From: Tom Murphy
To: Murray, Susie
Subject: [EXTERNAL] TR22-062 Bunya
Date: Thursday, August 10, 2023 10:58:05 AM
Attachments: Bunya.docx

Hi Susie

I cannot attend the meeting, but I'm attaching a comment for the 8/24 Planning Commission meeting re TR22-62, the Bunya Bunya tree at 1080 Second. I'm supporting staff's denial of the permit.

Thank you!

Tom

Tom Murphy
1505 13th St
Santa Rosa
415 924 3364

Planning Commission,
City of Santa Rosa
100 Santa Rosa Ave
Santa Rosa, CA

C/O: Susie Murray, Senior Planner

Re: TR22-062 – Bunya Bunya Tree

August 10, 2023

Dear Commissioners,

As a resident of Santa Rosa who owns property near this project site, I'm writing to ask you to **support Staff's denial of a permit to remove a 125-foot Bunya Bunya** (Auraucaria bidwillii) tree at 1080 Second Street. This tree is a healthy, beautiful example of a species that is disappearing from Santa Rosa, and the city should take exceptional action to protect it.

Thank you,

Tom Murphy
1505 13th St.
Santa Rosa, CA 95404
Murphy@RedwoodAge.com

From:	Kristin Berger
To:	Murray, Susie
Subject:	[EXTERNAL] Against the Bunya Bunya Tree Removal - 1080 2nd Street
Date:	Tuesday, September 27, 2022 8:17:01 PM

Dear Susie,

My name is Kristin Berger, and I live at 96 Pierce St, Santa Rosa, CA 95404, and my family (James E. Berger) owns the home in which I reside and the two homes adjacent to the Bunya Bunya tree currently being considered for removal. The Bunya Bunya tree is more than a century old and brings a unique history and origin having been planted by Luther Burbank. This rare specimen from the Luther Burbank legacy should be maintained by the citizens of Santa Rosa, and celebrated for its value and heritage. Luther Burbank advanced not only the cultivation of rare plants, but the notoriety of Santa Rosa as an incubator of innovation. The tree still has a place in our community because it remains standing and is a living landmark of a world renowned horticulturalist and innovator. It is healthy and living out its natural life cycle, and should continue to do so, and maintenance for its annual foliage drop and release of pinecones every 4-5 years is minimally intrusive. I have been volunteering with my neighbors to help clear foliage, its cones, and the area underneath the tree and adjacent to the property. It is a commitment I am willing to keep to protect the tree.

As I am directly impacted by its presence, I join local residents and concerned citizens to protest its removal and support its maintenance going forward.

Thank you for your thoughtful consideration,

Kristin Berger

Kristin Berger
707-280-3717
kristinannberger.kb@gmail.com

From: Murray, Susie
To: Evan Hughes
Subject: RE: [EXTERNAL] Comment Regarding Proposal #TR22-062 "Bunya Bunya - Tree Removal"
Date: Thursday, February 9, 2023 6:50:00 PM

Mr. Hughs,

I'm waiting on an evaluation of the tree from a second arborist. Upon receipt, I will be taking action. When I do, I'll send a Notice of Action. If you received a Notice of Application, you should receive this one too. If you didn't, please email again towards the end of next week.

Thanks much.

Susie

Susie Murray | Senior Planner | Staff Liaison to the Cultural Heritage Board
Planning and Economic Development |100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3 | Santa Rosa, CA 95404
Tel. (707) 543-4348 | Fax (707) 543-3269 | SMurray@srcity.org

City of Santa Rosa

From: Evan Hughes <shalestonehughes@gmail.com>
Sent: Thursday, February 9, 2023 12:58 PM
To: Murray, Susie <SMurray@srcity.org>
Subject: Re: [EXTERNAL] Comment Regarding Proposal #TR22-062 "Bunya Bunya - Tree Removal"

Ms. Murray,

Just checking in, was a decision made regarding the Bunya Bunya tree (TR22-062)?

