

From: [Karissa Moreno](#)
To: [City Clerk](#)
Cc: Michael.Tinoco@Sonoma-county.org
Subject: [EXTERNAL] TRL Support Letter on behalf of Hearts of Sonoma County
Date: Wednesday, July 17, 2024 6:37:21 PM
Attachments: [Outlook-umf0tys5.png](#)
[Outlook-40pweuz1.png](#)
[Outlook-3s3em50k.png](#)
[HSC LOS for SR TRL_7.17.2024.pdf](#)

To our esteemed members of the Santa Rosa City Council,

I hope you are all doing well!


On behalf of the Hearts of Sonoma County, an initiative dedicated to reduce heart attacks and strokes as a major killer of people in Sonoma County, I submit this letter in support of the Tobacco Retail License for the city of Santa Rosa.

We appreciate your attention to this important matter.

In partnership,
Karissa



Karissa Moreno, MA (*she/her/ella*)
Executive Director | Center for Well-Being
Direct: 707.338.6219 | Main: 707.575.6043
norcalwellbeing.org

Click icons to follow us!  



HEARTS OF SONOMA COUNTY
MEMBER ORGANIZATIONS:

July 17, 2024

Aliados Health

American Heart Association of
the North Bay

Carium

Ceres Community Project

Kaiser Permanente Santa Rosa

Northern California Center for
Well-Being

Partnership HealthPlan of
California

Healthy Petaluma

Petaluma Health Center

Santa Rosa Community Health

Sutter Santa Rosa Family
Medicine Residency

Providence Medical Group

Providence Community Health
Programs

Sonoma Community Action
Network (Sonoma CAN)

Sonoma County Department of
Health Services

Sutter Medical Group of the
Redwoods

Tobacco Free Sonoma County
Community Coalition

Dear Santa Rosa City Council Members,

Hearts of Sonoma County (HSC) urges Santa Rosa City Council Members to take immediate policy action to address the alarmingly rapid increase in vaping (i.e., the use of e-cigarettes) among Santa Rosa youth. Vaping represents a serious threat to the immediate and long-term health of these young people, including hospitalization, permanent lung damage, and even death. In addition, teens who use e-cigarettes are more likely to progress to smoking cigarettes in the future, with all the health risks this entails.ⁱ **We are asking the SR City Council to establish a tobacco retail license (TRL) that include bans on flavored tobacco and e-cigarette sales.**

Hearts of Sonoma County is an initiative launched in 2014 with the goal to prevent heart attacks and strokes—leading causes of premature death and disability in Sonoma County—through prevention, earlier detection, and better management of chronic health conditions such as hypertension, diabetes, and obesity. Nicotine use is a key risk factor for hypertension and cardiovascular disease. Working collaboratively with health systems, hospitals, community health centers, medical technology companies such as Medtronic and Carium, and community-based organizations, HSC has successfully contributed to improving adult blood pressure control in Sonoma County—a key step in reducing premature deaths from heart attacks and strokes.ⁱⁱ

We know that nicotine addiction often originates in adolescence with studies showing that close to 90% of adult daily smokers started before the age of 18, and that teens are more susceptible to nicotine addiction.ⁱⁱⁱ According to the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC), youth are more likely than adults to use e-cigarettes. The updated 2022 “Monitoring the Future” National Survey shows that 7% of 8th graders, 14% of 10th graders, and 21% of 12th graders have vaped nicotine in the past 30 days.^{iv} Puff Bar is the most popular vaping product. One Puff Bar contains as much nicotine as at least 50 cigarettes.^v

The vision of Hearts of Sonoma County is to reduce heart attacks and strokes as a major killer of people in Sonoma County. Hearts of Sonoma County is improving cardiovascular disease prevention and management through active collaboration across healthcare organizations, community and social service partners, and community members to inspire good health and achieve health equity.

