housing on the General Plan Land Use Diagram in an area where all utilities and public services are available. The Project plans have been reviewed various City staff in compliance with all applicable City standards.
- 7. The proposed height does not detract from the character of the St. Rose Preservation District or any adjacent contributing properties. The street facing elevation of Building B, the new building proposed along Lincoln Street, is designed at two-stories, then steps up to three stories as it approaches the center of the site. The structure proposed 19.75 feet from the back of the sidewalk, similar to neighboring properties. In addition, the building design incorporates architectural features found with the Preservation District. A Historic Evaluation, prepared by Mark Parry, dated July 20, 2021, explains that character-defining elements from the district were applied to the building, including building shape, form, and composition; roof and related features; door and window openings (proportions, detailing, material, etc.); secondary features (projections, trim, detailing, etc.); and surface finishes and materials. The evaluation further concluded that, "The proposed changes are consistent with, and compatible with the architectural of the district, in that the design provided references [to] the period of significance in composition of the building elements, details and styling."
- 8. The proposed project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and is eligible for multiple exemptions:

Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15182(b)(c), the project is exempt from CEQA in that:

- The residential development is proposed with a Floor Area Ratio (FAR) of 1.18, which exceeds the 0.75 FAR required for the exemption.
- The development site is located within the Downtown Station Priority Development Area.
- The Project is consistent with the DSASP for which an Environmental Impact Report (EIR) was certified by Council.

Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15332, the Project is exempt as infill development in that:

- The Project is consistent with the General Plan land use of Neighborhood Mixed Use, DSASP and NMU zoning district. The Plans and zoning district are consistent and encourage the development of multifamily housing development that both blends with the surrounding neighborhood and provides an alternative housing type.
- The development site is surrounded on all sides by other urban uses, is less than five acres in size and located entirely within city limits.
- The Project site does not provide habitat for endangered, rare or threatened species. When developed, the Project will require the removal of multiple trees. If this occurs during nesting season, application bird and bat studies are required as a condition of approval.
- Approval of the project would not result in any significant effects relating to traffic, noise, air quality, or water quality. A Traffic Study, prepared by W-Trans, dated November 5, 2020, concluded that the project is expected to result in an additional 23 new trips on a daily basis but would decrease the peak hour trips to the site with nine fewer trips during the morning peak hour and five fewer trips during the evening peak hour compared to the existing office building. The Project is required to remain in compliance with the Noise Ordinance, City Code Chapter 17-16. The Project has been found in compliance with the City's Climate Action Plan as demonstrated by Appendix E. City Staff ran a CalEEMod test that concluded the Project would not result in any significant impacts to air quality.
- The Project site is located in an area where it can be served by all required utilities and public services.
- No exceptions to the exemptions apply and there is no reasonable possibility that the activity
 will have a significant effect on the environment due to unusual circumstances (CEQA
 Guidelines Section 15300.2.)

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the Design Review Board of the City of Santa Rosa does hereby grant Design Review of Avenue 320 Apartments subject to each of the following conditions and Cultural Heritage Board Landmark Alteration Permit Approval:

PLANNING & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

GENERAL:

1. Compliance with the latest adopted ordinances, resolutions, policies, and fees adopted by the City Council at the time of building permit review and approval. All fees must be paid prior to issuance of a building permit.

Res. No. Page 4 of 8

- 2. All work shall be done according to the final approved plans stamped received on April 13, 2021.
- 3. Nothing in this approval shall prevent the City of Santa Rosa from exercising its power to stop work in instances where a violation of state or federal law is brought to the City's attention.
- 4. Compliance with all Federal, State and local codes, disabled access included.

BUILDING DIVISION:

- 5. Provide a geotechnical investigation and soils report with the building permit application. The investigation shall include subsurface exploration and the report shall include grading, drainage, paving and foundation design recommendations.
- 6. Obtain building permits for the proposed project.

ENGINEERING DIVISION:

7. Compliance with all conditions as specified by the Engineering Development Services Exhibit "A", prepared by Jesus McKeag, dated August 17, 2021.

PLANNING DIVISION:

- 8. The developer of Avenue 320 Apartments shall comply with City Code section 21-02, Housing Allocation Plan, through (a) provision of the appropriate number of on-site affordable units, (b) payment of housing impact fees, or (c) an alternative compliance proposed in accordance with City Code section 21-02.070 and approved by the Director of Planning and Economic Development. For purposes of this condition, the Director of Planning and Economic Development is designated as the review authority for review and acceptance of innovative Housing Allocation Plan compliance strategies under City Code section 21-02.070(D).
- 9. Parking spaces shall be unbundled. Unbundled parking is defined by Zoning Code Section 20-70 as those spaces that are separated from the cost of housing, meaning that residents with no vehicles would realize a cost savings by not leasing a parking space.
- 10. Construction hours shall be limited to 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 9:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. Saturdays. No construction is permitted on Sundays and holidays.
- 11. A Tree Replacement Plan shall be submitted to Planning Staff prior to the submittal of any grading or building permit applications. At the very least, the plan shall include three 36-inch box trees of varietals selected from the Heritage Tree list provided in the Tree Ordinance, City Code Chapter 17-24.
- 12. The building materials, elevations, and appearance of this project, as presented for issuance of a building permit, shall be the same as that approved by the Design Review Board, date stamped received on April 13, 2021, except as modified by the Design Review Board or Cultural Heritage Board.