Thanks so much,

Evan Hughes
707-721-2558

On Mon, Dec 5, 2022 at 1:04 PM Evan Hughes <shalestonehughes@gmail.com> wrote:

> OK, thank you for the update, I (and my neighbors) really appreciate the time and attention your office is paying to this issue given the tree's importance to the neighborhood and the community.
>
> Thanks again, and happy holidays,
>
> Evan Hughes

On Mon, Dec 5, 2022 at 11:49 AM Murray, Susie <SMurray@srcity.org> wrote:

> Hi Evan,
>
> It hasn't been acted upon yet. The City's hired a consulting arborist that will be inspecting the tree in late January or early February. He'll be going to the top of the tree to see what's up with the three leaders (I think that's what they're called). Another notice will be sent when I act (approve or deny) the permit, but feel free to check back the first week of February.
>
> Happy holidays.
>
> Susie

Susie Murray | Senior Planner | Staff Liaison to the Cultural Heritage Board
Planning and Economic Development |100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3 | Santa Rosa, CA 95404
Tel. (707) 543-4348 | Fax (707) 543-3269 | SMurray@srcity.org

City of Santa Rosa

From: Evan Hughes <shalestonehughes@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, December 5, 2022 11:35 AM
To: Murray, Susie <SMurray@srcity.org>
Subject: Re: [EXTERNAL] Comment Regarding Proposal #TR22-062 "Bunya Bunya - Tree Removal"

Ms. Murray,

I hadn't seen or heard anything regarding the proposed removal of the Bunya Bunya Tree located at 50 Montgomery Drive (TR22-062) and I wanted to make sure I didn't miss something. Was the proposal (hopefully) rejected?

Thanks so much,

Evan Hughes
707-721-2558

On Thu, Oct 13, 2022 at 11:02 AM Murray, Susie <SMurray@srcity.org> wrote:

> Hi Evan,
>
> Thank you for sending in your comments. I will be sending a Notice of Action when I act of the requested tree removal. If you haven't heard anything by the first week of December, feel free to check back in for a status update.

Susie

Susie Murray | **Senior Planner** | **Staff Liaison to the Cultural Heritage Board**
Planning and Economic Development |100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3 | Santa Rosa, CA 95404
Tel. (707) 543-4348 | Fax (707) 543-3269 | SMurray@srcity.org

---

From: Evan Hughes <shalestonehughes@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 4, 2022 11:00 AM
To: Murray, Susie <SMurray@srcity.org>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Comment Regarding Proposal #TR22-062 "Bunya Bunya - Tree Removal"

To Susie Murray, Senior Planner, City of Santa Rosa

I am writing to respond to the proposed removal of the Bunya Bunya Tree located at 50 Montgomery Drive (TR22-062). I provided written comment in 2019 when Ms. King attempted to have the tree removed, and my previous comments still hold true. I live on Pierce St. roughly 100 ft from this tree. I've spoken with my neighbors, and we were all shocked to hear that the Bunya Bunya tree might be destroyed.

This tree is a very rare species, native to Australia and capable of growing in only a limited range of habitats. Given its size, it is almost certainly over 110 years old and was alive and growing decades before the nearby houses and offices were built in the early 20th century. Luther Burbank himself had a Bunya Bunya tree growing in his home garden for many years, and their rarity in the US suggests that he very likely had a hand in planting and/or protecting the tree currently facing removal.

Large mature trees like this are a precious resource, made more vital with the now-yearly threat of wildfire. They beautify our streets and neighborhoods and provide shade to passersby as well as a habitat for various wild animals. They are an essential part of what makes Santa Rosa such a special place to live, and once these giants are gone there is nothing that people can build to replace them, and no amount of money can bring them back.