Local data reflect these disturbing national trends. In Sonoma County in January 2023, 8% of 9th graders and 13% of 11th graders reported using e-cigarettes recently. Among alternative school students, the number was 30%. This epidemic in vaping is driven by the marketing of flavored tobacco products as well as misunderstanding among youth about the danger of these products.^{vi}

Nicotine use in any form remains the single largest *preventable* cause of disease and premature death and is directly responsible for one in five deaths nationally.^{vii} In Sonoma County, tobacco use is responsible for an estimated 503 deaths annually, representing 13% of total annual deaths.^{viii}

The recent rapid increase in vaping among young people threatens to undo decades-long reductions in smoking and tobacco use, with devastating consequences for the long-term health of this generation, our healthcare sector, and our community.

Changes in public policy are among the most effective approaches to achieve optimal health outcomes for city residents. Considering current alarming trends, HSC strongly urges you to adopt policies to reduce and prevent vaping and tobacco use in youth. Please consider establishing a strong Santa Rosa **tobacco retail license** (TRL) that includes bans on flavored tobacco and e-cigarette sales. While a ban on flavored tobacco sales and e-cigarettes is now the law in California (Senate Bill 793), the law has a known loophole that enables youth to continue to access these products: local enforcement is only accessible via criminal infraction. A strong Santa Rosa TRL would provide the local means for responding to violations of this ban by enabling suspension or revocation of retail licensing as well as assessment of fines.

Thank you for protecting and championing the lifelong health of today's Santa Rosa youth.

Sincerely,

Hearts of Sonoma County Leadership Team on behalf of HSC members

Beth Paul
Population Health Director
Aliados Health

Cathryn Couch
Chief Executive Officer
Ceres Community Project

Monica Ferguson MD MSPH
Regional Medical Director
Quality and Population Health
Providence Medical Group

Karissa Moreno MA
Executive Director
Northern California Center for Well-Being

Kayla Flores Tindall MD MPH
Family Medicine, Kaiser Permanente La Clinica
Faculty, Community Medicine Rotation Director
Kaiser Permanente Santa Rosa

Lori Houston
Community Health Planning Analyst
Sonoma County Department of Health Services

ⁱ Rand Corporation (2018): <https://www.rand.org/news/press/2018/10/02.html>

ⁱⁱ Cheadle A, Rosaschi M, Burden D, Ferguson M, Greaves B, Houston L, et al. A Community-Wide Collaboration to Reduce Cardiovascular Disease Risk: The Hearts of Sonoma County Initiative. *Prev Chronic Dis* 2019;16:180596. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.5888/pcd16.180596>

ⁱⁱⁱ Kong G, Krishnan-Sarin S. A call to end the epidemic of adolescent E-cigarette use. *Drug and Alcohol Dependence*. 2017;174:215–221. doi: 10.1016/j.drugalcdep.2017.03.001. [PMC free article] [PubMed]

^{iv} Monitoring the Future Survey 2022: <https://monitoringthefuture.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/12/mtf2022.pdf>

^v Stanford Prevention Toolkit, <https://med.stanford.edu/content/dam/sm/tobaccopreventiontoolkit/documents/ecigarettes/Cigs-in-a-Pod.pdf>

^{vi} Hong, H., Addictive Behaviors, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.addbeh.2018.11.020>

^{vii} U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. The Health Consequences of Smoking—50 Years of Progress: A Report of the Surgeon General. Atlanta: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, Office on Smoking and Health, 2014 [accessed 2018 Feb 22].

^{viii} Source: Calculated using CDC methodology for Smoking Attributable Mortality, Sonoma County DHS; CHIS 2012-2016 pooled estimates; CDHP, CCDF 2012-2016 deaths; CPS-II(82-88)

From: [Monica Wilson](#)
To: [Rogers, Natalie](#); [Okrepkie, Jeff](#); [Rogers, Chris](#); [Fleming, Victoria](#); [MacDonald, Dianna](#); [Stapp, Mark](#); [Alvarez, Eddie](#)
Cc: [CityCouncilListPublic](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Support City of Santa Rosa Tobacco Retail License (TRL)
Date: Wednesday, July 17, 2024 7:25:45 PM
Attachments: [M. Wilson PAVe Letter of Support City of Santa Rosa \(7 23 24\) \(2\) \(1\).docx](#)

Dear Mayor Rogers and City Council Members of Santa Rosa,

I am writing to you on behalf of Parents Against Vaping e-Cigarettes (PAVe) to express our strong support for the implementation of Tobacco Retail Licensing (TRL) policies that restrict the sale of flavored tobacco products, including e-cigarettes, to protect the health and well-being of our youth.

