

RESOLUTION NUMBER

RESOLUTION OF THE CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD OF THE CITY OF SANTA ROSA APPROVING A MAJOR LANDMARK ALTERATION PERMIT FOR THE DOWNTOWN STATION (SMART SITE) RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT, A SIX-STORY, 114-UNIT RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT, WITH 10.5% OF THE UNITS DESIGNATED AFFORDABLE, LOCATED AT 634 W. 6TH STREET AND 2 4TH STREET, IN THE RAILROAD SQUARE PRESERVATION DISTRICT, ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBERS 010-166-003 & 010-171-019; FILE NUMBER LMA21-008

WHEREAS, on September 16, 2020, the Project was reviewed at a joint meeting by the Cultural Heritage Board and the Design Review Board as a Concept Item and comments, recommendations, and considerations were provided by both Boards; and

WHEREAS, on June 2, 2021, a Neighborhood Meeting was held for the Project to allow residents and interested parties to attend and provide feedback for the proposed project; and

WHEREAS, on April 21, 2021, the Project applications, including a Major Landmark Alteration Permit and Major Design Review Permits, were submitted to Planning and Economic Development requesting a new six-story, 114-unit, multi-family residential structure with associated amenities including a pool, outdoor play area, outdoor fitness area, new 26-foot wide public pathway, and new portion of the SMART multi-use pathway for the property at 34 W. 6th Street and 2 4th Street, also known as Assessor's Parcel Nos. 010-166-003 & 010-171-019; and

WHEREAS, on November 17, 2021, the Cultural Heritage Board of the City of Santa Rosa considered the Major Landmark Alteration Permit, at which time it received written and oral reports of staff, testimony, and other evidence presented by all those who wished to be heard on the matter; and

WHEREAS, the Cultural Heritage Board of the City of Santa Rosa, after due consideration, investigation, and study made by itself and on its behalf and due consideration of all evidence and reports offered at said hearing does find and determine the following:

- A. The proposed exterior changes are consistent with applicable zoning standards except as directed by Zoning Code Section [20-12.020](#) in that the Project has been found in compliance with development standards for the SMU (Station Mixed Use) zoning district, found in Zoning Code Section [20-23](#), Table 2-8, including lot coverage, building height and setbacks. The project has also been reviewed in compliance with Zoning Code Chapter 20-28, which discusses preservation districts, and Section 20-36, that provides parking requirements; and
- B. The proposed new development implements the General Plan and the Downtown Station Area Specific Plan. The site is in an area designated as Station Mixed Use on the General Plan Land Use Diagram, where new multi-family housing is allowed, to support the daytime and evening vitality of the Downtown Station Area. The Project implements several goals and policies from both documents by providing an alternative type of housing

in the downtown area by incorporating a compact design that promotes downtown as the center for business, residential, social, and civic life while improving the pedestrian, bicycle, and bus transit connections to the downtown SMART Station site. The Project helps meet the housing needs of the City by providing diversity to neighborhoods and allocating affordable units onsite to income restricted residents; and

- C. The proposed Project is consistent with the original architectural style and details of the building in that there is no current building on the site. While the property itself is a contributor to the Railroad Square Preservation District, a Historic Resource Analysis completed by John W. Murphey, Architectural Historian, Architectural History Services, dated September 15, 2021 and revised November 5, 2021, concluded that, “the parcel does not contain resources that qualify for listing on the California Register of Historical Resources. There were no visible age-eligible buildings, structures, or landscapes. Correspondingly, no features were observed that meet the criteria for designation on the National Register of Historic Places. Therefore, there are no above-ground elements on the property that meet the CEQA’s definition of a historical resource, as per the CEQA Guidelines 15064.5.” Further, a District Compatibility Report, prepared by Kara Brunzell, Brunzell Historical, dated November 5, 2021, concluded that the Project implements many of the character defining elements that are found throughout the Railroad Square Preservation District and is compatible with both the Railroad Square and West End preservation districts; and
- D. The proposed Project is compatible with any adjacent or nearby landmark structures or preservation district structures that have been identified as contributors to the respective district in that the District Compatibility Report, by Kara Brunzell, dated November 5, 2021, concludes that the Project is compatible with the Sixth Street Playhouse because, “Although technically a one-story building, it features a stepped parapet on its main façade, which, along with its large footprint, makes it an imposing presence along 6th Street such that it will not be overwhelmed by the scale of the new building.” The District Compatibility Report also identifies the Project’s compliance with the Railroad Square and West End Preservation Districts because of its compliance with the Processing Review Procedures for Owners of Historic Properties Design Guidelines; and
- E. The proposed exterior changes are consistent and/or compatible with the textures, materials, fenestration, decorative features and details of the time period of the building’s construction in that the District Compatibility Report, prepared by Kara Brunzell, dated November 5, 2021, concludes “Primary materials for the proposed project will be stucco, glass and steel. The project will not copy specific features of adjacent historic building in or to avoid creating a false sense of history or a cartoonish historicism. Imitation materials will be avoided. Ground-floor material on the west elevation will respond to the adjacent historic brick warehouse; brick cladding, metal handrails, and steel awnings will be utilized. For the reasons, the materials and texture of the proposed project is compatible with both [Railroad Square and West End preservation] districts”; and
- F. The proposed exterior change will not destroy or adversely affect important architectural features in that the project proposes new construction on a vacant site.