Thank you for considering these comments. I know this is a small project but I sincerely hope the City considers other solutions to mitigate whatever issues the tree is presenting to the applicant. if there will be a public hearing, please let me know, I would love to attend.

Thank you again,

Evan Hughes
707-721-2558

From:	Planning Shared
To:	Patrice Giansante
Cc:	Murray, Susie
Subject:	RE: [EXTERNAL] File #TR22-062 Need Info on Bunya-Bunya Tree Removal
Date:	Wednesday, October 5, 2022 12:29:48 PM
Attachments:	Silvercrest arborist report.pdf image001.png

Hi Patrice,

I'll save your email to the Public Comment area of the file, as well as forwarding it to Susie. I'm not the project planner for this tree removal permit application, so I can't speak to any timeframes regarding a decision. Susie will get back to you when she returns with more information.

Attached, please find the arborist report. An arborist report, a site visit, photographs, and the zoning code section for tree preservation are what are used to determine whether a tree may be removed.

Best regards,

Sheila Wolski, City Planner
Planning & Economic Development
100 Santa Rosa Ave., Room 3 | Santa Rosa, CA 95404
Tel. (707) 543-4705| swolski@srcity.org

Hours | Monday-Friday 7:30am-4:30pm

We are hiring – join the team with a purpose and make an impact!
We offer incredible opportunities, dynamic work and excellent benefits.
Come find your passion; visit SRCity.org/Jobs

From: Patrice Giansante <pmelnick@sonic.net>
Sent: Wednesday, October 5, 2022 10:14 AM
To: Planning Shared <planning@srcity.org>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] File #TR22-062 Need Info on Bunya-Bunya Tree Removal

Hello City Planning,
I am trying to get more information about File #TR22-062 filed by Sharon King on behalf of the Salvation Army. I tried to contact Susie Murray, Project Planner, but she is on vacation until October 11. I have left a message for Ms. King, but have not received a response.

Public comments are due by this Friday, October 11.

I am concerned about why a seemingly very healthy, very old tree is being targeted for removal.

If it is possible for you to get back to me before Friday that would be appreciated.

Thank you so much,
Patrice Giansante
123 Stanford Street
Santa Rosa, CA 95404
707-547-7727

From: Nicole Bullington
To: Murray, Susie
Subject: Re: [EXTERNAL] BUNYA BUNYA -TREE REMOVAL
Date: Friday, October 28, 2022 9:02:33 AM

Okay, thank you for keeping in touch with me

On Thu, Oct 27, 2022, 10:28 AM Murray, Susie <SMurray@srcity.org> wrote:

> Hi Nicole,
>
> I'm sorry, but I can't authorize the sign on private property or in the public right of way. I will give you an update, though. I have another arborist going to examine the health of the tree in mid-November. If you check back in with me early December, I should be close to making my decision.
>
> Thanks for being on top of it!
>
> Susie
>
> **Susie Murray | Senior Planner | Staff Liaison to the Cultural Heritage Board**
>
> Planning and Economic Development |100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3 | Santa Rosa, CA 95404
>
> Tel. (707) 543-4348 | Fax (707) 543-3269 | SMurray@srcity.org
>
>
>
> ---
>
> **From:** Nicole Bullington <bullingtonnic@gmail.com>
> **Sent:** Thursday, October 27, 2022 8:52 AM
> **To:** Murray, Susie <SMurray@srcity.org>
> **Subject:** Re: [EXTERNAL] BUNYA BUNYA -TREE REMOVAL

SO can I pay for a plaque that states how special the BunyaBunya is and we keep it there at the corner so people can safely read it?