As a parent-led organization dedicated to preventing the widespread use of e-cigarettes among young people, PAVe is deeply concerned about the alarming rates at which adolescents are becoming addicted to these products. Flavored tobacco products, in particular, have been shown to appeal directly to children and teenagers, making it easier for them to start using tobacco and more difficult for them to quit.

We believe implementing a comprehensive Tobacco Retail Licensing policy that includes prohibitions on the sale of flavored tobacco products is a critical step in reducing youth access to these harmful substances. Such policies have been effective in other jurisdictions, resulting in significant reductions in youth tobacco use rates. By requiring retailers to obtain a license to sell tobacco products and strictly enforcing restrictions on flavored products, we can significantly reduce the availability and appeal of these products to young people.

We urge you to support and advocate for the adoption of strong TRL policies in our community. Protecting our youth from the dangers of nicotine addiction and ensuring a healthier future for the next generation should be a top priority for all of us.

Please find attached our support letter for the City of Santa Rosa Tobacco Retail License (TRL) which will be read at the next City of Santa Rosa City Council meeting on July 23rd, 2024.

Thank you for considering our perspective. We look forward to working with you to create a safer, healthier environment for our children.

Sincerely,

Dr. Monica Wilson
Parents Against Vaping e-Cigarettes (PAVe)



July 10, 2024

City Council Santa Rosa
100 Santa Rosa Avenue
Santa Rosa, Ca. 95404

RE: City of Santa Rosa Tobacco Retail License

Dear City Council Members of Santa Rosa,

Founded by three moms in 2018, Parents Against Vaping e-cigarettes (PAVe) is a national nonprofit fighting youth vaping and tobacco use and the tobacco industry's predatory behavior towards kids. PAVe strongly supports the passage of a strong TRL in Santa Rosa; one that will create greater consistency with strong TRL policies passed in other jurisdictions such as Sebastopol, Windsor, Petaluma, 4 and unincorporated Sonoma County. A strong TRL is critical to ensuring rigorous enforcement of policies at the retail level - policies that comply with the SB793 ban on flavored tobacco products, protect our vulnerable youth from the accessibility of illegal flavored vape products and prevent these harmful products from reaching our youth.

I am writing this letter as both an advocate with Parents Against Vaping and a mother of four children. My foremost concern is the health and well-being of children. I have seen firsthand the devastating impact that vaping has had on families across California. Flavored tobacco products, especially e-cigarettes, are particularly appealing to young people due to their sweet, fruity, and minty flavors. These flavors are designed to mask the harshness of tobacco, making them more palatable and enticing to youth. The tobacco industry's targeting of our children with flavored products is deeply concerning and poses a significant public health risk. Furthermore, parents are often unaware of the dangers posed by e-cigarettes and flavored tobacco products until it is too late. We need robust enforcement to ensure that these products are not available in our communities, particularly to our children.

I want to emphasize that this is not just a regulatory issue; it is a moral imperative. As parents, community members, and leaders, we have a responsibility to safeguard the health and future of our children. I urge the City Council of Santa Rosa to take decisive action in enforcing SB 793, signed into law by Governor Gavin Newsom and upheld by California voters on November 8, 2022, with a strong TRL that includes regular inspections of retail locations, strict penalties for non-compliance, and ongoing public education campaigns to raise awareness about the



dangers of flavored e-cigarettes and other flavored tobacco products. By doing so, we can protect the health of our children and prevent a new generation from becoming addicted to nicotine.

Thank you for your time and consideration.