- 13. Any future proposed additions, expansions, remodeling, etc., will be subject to review and approval of the Planning Division, Design Review Board and/or Cultural Heritage Board.
- 14. The brick planter boxes located on Building A, adjacent to College Avenue, shall be removed to improve vehicular site distance.
- 15. All project details shall be in accordance with the restrictions and limitations of the City Zoning and California Building Codes, as well as the City's Design Review Guidelines.
- 16. All roof appurtenances, accessory equipment, and meters must be totally screened from public view by an architectural design consistent with the building architecture element approved by the Design Review Board or Planning Division.
- 17. All outdoor storage of materials and/or refuse bins/cans shall be maintained within a completely screened structure or area. The design of the screened structure or area shall be approved by the Planning Division prior to issuance of a building permit.

18. TREE PRESERVATION:

- A. If tree removal activity takes place between February 1 August 31, a survey of subject trees for nesting raptors shall be conducted no more than 72 hours prior to tree removal activities. The survey must be completed by a certified ornithologist, licensed biologist, or licensed arborist. If the survey detects the presence of nesting raptors, tree removal activities must be placed on hold until a time determined by the licensed professional and approved by Planning staff.
- B. Driplines for all trees to be retained shall be shown on all applicable sheets of plans submitted for Improvement Plans and grading/building permits.
- C. Prior to issuance of a grading or building permit for any clearing, excavation, construction, or other work on the site, a protection zone shall be established to protect natural vegetation and trees from construction activities.
- D. The following protective measures shall be printed under the heading of "Tree Protective Measures" on plan sets submitted for Improvement Plans, grading and building permits:
 - The contractor(s) shall be notified in writing by the developer of the "Protection Zone." Copies of the letter shall be provided to the Planning and Building Divisions prior to issuance of a building or grading permit for any site work
 - ii. A qualified arborist shall be present during initial site grading to supervise work completed around all trees to be retained.
 - iii. No storage or construction activities (including trenching, grading, filling or parking) shall be permitted within the protected zone. If approved due to special circumstances, any work within the "Protection Zone" must be done under the supervision of a certified arborist.
 - iv. The zone shall encompass the "protected perimeter" which shall be either the root zone or other limit as established in this approval.

Res. No. _____ Page **6** of **8**

- v. The zone shall be delineated with a brightly colored construction fence. Such fences shall remain in place at all times for the duration of all work undertaken on the site.
- vi. No concrete or asphalt paving or compaction of soil shall be permitted within the root zones of protected trees.
- vii. No burning or use of equipment with an open flame shall occur near or within the protected perimeter.
- viii. All brush, earth, and other debris shall be removed in a manner which prevents injury to the protected trees and/or shrubs.
- ix. No oil, gas, chemicals, or other substances that may be harmful to trees shall be stored or dumped within the protected perimeter or any other location from which substances might enter the perimeter of a protected tree.
- x. The protection zone delineated with the brightly colored construction fence shall be posted with signs which state "Tree/Vegetation Protection Zone -- No Construction or Storage Permitted."
- E. Irrigation systems and plant varieties which require regular watering shall not be permitted within the dripline of an Oak tree which is to be preserved.
- 19. All required landscaping and irrigation must be installed prior to occupancy per the approved final plans.
- 20. All landscaping must be continuously maintained in a healthy and attractive condition, free of weeds and debris, in accordance with the approved plans. Dead and dying plant materials shall be replaced with healthy specimens as necessary.
- 21. All exterior lighting shall be shown and specified on the plans submitted for issuance of a building permit in accordance with the Design Review approval and compliance with Zoning Code Section 20-30.080.
- 22. Bicycle parking shall be provided in accordance with Zoning Code requirements. The location and number of spaces shall be shown on the site plan submitted for issuance of a building permit.
- 23. A sign that provides contact information for the General Contractor shall be placed along both street frontages to avoid unnecessary complaints to the City. No other exterior signs, banners, or the like are approved with this permit. A planning sign permit application is required for all signs.
- 24. The applicant, its successors, heirs, assigns or transferees are advised in writing that this approval or permit prior to the start of any construction may be subject to certain other clearances, approvals, permits, or authorizations by state and/or federal agencies. The applicant shall acknowledge in writing receipt of the above advisement.
- 25. The City's approval or permit is valid only if the applicant, its successors, heirs, assigns or transferees, comply with the terms, conditions and mitigations set forth in any clearance, permit or approval except that any permit condition or mitigation that requires project redesign shall

trigger a review by the City of Santa Rosa Director of Planning & Economic Development to determine if the project as redesigned is consistent with the original approval.

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

a Rosa