Please? Let me know

On Thu, Oct 13, 2022, 12:03 PM Murray, Susie <SMurray@srcity.org> wrote:

> You bet!
>
> **Susie Murray | Senior Planner | Staff Liaison to the Cultural Heritage Board**
>
> Planning and Economic Development |100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3 | Santa Rosa, CA 95404
>
> Tel. (707) 543-4348 | Fax (707) 543-3269 | SMurray@srcity.org
>
>
>
> ---
>
> **From:** Nicole Bullington <bullingtonnic@gmail.com>
> **Sent:** Wednesday, October 12, 2022 6:02 PM
> **To:** Murray, Susie <SMurray@srcity.org>
> **Subject:** Re: [EXTERNAL] BUNYA BUNYA -TREE REMOVAL
>
> Thank you very much! ⚡
>
> On Tue, Oct 11, 2022, 1:06 PM Murray, Susie <SMurray@srcity.org> wrote:
>
> > Nicole,
> >
> > I'm just starting to catch up on email received during my vacation, and I apologize if this is a duplicate response. Thank you for sending in your comments. I have included a copy in the public record and will consider yours and all other comments prior to acting on the request. I will send another notice when action is taken. If you haven't heard any think from me by early November, feel free to check back in.

Susie

Susie Murray | Senior Planner | Staff Liaison to the Cultural Heritage Board

Planning and Economic Development |100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3 | Santa Rosa, CA 95404

Tel. (707) 543-4348 | Fax (707) 543-3269 | SMurray@srcity.org

---

From: Nicole Bullington <bullingtonnic@gmail.com>
Sent: Thursday, September 22, 2022 12:02 PM
To: Murray, Susie <SMurray@srcity.org>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] BUNYA BUNYA -TREE REMOVAL

Salutations,

My name is Nicole, and on behalf of the microcosm that exists with that 30 million year old species of tree, I say leave it be!

I know it has gargantuan pine cones that fall in late summer and that endangers unintelligent and unaware humans. Those nuts are so nutritional though!

I know it's native to Australia, but it's not taking over native species habitat or sustenance.

I speak for the trees for the trees have no tongues.

Thank you for your consideration.

From: William Hatcher
To: Murray, Susie
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bunya Bunya Tree Removal
Date: Monday, September 19, 2022 9:18:57 AM
Attachments: Letter to City of Santa Rosa 9.19.22.pdf

Ms. Murray,

Please see attached correspondence from Mr. Hatcher.

Coleen Sibert
Legal Assistant to William W. Hatcher, Jr.
LAW OFFICES OF WILLIAM W. HATCHER
114 Pierce Street
Santa Rosa, CA 95404
Phone (707) 542-1921
Fax (707) 545-0220

CONFIDENTIALITY STATEMENT: The information contained in this email message is intended only for the personal and confidential use of the designated recipients named above. This message may be an attorney-client communication and, as such, is privileged and confidential. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient or an agent responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that you have received this document in error, and that any review, dissemination, distribution or copying of this message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by telephone and return the original message to us by mail. Thank you.

IRS CIRCULAR 230 DISCLOSURE: As required by U.S. Treasury Regulations governing tax practice, you are hereby advised that any written tax advice contained herein was not written or intended to be used (and cannot be used) by any taxpayer for the purpose of avoiding penalties that may be imposed under the U.S. Internal Revenue Code.

BEWARE OF CYBER FRAUD: Before wiring any funds, call the intended recipient at a number you know is valid to confirm the instructions, and be very wary of any request to change wire instructions you already received.

LAW OFFICES
OF
WILLIAM W. HATCHER
114 Pierce Street
Santa Rosa, California 95404

WILLIAM W. HATCHER

Telephone (707) 542-1921
Facsimile (707) 545-0220
e-mail: whatcher@sonic.net

September 19, 2022

Via U.S. Mail and email to smurray@srcity.org

Susie Murray, Project Planner
City of Santa Rosa
Planning & Economic Development Department
100 Santa Rosa Avenue, Room 3
Santa Rosa, CA 95404

RE: **Project Name:** **Bunya Bunya Tree Removal**
Project Address: **1080 2nd Street, Santa Rosa**
File No. **TR22-062**

Dear Ms. Murray:

I am writing in regard to the Notice of Application for the removal of the Bunya Bunya tree located at 1080 2nd Street in Santa Rosa. My office is located approximately 200 feet from the subject tree. The Bunya Bunya tree is of cultural and historical significance to the City of Santa Rosa and I and my entire office staff strenuously object to its removal.