Sincerely,

Dr. Monica Wilson

Dr. Monica Wilson
Parents Against Vaping Advocate/California Region Director
monica@parentsagainstvaping.org

Parents Against Vaping e-cigarettes (PAVe)

Website: www.parentsagainstvaping.org

Instagram: *parents_against_vaping*

Facebook: *@ParentsAgainstVaping*

Twitter: *[ParentsVsVape](https://twitter.com/ParentsVsVape)*

From: [Frida Perez Farfan](#)
To: [City Clerk](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda Item 16.1
Date: Wednesday, July 17, 2024 8:50:42 PM

Dear Council Members,

My name is Frida Perez, a recent graduate from Santa Rosa High School, at the age of 18 I have seen the abundance of availability pertaining to tobacco products and vapes to minors. This isn't only an issue at the high school level but also middle school and potentially elementary school. I hope the city is able to make efforts towards helping close the gap and protect our youth from tabaco and vapes.

Sincerely,

Frida Perez

From: [Tobacco Free](#)
To: [_CityCouncilListPublic](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Letter of Support for Item 16.1, Regulation of Retail Tobacco Sales on 7.23.24
Date: Friday, July 19, 2024 1:22:39 PM
Attachments: [Santa Rosa_TRL_SignonLetter_7.23.24.pdf](#)

Good afternoon City of Santa Rosa Councilmembers,

Please accept this letter of support requesting for you to pass the TRL with the highest of standards - including limiting the number of retailers near K-12 schools, and penalty fees that will discourage retailers from violating the ordinance.

Thank you for your prompt action and for your commitment to protect the health of our youth!

Sincerely,

The Tobacco Free Sonoma County Community Coalition



Dear Mayor and Councilmembers,

The Tobacco-Free Sonoma County Community Coalition is committed to ending all commercial tobacco use and nicotine addiction in the City of Santa Rosa - ensuring the next generation of youth do not become addicted to emerging tobacco products.

The commercial tobacco industry's products have one terrible thing in common: **they cause disease, disability, and death.** The human toll is seen when a toddler gasps for air during an asthma attack caused by cigarette smoke, a teen is hospitalized for chest pain and shortness of breath from vaping, another feels anxious and depressed from nicotine addiction, and a family buries their loved one who died of lung cancer.[i]

Tobacco products* kill half a million Americans each year and virtually all smokers begin their lifelong nicotine addiction as teens. The tobacco industry kills 110 Californians each day, and 30 more suffer from a tobacco-related disease.[ii] A tobacco retail license (TRL) is a way for communities to ensure there is greater oversight and safeguards in place for retailers who sell deadly tobacco products. TRLs align with community values of health and safety and are proven to be effective at reducing youth use of tobacco products.

A comprehensive TRL is one that carries license fees adequate to support compliance, has a robust fine structure and includes regulations that retailers must follow. A TRL is an important driver of compliance, as it results in greater adherence to tobacco laws currently in place. It serves as a mechanism to implement other, locally prioritized provisions, such as prohibiting product discounts, creating tobacco-free pharmacies, and enforcing mail-order/internet delivery and point-of-sale restrictions. **A TRL decreases the influence of the commercial tobacco industry and puts health for all persons over profit.**

A 2019 study evaluating the impact of California's local TRL ordinances on youth smoking rates found that youth and young adults who reside in jurisdictions with comprehensive TRL ordinances had lower rates of electronic smoking devices (ESDs) use compared to those who live in jurisdictions with poor or no TRL policies. Additionally, youth were less likely to smoke in high school and initiate smoking at 18.[iii] **Retail licensure strategies are an effective approach to decrease the prevalence of youth tobacco use and reduce the socioeconomic disparities in tobacco use and retailer density.[iv]**

A TRL helps ensure a level playing field by weeding out businesses that are not following the laws and who gain an unfair advantage and increased profits over those who play by the rules. Almost every state and many cities require a license to hunt, fish, keep a pet, operate a tattoo parlor, run a hair or nail salon, sell liquor, sell marijuana and more, but many still don't require a license to sell addictive and deadly tobacco products. Certainly, the City Council of Santa Rosa would want to treat tobacco products and ESDs in the same manner as other business licenses. [v]