G. The proposed exterior changes are consistent with applicable Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings (2017 Revision). While, the Secretary of the Interior's standards are most applicable to existing historic buildings. The District Compatibility Report, prepared by Kara Brunzell, Brunzell Historical, dated November 5, 2021, concluded that the Project complies with the applicable Secretary of Interior Standards Nos. 3, 8, 9, and 10:

- Conjectural features such as historicist architectural details will not be utilized in the proposed project in order to allow new building to be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. This will allow the project to avoid creating a false sense of historical development. Nor will repurposed elements of historic properties be utilized in the proposed project
- The proposed project will avoid disturbance of archaeological resources and will undertake appropriate mitigation measures if any archaeological resources cannot be avoided
- The proposed project will not destroy historic materials, features, or spatial relationships that characterize adjacent historic properties or historic districts. The new building will be differentiated from adjacent buildings by using a contemporary rather than a historicist architectural style. The proposed project will use materials such as brick cladding and steel awnings on the west elevation of the ground floor in order to respond to the adjacent brick warehouse. Continuous residential stoops on the west elevation will respond to the loading docks of the historic warehouses. On the north elevation, windows and Juliet balconies will provide residential motifs. The project design will avoid inappropriate application of historicist ornament onto the essentially contemporary design of the building. Size, scale, massing, and proportion are compatible with the adjacent historic building, which was originally an industrial/warehouse facility and is itself a large and imposing building. The project protects the historic integrity of the preservation districts and their environment
- Reversal of the proposed project will not impair the essential form and integrity of adjacent historic properties or historic districts: and

H. The review authority finds that the increased height does not detract from the character of the preservation district or any adjacent contributing properties in that a District Compatibility Report (Report) was provided for the Project by Kara Brunzell, a qualified Architectural Historian, dated November 5, 2021, which found that, "The proposed project is six stories, which is taller than but compatible with adjacent structures. Although its massing and scale could potentially overwhelm a low-slung single-story historic residence, Railroad Square district contributors were constructed for commercial and industrial uses, and are both taller and larger in scale than the buildings found in residential historic districts." The Study also finds that the Project is distanced far enough from the Sixth Street Playhouse building that it will not detract from the character of the Railroad Square Preservation District and is even further from residences that are contributors to the West End Preservation District. For those reasons, the height of the proposed Project is compatible with both preservation Districts; and

- I. The proposed project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The project is statutorily exempt from CEQA pursuant to Government Code Section 65457 and CEQA Guidelines Section 15182(a)(c) in that the project would develop a residential land use that is undertaken to implement, and is consistent with, the Downtown Station Area Specific Plan and the certified Subsequent Program EIR (SCH 2006072104). No events subsequent to certification have required a supplemental EIR pursuant to Public Resources Code section 21166. The residential intensity, design, and infrastructure plan of the proposed project is consistent with the adopted Specific Plan's goals and policies.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, the Cultural Heritage Board of the City of Santa Rosa does hereby approve the Landmark Alteration request subject to the following conditions:

1. Plans submitted for building permit must be consistent with the plans approved by the Cultural Heritage Board, dated November 17, 2021.
2. Construction hours shall be limited to 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 9:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. Saturday. No construction is permitted on Sundays and holidays.
3. Comply with all applicable federal, state, and local codes. Failure to comply may result in issuance of a citation and/or revocation of approval.
4. Comply with the latest adopted ordinances, resolutions, policies, and fees adopted by the City Council at the time of building permit review and approval.
5. Comply with Engineering Development Services Exhibit "A" dated October 22, 2021, attached hereto and incorporated herein.
6. Comply with the Sonoma-Marín Area Rail Transit District (SMART) comments dated June 9, 2021, attached hereto and incorporated herein as Exhibit B.

REGULARLY PASSED AND ADOPTED by the Cultural Heritage Board of the City of Santa Rosa on this 17th day of November 2021, by the following vote:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSTAIN:

ABSENT:

APPROVED: _____
Brian Meuser, Chair

ATTEST: _____
Susie Murray, Secretary