Very truly yours,

William W. Hatcher, Jr.

WWH:cs

From: Nicole Bullington
To: Murray, Susie
Subject: [EXTERNAL] BUNYA BUNYA -TREE REMOVAL
Date: Thursday, September 22, 2022 12:02:25 PM

Salutations,
My name is Nicole, and on behalf of the microcosm that exists with that 30 million year old species of tree, I say leave it be!
I know it has gargantuan pine cones that fall in late summer and that endangers unintelligent and unaware humans. Those nuts are so nutritional though!
I know it's native to Australia, but it's not taking over native species habitat or sustenance.
I speak for the trees for the trees have no tongues.
Thank you for your consideration.

From: Mas Giansante
To: Murray, Susie
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Bunyan Tree removal
Date: Saturday, September 17, 2022 2:06:30 PM

I would like to state my opposition to the tree removal. This tree is truly a landmark and beautiful part of the Santa Rosa landscape. This is not the first time someone has attempted to remove this tree. Do not remove it. Learn to live with it
Thank you
Mas Giansante
123 Stanford St
Sent from my iPad

From: Evan Hughes
To: Murray, Susie
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Comment Regarding Proposal #TR22-062 "Bunya Bunya - Tree Removal"
Date: Tuesday, October 4, 2022 11:00:20 AM

To Susie Murray, Senior Planner, City of Santa Rosa

I am writing to respond to the proposed removal of the Bunya Bunya Tree located at 50 Montgomery Drive (TR22-062). I provided written comment in 2019 when Ms. King attempted to have the tree removed, and my previous comments still hold true. I live on Pierce St. roughly 100 ft from this tree. I've spoken with my neighbors, and we were all shocked to hear that the Bunya Bunya tree might be destroyed.

This tree is a very rare species, native to Australia and capable of growing in only a limited range of habitats. Given its size, it is almost certainly over 110 years old and was alive and growing decades before the nearby houses and offices were built in the early 20th century. Luther Burbank himself had a Bunya Bunya tree growing in his home garden for many years, and their rarity in the US suggests that he very likely had a hand in planting and/or protecting the tree currently facing removal.

Large mature trees like this are a precious resource, made more vital with the now-yearly threat of wildfire. They beautify our streets and neighborhoods and provide shade to passersby as well as a habitat for various wild animals. They are an essential part of what makes Santa Rosa such a special place to live, and once these giants are gone there is nothing that people can build to replace them, and no amount of money can bring them back.

Thank you for considering these comments. I know this is a small project but I sincerely hope the City considers other solutions to mitigate whatever issues the tree is presenting to the applicant. if there will be a public hearing, please let me know, I would love to attend.

Thank you again,

Evan Hughes
707-721-2558

From: Patrice Giansante
To: Murray, Susie
Subject: [EXTERNAL] File #TR22-062 Bunya-Bunya Tree Removal
Date: Wednesday, October 19, 2022 11:02:57 AM

Dear Ms. Murray,
Thank you for getting back to me with more information about the proposed removal of the Bunya-Bunya tree on Second Street across from the Silvercrest senior apartment complex.

This tree is over 100 years old, older than any of us. The tree seems healthy and, as described in the arborist report, has good vitality. I am hoping with proper maintenance and care, the issues of concern (branches and cone drop) can be mitigated. There is a very well maintained Bunya-Bunya tree on the downtown square that does not seem to be dangerous.

I walk and ride my bicycle by this tree several times a week, if possible, I would like to see it stay and be well cared for.

Thank you,
Patrice Giansante
123 Stanford Street
Santa Rosa, CA 95404