People on low incomes, people of color, and people who identify as lesbian, gay, bisexual, or transgender (LGBT) are more likely to experience a range of health problems related to the use of tobacco. The tobacco industry promotes its products more within these communities and as a result, rates of tobacco use, and related health problems, are much higher for these communities compared to the general population. TRLs may include, for example, density limits and buffer zones for youth frequented areas, and these provisions work well against this industry's predatory marketing practices. **TRLs can reduce inequities created by tobacco industry practices.**

Tobacco doesn't just negatively impact the health of individuals; it also endangers the health of the environment. ESDs and cigarette waste makes its way into the environment where it pollutes water, air, and land with toxic chemicals, heavy metals, plastics, and residual nicotine. Comprehensive local ordinances are needed to reduce the negative environmental consequences of tobacco products. **A City of Santa Rosa TRL policy that restricts access to tobacco products, including ESDs is a proven strategy to reduce tobacco product waste and its impact in our county.**

To effectively curb the high rates of access to all tobacco products and ESDs in the retail setting, The Tobacco-Free Sonoma County Community Coalition recommends that a comprehensive TRL policy in the City of Santa Rosa must include the following provisions which are consistent with the most protective ordinances established in other local jurisdictions:

- No sale of flavored tobacco products
- No online or delivery sales
- No sale of electronic smoking devices
- Minimum price of \$10
- Minimum pack size – 5 little cigars
- No discounts, coupons, or price promotions
- No sale of tobacco in pharmacies
- Limit on the total number of tobacco retailers
- New retailer proximity parameters (E.g., proximity to K-12 schools & parks)

Comprehensive TRL requirements are an effective policy tool to generate income for local enforcement which will limit youth initiation of tobacco products, support people who desire to quit, and protect our environment. We sincerely urge you to approve the proposed Tobacco Retail License policy to maintain a healthy and beautiful City of Santa Rosa.

Sincerely,

Pam Dranger

Chair of Tobacco Free Sonoma County Community Coalition

Action on Smoking & Health (ASH)

Asian Pacific Partners for Empowerment, Advocacy, and Leadership (APPEAL)

Aladios Health

Blue Zones Project

California Health Collaborative

Center For Well-Being

Gravenstein Health Action

Parents Against Vaping E-cigarettes

Petaluma Health Center

Ruth E. Malone, RN, PhD University of California, San Francisco

Santa Rosa Community Health

Sierra Club

Tobacco-Free Sonoma County

*Tobacco products include, for example, electronic smoking devices (e-cigarettes), cigarettes, chew, dissolvables, and any component part or accessory like rolling papers, wraps and pipes.

[1] <https://www.undo.org/disease#sources-20>

[1] Jackler RK, Ramamurthi D. Nicotine arms race: JUUL and the high-nicotine product market. *Tob Control*. February 2019; tobacco control-2018-054796. doi:10.1136/tobaccocontrol-2018-054796.

[1] Astor RL, Urman R, Barrington-Trimis JL, Berhane K, Steinberg J, Cousineau M, Leventhal AM, Unger JB, Cruz T, Pentz MA, Samet JM, McConnell R. Tobacco Retail Licensing and Youth Product Use. *Pediatrics*. 2019;143(2):e20173536.

[1] Lawman HG, Henry KA, Scheeres A, Hillengas A, Coffman R, Strasser AA. Tobacco Retail Licensing and Density 3 Years After License Regulations in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania (2012–2019). *American Journal of Public Health*. 2020;110(4):547–553.

[1] Astor RL, Urman R, Barrington-Trimis JL, Berhane K, Steinberg J, Cousineau M, Leventhal AM, Unger JB, Cruz T, Pentz MA, Samet JM, McConnell R. Tobacco Retail Licensing and Youth Product Use. *Pediatrics*. 2019;143(2):e20173536.

From: [Monica Wilson](#)
To: [City Council Public Comments](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Public Comment Request July 23 City Council Meeting
Date: Friday, July 19, 2024 2:17:50 PM
Attachments: [M. Wilson PAVe Letter of Support City of Santa Rosa \(7_23_24\) \(2\) \(1\).docx](#)

Dear Public Comment Committee,

Please find attached my letter being requested for submission as public comment.

Thank you,

Dr. Wilson



July 10, 2024

City Council Santa Rosa
100 Santa Rosa Avenue
Santa Rosa, Ca. 95404

RE: City of Santa Rosa Tobacco Retail License

Dear City Council Members of Santa Rosa,

Founded by three moms in 2018, Parents Against Vaping e-cigarettes (PAVe) is a national nonprofit fighting youth vaping and tobacco use and the tobacco industry's predatory behavior towards kids. PAVe strongly supports the passage of a strong TRL in Santa Rosa; one that will create greater consistency with strong TRL policies passed in other jurisdictions such as Sebastopol, Windsor, Petaluma, 4 and unincorporated Sonoma County. A strong TRL is critical to ensuring rigorous enforcement of policies at the retail level - policies that comply with the SB793 ban on flavored tobacco products, protect our vulnerable youth from the accessibility of illegal flavored vape products and prevent these harmful products from reaching our youth.

I am writing this letter as both an advocate with Parents Against Vaping and a mother of four children. My foremost concern is the health and well-being of children. I have seen firsthand the devastating impact that vaping has had on families across California. Flavored tobacco products, especially e-cigarettes, are particularly appealing to young people due to their sweet, fruity, and minty flavors. These flavors are designed to mask the harshness of tobacco, making them more palatable and enticing to youth. The tobacco industry's targeting of our children with flavored products is deeply concerning and poses a significant public health risk. Furthermore, parents are often unaware of the dangers posed by e-cigarettes and flavored tobacco products until it is too late. We need robust enforcement to ensure that these products are not available in our communities, particularly to our children.

I want to emphasize that this is not just a regulatory issue; it is a moral imperative. As parents, community members, and leaders, we have a responsibility to safeguard the health and future of our children. I urge the City Council of Santa Rosa to take decisive action in enforcing SB 793, signed into law by Governor Gavin Newsom and upheld by California voters on November 8, 2022, with a strong TRL that includes regular inspections of retail locations, strict penalties for non-compliance, and ongoing public education campaigns to raise awareness about the



dangers of flavored e-cigarettes and other flavored tobacco products. By doing so, we can protect the health of our children and prevent a new generation from becoming addicted to nicotine.

Thank you for your time and consideration.

Sincerely,

Dr. Monica Wilson

Dr. Monica Wilson
Parents Against Vaping Advocate/California Region Director
monica@parentsagainstvaping.org

Parents Against Vaping e-cigarettes (PAVe)

Website: www.parentsagainstvaping.org

Instagram: *parents_against_vaping*

Facebook: *@ParentsAgainstVaping*

Twitter: *[ParentsVsVape](https://twitter.com/ParentsVsVape)*

From: [Jaime Rojas](#)
To: [Alvarez, Eddie](#); [Stapp, Mark](#); [MacDonald, Dianna](#); [Fleming, Victoria](#); [Rogers, Chris](#); [Okrepkie, Jeff](#); [Rogers, Natalie](#)
Cc: [City Council Public Comments](#); [CMOffice](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] City Council Meeting Public Testimony Letter - Oppose Full Vape Ban
Date: Monday, July 22, 2024 4:17:17 PM
Attachments: [Santa Rosa TRL Opposition Letter.pdf](#)

Good Afternoon Mayor and Councilmembers,

Please find attached a coalition letter opposing tomorrow's city council meeting agenda item #16.1 (total vape ban). Should you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Thank you.

Jaime

--

Jaime Rojas
NATO
Legislative Consultant

[Rojas Public Affairs](#)



Rojas Public Affairs - Los Angeles Office
(213) 400-8664

[Website](#) | [Services](#) | [Our Team](#) | [Water Issues](#)

NOTICE: This email is covered by the Electronic Communication Privacy Act, 18 U.S.C 2510-2521 and may be legally privileged. The information contained in this email is intended only for the use of the individual or entity named above. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error please immediately notify us by sending an email to info@rojaspublicaffairs.com, and destroy the original message.



July 19th, 2024

Mayor Natalie Rogers

Members of the Santa Rosa City Council

RE: Tobacco Retail Permit Licensing Ordinance

Dear Mayor Rogers and Members of the Santa Rosa City Council,

As leaders of California's trade associations who represent convenience store owners in Santa Rosa and across the state, the proposed ordinance to ban all e-cigarettes city-wide has us deeply troubled. This measure aims to prohibit the sale of all e-cigarettes, and also includes additional restrictions on convenience stores in the name of improving public health. Such a broad-reaching policy not only infringes on adult consumer choice, but also threatens the livelihoods of business owners.

At the heart of this issue lies the misconception that all e-cigarettes pose the same level of risk. However, this fails to acknowledge the role that e-cigarettes play as harm reduction tools for adult smokers looking to quit smoking traditional tobacco, like cigarettes. Similar to the misguided approach taken by San Francisco, which banned e-cigarettes years ago but [exempted FDA-approved products](#), Santa Rosa's proposed ordinance overlooks the nuanced differences between various e-cigarette products.

It's important to recognize that flavored e-cigarettes are already banned in California, and further restricting access to all e-cigarettes ignores the needs of adult smokers seeking alternatives to combustible tobacco. By failing to differentiate between flavored and unflavored e-cigarettes, the proposed ordinance unfairly targets products that have been shown to help individuals transition away from traditional smoking.

Additionally, the argument that e-cigarettes approved for marketing by the FDA through its PMTA program should be banned is deeply flawed. Products that have undergone FDA review and approval have demonstrated that they've met the agency's rigorous standard of being [appropriate for the protection of the public health](#). Therefore, we strongly suggest that these, and future, federally approved products should not be prohibited.

The Sonoma County Department of Health Services continues to cite outdated statistics from 2019 to justify its claims of a teen vaping epidemic. However, it's crucial to acknowledge that teen use of e-cigarettes has been on the decline since its peak in 2019, thanks in part to education efforts and strict adherence to existing laws that restrict tobacco sales to individuals aged 21 and older. Punishing responsible businesses and adult consumers based on outdated data is not sound public policy.

While the city's goal is to undoubtedly promote public health, we question the established licensure limitations based off population and how this would yield positive results for the

community's well-being? Overtime, does this council truly believe that the slow but steady closure of your convenience stores benefits the public's health? All of us at some point rely on these stores specifically for the daily conveniences we need, be they gas, snacks, candy, water, coffee, and yes, even nicotine products.

From our perspective, our concerns stem from the bigger picture of the long-term harms of stores closing. That means fewer employed residents, less tax revenue for Santa Rosa, and the illicit market filling in the void that a regulated and licensed store would otherwise manage – these aren't anything positive for Santa Rosa. Lastly, it is not only an easy task to inform local retailers of a potentially shutting down but then ask them to simply find a new way to earn a living – imagine being in their shoes and having to start from scratch on building a new life for yourself and family because the government deems so.

Instead of pursuing blanket bans, Santa Rosa should explore targeted approaches to address concerns about underage vaping. The example set by Union City's city council, which focused on banning disposable vapor products with youth-attractive flavors while preserving options for adult smokers, offers a more balanced and effective solution.

We strongly suggest that the City of Santa Rosa continue to work with invested stakeholders and local businesses to reach a mutually beneficial proposal. The current draft unfairly targets adult consumers and businesses while failing to address the nuanced complexities of the issue.

Thank you for your consideration,



Alessandra Magnasco, Governmental Affairs and
Regulatory Director
California Fuels and Convenience Alliance
alessandra@cfca.energy



Dennis Loper, Executive Director
California Distributors Association
dloper@lobbycal.com

Sanjiv Patel, Chairman of the Board
American Petroleum and Convenience Store Association
bobbie@apca.us

David Spross, Executive Director
National Association of Tobacco
Outlets